

**GENDER BIAS AND  
MUSIC EDUCATION**

by

Kelly Gathen

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of the University of Delaware in partial fulfillment  
of the requirements for the degree of Master in Music

Spring 2014

© 2014 Kelly Gathen  
All Rights Reserved

UMI Number: 1562378

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.



UMI 1562378

Published by ProQuest LLC (2014). Copyright in the Dissertation held by the Author.

Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

All rights reserved. This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code



ProQuest LLC.  
789 East Eisenhower Parkway  
P.O. Box 1346  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 - 1346

**GENDER BIAS AND  
MUSIC EDUCATION**

by

Kelly Gathen

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_  
Alden H. Snell II, Ph.D.  
Professor in charge of thesis on behalf of the Advisory Committee

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_  
Russell E Murray, Ph.D.  
Chair of the Music Department

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_  
George H Watson, Ph.D.  
Dean of the College of Arts and Sciences

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_  
James G. Richards, Ph.D.  
Vice Provost for Graduate and Professional Education

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The completion of this research project would not have been possible without the support and generous contributions from my research committee. I would like to deeply thank:

Dr. Alden Snell, chairperson of my thesis committee. Thank you for your valuable insight, knowledge, and expertise, especially in regards to jazz and improvisation. I would like to express my gratitude for all the support and guidance you've provided dating back to the first day of our Introduction to Research class. Finally, thank you for all the baseball references and for helping me finally hit that homerun.

Suzanne Burton, Ph. D., for her continuous advice, academic support, and extensive knowledge of the APA manual. She has helped me become a better writer and a thorough researcher.

Philip Gentry, Ph.D., for the time, effort and knowledge in gender studies, which provided valuable insight for my study.

I would also like to thank the University of Delaware Department of Music, and Chair Russell Murray, Ph.D.

Finally, thank you to Clara and Libbey. Without your stories, this study would not have been possible.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES .....	vii
ABSTRACT .....	viii

### Chapter

1	INTRODUCTION .....	1
	Statement of the Problem .....	4
	Purpose .....	5
	Research Questions .....	5
	Limitations.....	6
	Role of the Researcher.....	6
	Ethical Concerns.....	7
	Significance of the Study.....	7
2	REVIEW OF LITERATURE.....	8
	Gender and Sex.....	8
	Elementary Education .....	10
	Middle School .....	14
	High School and Collegiate Level.....	15
	Gender Bias and Non-Music Majors.....	17
	Feminism and the Gender Gap.....	18
	Summary.....	20
3	METHODOLOGY .....	22
	Rationale for Design.....	22
	Researcher .....	23
	Theoretical Lens .....	24
	Ethical Concerns.....	25
	Procedure.....	25
	Recruitment .....	25
	Description of Participants .....	26
	Interview Setting and Rationale .....	28

	Data Collection.....	30
	Data Analysis.....	31
	Analysis Timeline.....	31
	Coding .....	32
	Validity .....	33
	Auditing.....	33
	Member Checking .....	33
	Triangulation .....	34
	Limitations.....	35
	Transferability .....	35
4	FINDINGS AND INTERPRETATIONS.....	36
	Description of Participants .....	36
	Clara .....	36
	Libbey.....	37
	Choosing their First Instrument.....	37
	Timbre Preference .....	38
	Parental Involvement.....	39
	Band Director Influence .....	39
	Interpreting Instrument Selection .....	41
	Social Experiences and Relationships .....	43
	Jazz and Instrument Selection .....	44
	Interpretations of Jazz and Instrument Selection.....	47
	Gender Identification.....	50
	Feminism and Current Career .....	53
	Interpretation of Feminism and Current Career .....	54
	Tough Love vs. Teddy Bear .....	59
	Lack of Role Models .....	65
	Interpretations of Lack of Role Models.....	66
	Summary.....	67
5	SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	69
	Summary.....	69
	Participant Recruitment and Description.....	70

Description of Participants .....	70
Data Collection and Analysis .....	71
Data Collection .....	71
Data Analysis .....	72
Data Results .....	73
Instrument Selection .....	73
Social Experiences and Relationships .....	74
Conclusions .....	76
Recommendations .....	80
REFERENCES .....	82
Appendix	
A. INTERVIEW QUESTIONS .....	86
First Interview: Instrument selection and public school music education experiences .....	86
Second Interview: College Experience and Teacher Training .....	87
Third Interview: Current Professional Life .....	87
B. FIRST INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS .....	89
Clara Interview 1 .....	89
Libbey Interview 1 .....	113
C. SECOND INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS .....	140
Clara Interview 2 .....	140
Libbey Interview 2 .....	163
D. THIRD INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS .....	193
Clara Interview 3 .....	193
Libbey Interview 3 .....	211
E. COURSE IN THE PROTECTION HUMAN SUBJECTS CURRICULUM COMPLETION REPORT .....	235
F. CODING TABLE .....	237

## LIST OF TABLES

1.1	Tough Love vs. Teddy Bear.....	60
-----	--------------------------------	----



## **ABSTRACT**

Choosing an instrument is one of the most important decisions a young musician makes. This choice influences musical opportunities and experiences throughout one's musical career. While researchers suggest that instrument choice should be based on timbre and personal preference, gender stereotypes and biases play a more prominent role. These stereotypes and biases intensify with age, leading to a disproportionately small percentage of female high school music educators. Over time, females experience more exclusion than inclusion in instrumental music education culminating in less than 20% of female music educators pursuing careers as high school instrumental educators.

With the intent of improving instrumental music instruction, the purpose of this study was to explore influences on instrument selection and gain personal insight into musical experiences of female instrumental music educators. Research questions guiding this study were:

1. What reasons do female music educators give for their choice of primary instrument?
2. How do female musicians describe their relationships and social experiences in relation to their instrument selection?

In Fall 2013, I interviewed two current female high school band directors each three times over a three-month period. Each interview lasted approximately one hour. Participants were asked questions regarding their (a) K-12 music education memories; (b) college experiences and teacher training; and (c) current teaching careers.

The participants' stories, while not generalizable to other populations, are consistent with extant literature pointing to three reasons female high school instrumental music teachers are underrepresented (a) gender biases during the instrument selection process, (b) the exclusionary nature of jazz bands in music education, and (c) the lack of female role models at the high school and collegiate level.

Recommendations for future research include (a) replication in different contexts such as age, teaching experience, or primary instrument; (b) exploring the relationship between jazz participation in grade school and jazz pedagogy in teacher training, and (c) continued examination of gender biases at the elementary, middle, and high school level.

## **Chapter 1**

### **INTRODUCTION**

Music and gender cannot be separated. Green (1994) stated “We learn our gendered relationships with music, not only from wider historical, political and educational contexts, but also through musical experience itself” (p. 99). While gender and music are linked, gender should not be a determining factor when choosing a musical instrument. Selection of an instrument involves many factors, including timbre preference, physical size, and musical aptitude. Additionally, societal influences play a predominant part in musical instrument selection (Gordon, 1994; Payne, 2009); Parents, peers, and music teachers may heavily influence a student’s choice. Because of this, gender stereotypes play a part in music instrument selection (Eros, 2008).

The instrument a young musician chooses to pursue determines which experiences he or she will have as they progress in their musical studies. Traditional ensemble participation is limited to certain instruments. For example, a student playing flute or violin will have a hard time enrolling in their school’s jazz band while a saxophonist may have trouble participating in the symphony orchestra. Gender stereotypes and gender bias play a large role in musical instrument selection and disproportionately puts female musicians at a disadvantage, especially if they wish to

participate in jazz band which in turn could put females at a disadvantage when considering career options.

It is important to clarify the difference between gender stereotypes and gender bias. In this study, gender stereotypes will be defined as the trends and patterns established by researchers who have measured gender and musical instrument selection. For example, it is a stereotype that most middle school flute players are female because research has shown that 90% of middle school flute players are female (Harrison, 2003). Gender stereotypes are further defined through the literature to include instruments and career choices categorized as “male” or “female.” For instance, in a study by Griswold and Chrobak, (1981) flute, clarinet, and choral teacher were classified as “feminine” while guitar, trumpet, and instrumental teacher were classified as “masculine.” Because of this, crossing the gender line is defined as a process in which a female musician plays a “masculine” instrument or pursues a career that is categorized as a “masculine” occupation.

In this study, I used Sinsel, Dixon, and Blades-Zellar’s (1997) definition to clarify between “sex” and “gender.” “Sex” is a biological difference between males and females and “gender” is a personal classification with a psychological sex type. Music education researchers have examined relationships between gender bias and musical instrument selection, especially at the elementary level (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison, 2003; Harrison & O’Neill, 2000; Johnson & Stewart, 2004; Sinisel, Dixon, & Blades-Zellar, 1997; Tarnowski, 1993). In 1994, Zervoudakes and Tanur replicated the study by Abeles and Porter (1973) with intent of enhancing and

reaffirming findings from 1973. They found that gender bias is evident starting in elementary bands and intensifies looking at high school and college bands.

Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) concluded that female participation in high school and college bands is increasing, however, this change is due to an increase in females playing female instruments. In their research, Zervoudakes and Tanur reported that the percentage of females playing male instruments dropped over time despite the increase in females participating in the bands (Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994).

Numerous quantitative studies have been conducted at the elementary level. Researchers have identified the following gender preferences: (a) females prefer instruments such as the flute, clarinet, oboe, and violin; (b) males prefer the guitar, trumpet, tuba, and percussion; and (c) the cello, piano, saxophone, and horn are neutral (Green, 1994; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000; Tarnowski, 1993).

Most research in gender bias and musical instrument selection has been conducted at the elementary level in regard to the musical instrument selection process or at the high school and collegiate level in regard to demographics (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994). Few researchers measure these trends at the middle school and professional level (Burgh, 2004; Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993; Gould 2005; McKeage, 2004; Wei-Chung, 2009). One exception is Fortney, Boyle, and DeCarbo's (1993) study, wherein they surveyed societal influences on middle school students and their musical instrument preference.

Gender stereotypes change and in many ways intensify as student-musicians age (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993). For example, saxophone is gender neutral at

the elementary level but is perceived as masculine by the end of middle school (Harrison, 2003). Fortney, Boyle, and DeCarbo (1993) showed an intensification of gender stereotypes in middle school where 90% of flute players were female and 90% of percussionists and trumpet players were male. Conversely, gender-neutral instruments such as the bassoon, horn, and cello are often only briefly mentioned in many studies, typically because they do not amount to any type of measureable data on gender biases (Eros, 2008).

### **Statement of the Problem**

Numerous quantitative studies on gender and musical instrument preference contain valuable data on gender bias and musical instrument selection. Researchers have conducted quantitative studies, which focus on elementary recruitment efforts (Abele & Porter 1978, Delzel, 1989, Harrison & O'Neill 2000, Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994) or conducted surveys that study gender and instrument demographics at the high school and collegiate level. Fewer studies measure instrument preference at the middle school level (Fortney Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993; McKeage, 2004). While these studies are important for tracking trends and stereotypes in instrument selection, they do not provide an in-depth perspective on why students choose the instruments they do. Further, while Fortney, Boyle, and DeCarbo (1993) asked students to list reasons in order of importance for choosing their instruments, there is little data on how student musicians feel about their instrument choice.

Philosophers Gould (1994) and Green (1993), female musicians who work in environments that are predominantly male, provide personal insights on the struggles female musicians face as they pursue a career that is typically male dominated. Typically, males who professionally play a female instrument are not usually included in such studies. To my knowledge, no qualitative study exists that describes crossing the gender bias line from an adult, female musician's perspective.

### **Purpose**

With the intent to improve instrumental music instruction, the purpose of this proposed study was to explore influences on instrument selection as well as gain personal insight into musical experiences of female music educators who cross the gender line with their instrument selection and/or their career choice.

### **Research Questions**

The following research questions frame this study:

1. What reasons do female musicians give for their choice of primary instrument?
2. How do musicians who cross the gender line describe their relationships and social experiences in relation to their instrument selection?

## **Limitations**

Analysis and findings in this study focused primarily on gender bias instrumental music and is limited to two individuals who are both female high school instrumental educators and is limited to two participants. Because this study is through a feminism lens and highlights a gender inequality expressed through a lack of female high school band directors, no males were selected for this study. While gender played a paramount role in the content of this study, sexual orientation did not. Their identities have been protected throughout this study and pseudonyms have been used when addressing them directly in the study. The data and findings in this study are limited to these participants' views, opinions, memories, and stories only. The data cannot be generalized to other populations.

## **Role of the Researcher**

In this study I served as the interviewer and collector of data. I developed research questions, chose participants, conducted interviews, recorded data, and analyzed results.

I conducted this study as a graduate music education student who plays a gender-neutral instrument. My goal is to be a high school band director. As I reviewed literature on gender bias and musical instrument selection, I realized that females are underrepresented in high school instrumental music education. Inspired by my literature review, I sought to shed light on why there are so few female high school band directors.



## **Ethical Concerns**

As a female music educator, I was cognizant of several potential biases as I conducted this research. The first participant, Clara, was my high school band director. Because I knew her personally, she may have felt some pressure to answer questions in a certain way. I play a gender-neutral instrument and may hold some bias for or against certain instruments. Finally, the research questions examine musicians who cross the gender bias line only but a musician's sexuality may become apparent through the interview process.

## **Significance of the Study**

The findings in this study should add valuable insight to existing literature in the field of gender and instrumental music education. Specifically, this study fills gaps in existing quantitative studies and provides insights from female instrumental music educators who have crossed the gender line either in their choice of primary instrument or career path.

## **Chapter 2**

### **REVIEW OF LITERATURE**

In this chapter, I review relevant literature in the following areas: (a) gender and sex; (b) gender biases in grades 4-12 and collegiate levels, including non-music majors in college; and (c) feminism and equality. I conclude with a synthesis in support of this study's methodology.

#### **Gender and Sex**

A proper classification is needed between gender and sex, especially when studying gender-neutral instruments such as the saxophone, cello, horn, and bassoon. Although often used interchangeably, the terms “gender” and “sex” have two different meanings. Defining “sex” as a biological difference and “gender” as a personal classification (Sinsel, Dixon, & Blades-Zellar's, 1997) is consistent with Bem's (1994) study of 108 children (64 girls and 44 boys). These children were classified as masculine, feminine, androgynous, (high scores for both masculine and feminine) or undifferentiated (low masculine and low feminine). Results showed that most children (41.9%) ranked themselves as androgynous, and these androgynous students were much more likely to (a) pick gender-neutral instruments, (b) pick a wider range of instruments, and (c) be students who cross the gender line when choosing an instrument (Sinsel, Dixon, & Blades-Zellar, 1997).

Green (1994) goes into great detail explaining how gender and musical experience cannot be separated. Musical comprehension exists in two states, the first existing of the musical materials themselves as a raw sample of syntactical organization that listeners respond to differently based on past experiences. The second factor is described as “delineated meaning” where such components as gender, culture, social context, and age are factored into the listener’s interpretation of the music. These two factors should exist independently of each other. The delineated meaning always affects the listener, meaning that the gender of the performer, composer, or conductor will always influence the listener despite the raw music that is produced.

Green (1997) also lists obstacles females often have to overcome in music such as respect from their male counterparts and the constant pressure of body image. Therefore, Green suggests that women often have to work much harder than men to achieve the same (or close to it) acclaim as men. Gould (2005) hypothesizes that historical precedent, traditional socialization, discrimination, segregation, and lack of role models are all obstacles that female musicians encounter. Consistent with Green and Gould, Payne (1996) states: “it appears that women musicians be ‘twice as good’ as male colleagues to look ‘as good’” (p. 100). Conversely, to my knowledge, there is no literature explaining the hardships that males who play feminine instruments encounter at the professional level. As seen from the above arguments, gender is an important factor in music and impacts music instrument selection.

## **Elementary Education**

Gender stereotyping in elementary schools has been documented over time, producing consistent results over a span of forty years. Abeles and Porter (1978) conducted an influential four-part study examining gender bias at the elementary and collegiate level as well as differences between preschool-aged children and children ages 9 to 11. In the first part of the study, the researchers surveyed students in grades K-5. When conducting the survey, the researchers provided visual and aural examples of the instruments and when examining the results they compared not only the correlation between preference and example but also the correlation between the gender of the administrator of the survey and preference of musical instrument. Their results followed suspected gender lines where females were most likely to choose flute, clarinet, and violin and males preferred trumpet, trombone, and percussion, with saxophone and cello listed as neutral. They found no significant correlation between the gender of the researcher and the preference of the student. Furthermore, the researchers found that there was a greater gender divide between students in grades 3-5 than there was in grades K-2. The younger children were less likely to choose instruments that followed gender stereotypes than the older children (Abeles & Porter, 1978).

Several factors have been identified as contributors to musical instrument selection, including band director opinions and influences, influence of parents, timbre preference, and the importance of modeling (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000). Johnson and Stewart (2004) surveyed 84 band directors regarding

which instruments they would choose for students based on looking at their face or their mouth area only. Results revealed that when the band director was shown a face picture, they chose an instrument that went with gender stereotypes but when showed just the mouth area, there was a greater variability, with many students being chosen to play the trombone. The researchers also surveyed contributing factors that went into each child's selection of an instrument. The most important factor was child preference at 72.9% followed by physical characteristics at 55.9%. Conversely, a balanced instrumentation was listed at 33.9% and parental involvement was listed last at 16.9% (Johnson & Stewart, 2004).

In a follow-up study, Johnson and Stewart (2005) asked band directors to look at children's mouth area only in determining which instrument they should play. When replicated, the researchers added a new variable by including race. When it was unclear whether the student musician was male or female, gender played a smaller role in which instrument the band director recommended for the student. This suggests that intervention and awareness of gender bias at the elementary level is spreading among educators.

Harrison and O'Neill (2000) conducted a study in which 357 third grade students were asked to rank their preferences of musical instruments and to test the importance of modeling. Harrison and O'Neill distributed the students into three clusters: Some clusters received an intervention concert, where professional musicians came to the school to demonstrate various instruments to the students, while others did not. Cluster 1 received an intervention concert consisting of gender-consistent

musicians; Cluster 2 received an intervention concert consisting of gender-inconsistent musicians; and Cluster 3 received a concert, presumably of gender-consistent performers, after their survey was concluded. Each cluster consisted of 119 students. All groups were given a pre- and post-test survey concerning musical instrument preference. The concerts were shown to be effective, especially in girls as after seeing a female drummer, interest in the drums went up and their preference for violin went down after seeing a male violinist. Comparably, there was no significant difference in male instrument preferences with the exception of an increased interest in the drums after seeing a male or a female performer (Harrison & O'Neill, 2000). The importance of modeling can be seen in the study above and the influence of modeling continues to be an important factor in a music student's life. Delzell (1989) suggested that modeling and imitation exercises have a significant effect on instrumental music performance achievement. Further, the continuance of effective modeling and imitation exercises has a significant effect on middle school and high school musicians as well.

To summarize, band directors are growing more aware of gender stereotyping in musical instrument selection at the elementary level. However, this does not necessarily translate into lower gender bias. For instance, in a study conducted utilizing 30 years' worth of concert programs, Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) sought to measure trends in musical instrument preference among elementary, high school, and college musicians by examining data collected from concert programs across the United States from the 1960's, 1970's, and 1980's. Results indicated that over time,

more females at the grade school level were playing masculine or gender-neutral instruments such as the baritone, bassoon, and horn. There also was an increase of females playing feminine instruments suggesting that more girls are participating in band. Female students playing masculine instruments in high school and college, however, dropped over time. Female numbers at the high school and college level have risen dramatically meaning that there are more females playing horn, bassoon, and trumpet than ever before but there are also more females playing flute, oboe, and the clarinet. Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) compare the trend of more female musicians to more females in the medical field. There are more women than ever before but they are still in traditionally female roles such as nursing and pediatrics.

Another interesting trend is the popularity of instruments such as the saxophone and percussion because of popular, or pop, music. For example, Delzell and Leppla (1992) found that out of 526 fourth grade students, 37% of all students wanted to play percussion followed by 26.5% wanting to play the saxophone. Most males in the study picked the drums or saxophone as their first choice while females picked the flute, drums, saxophone, and clarinet respectively. These findings contradict those before it and provide another variable when analyzing instrument selection.

It appears progress towards eliminating gender biases is being made at the elementary level but there is some disconnect between grade school and high school. Effective modeling and band directors who have been made aware of gender biases and stereotypes can help children pick an instrument that they will succeed in without

societal influences yet once the musician leaves grade school, those influences are inevitable.

### **Middle School**

There is little research on musical instrument preferences of middle school students, which is unfortunate, because with the exception of infancy, early adolescence is the time of most extreme growth in the brain and the body. It is also believed to be when students are most influenced by their surroundings and shaped into the adults they will eventually become (Wigfield, Lutz & Wagner, 2010). Further, while not documented in research, many bands start their programs in sixth grade rather than in fifth or fourth. Finally, middle school is where students begin to participate in extracurricular music groups such as jazz band or marching band (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993).

Middle school students are highly impressionable, and music students are no exception. Forney, Boyle, and DeCarbo (1993) measured 990 sixth, seventh, eighth, and ninth grade students' instrument preference. Of the results, most striking was the increased popularity of the saxophone and its move from a "gender neutral" instrument to a "masculine" instrument with 72% of saxophonists being male. Some gender stereotypes were intensified such as 90% of flautists being female and 90% of trumpet and percussionists being male.

Students surveyed were asked their favorite instrument and why. Most students picked their own instrument and stated that it was because they liked the sound of it.



When asked to choose an instrument besides the one they played, most students (male and female) picked saxophone even though by this time 72% of saxophonists were male. Outside of liking the sound of the instrument, other important influences in choosing an instrument included their teacher, parents, and friends. Interestingly, the influence of the elementary music teacher was ranked towards the bottom as an influence on their instrument selection (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993). Middle school is where the influences of societal factors become most important to the students. Middle school students tended to pick “cool” or “popular” instruments such as the saxophone, percussion, flute, and the clarinet. It should be noted that these instruments continue to be popular instruments throughout a musician’s life.

### **High School and Collegiate Level**

The trends that begin in the elementary grades are carried out and intensified through middle school so that upon reaching high school, it is extremely likely that what the student played in middle school will be their primary instrument through high school. It is rare for a beginner to start an instrument at this age so the instrument that a student has chosen through elementary school and middle school is his or hers to keep or to do away with. The saxophone moving from gender neutral to a masculine instrument is an interesting point of discussion and can perhaps bring some light to the deepening gender lines between musical instruments with its strong links to jazz.

Historically, jazz favors male participants as its roots can be found in urban nightclubs in which musicians were typically aggressive, self-confident, and played

music into the night. Musicians were frequently absent from home and took part in dangerous activities such as heavy drinking, drugs, and sometimes became caught up in gang related activities (Dahl, 1984). It can be assumed that this behavior was not socially acceptable for women throughout the early 1900's. While this nightclub lifestyle is no longer as prominent, women still have a hard time being accepted into the jazz scene, in part because of historical precedence (Gourse, 1995).

McKeage (2004) researched the relationship between gender and jazz ensembles at the high school and collegiate level. Jazz is often an integral, yet highly competitive part of high school and college music programs (McKeage, 2004). Further, for musicians who eventually want to teach at the middle school or high school level, experience in jazz is very important.

Results found that while in high school, 52% of females and 80% of males stated that they participated in jazz, yet at the college level the numbers drop to 14% of females and 50% of males who participate in jazz ensembles. One of the main reasons that females quit playing in college was because they did not play a jazz instrument. It was stated by many that their band directors often made accommodations for them such as transposing a trombone part for mellophone, or saxophone parts for clarinets (McKeage, 2004).

Wiggins (1997) questioned 132 high school band directors on their preparation for teaching jazz; 50% reported they were unprepared for teaching jazz in a public school. It can be speculated that this may have to do with the lack of room within a heavy course load that music majors undertake. Further, due to the small

instrumentation of jazz bands, many students, regardless of gender, will not get to participate unless they take on a secondary instrument. McKeage (2004) supports this and states that while the lack of participation in jazz ensembles at the college level may harm men and their teaching careers, it disproportionately puts women at a disadvantage when seeking an instrumental teaching position (McKeage, 2004).

### **Gender Bias and Non-Music Majors**

Typically, research on gender stereotypes or biases either focuses on elementary recruitment or instrument demographics at the high school and collegiate level (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000; Conway, 2000; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994). It can be assumed that not all high school musicians will go on to pursue music in college but they may still enjoy playing. Griswold and Chroback (1981) surveyed college musicians, both majors and non-majors, and compared them by gender and major. They were asked to rank a set of 17 musical instruments as well as “instrumental” or “choral” teachers on a scale anchored on the words masculine and feminine. Results were consistent with other studies; flute, piccolo, choral conductor, and clarinet were feminine; and guitar, instrumental conductor, saxophone, trumpet, string bass, and tuba were masculine. It is interesting that these beliefs do not only exist among music majors, but the general public as well. The belief that instrumental conductors are male is a common trend. Typically only 20%-24% of instrumental band directors at the middle school to high school levels are female (Grisold & Chroback, 1981; Gould 1994; McKeage, 2000; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994).

## **Feminism and the Gender Gap**

As illustrated in the feminist movement that erupted in the 1960's, gender inequality in the workplace is a fight that women have been battling for decades. It is a fight for equality, which has been longstanding. As described by Gould:

Feminism is the struggle to end sexist oppression. Its aim is not to benefit solely any specific group of women, any particular race or class of women; it does not privilege women over men. It has the power to transform in a meaningful way all our lives (Gould, 2005 p. 149).

In many areas women have made immense progress, yet in music academia, people seem to be behind the times. For instance, Payne (1996) reported that while women make up nearly 50% of all masters' degrees in music earned, they still tend to make up a small number of collegiate faculty. In fact, women only account for 24% of the faculty and a mere 17% of the fulltime professors. Further, of seventeen percent, 95% of them teach in areas that are historically "feminine" including keyboard, voice, theory, and music education.

Howe (2014) provides several insights regarding the lack of female high school band directors and college professors. Howe believes that many times females do not choose teaching high school band as a career because they do not play "appropriate" instruments to teach high school band, namely brass instruments. Howe also suspects that current male band directors are unwilling to mentor female students, instead choosing to mentor those who are most like them. Some male teachers and professors even dissuade females from pursuing high school instrumental positions.

Ultimately, Howe believes each of these factors contribute to a lack of female role models currently in the field. Until there are more female role models, especially at the high school and collegiate level, there will continue to be a lack of females wishing to pursue high school instrumental instruction (Howe, 2014).

Gould (2005) uses this statement to justify her argument that women tend to be educators, especially of young children, while administrators and college professors tend to be men. Moreover, Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) found that even though there are more females in high school and college wind bands, the number of female principal players has not increased.

Lamb (1994), a liberal feminist, advocates for the music education profession to include (a) equality in instrument selection; (b) ability for males and females to equally partake in jazz studies; and (c) promotion of more female music educators at all levels of music education, including at the high school and collegiate level. Payne (1996), Gould (1994), and Green (1994) all warn of the consequences of such a gender gap. They also provide some insight into the present-day and future status of women in music education. Payne hopes that as many men reach retirement age, women will take their places in higher numbers, while Green argues that small interventions such as a Philadelphia Orchestra's female tuba player are rare and short-lived. Gould (2005) makes a compelling statement in regards to music education resistance: As a consequence, students and teachers will continue to be limited in their choice of occupations and instruments; they will continue to sing and play music and use teaching materials that erase their subjectivity. Perhaps most significantly, the

profession will continue to suffer from the loss of their contributions (Gould, 2005, p. 158).

## **Summary**

As demonstrated in this literature review, gender stereotyping and musical instrument selection is a topic of ongoing concern to the profession. The next step, already underway, as seen in a repeat study by Harrison in 2003, is to explore the sub-categories within this subject. For instance, researchers could conduct more studies on middle school students. It was interesting to note how much social influence had an effect on student choosing an instrument and how little influence their elementary band director had. It seems to suggest that all the research and awareness for elementary band directors and their attempts to eradicate gender bias is for naught.

McKeage (2004) makes a strong argument that there is a connection between the participation in jazz bands and the low number of female instrumental music teachers. Jazz tends to be one of the most segregated genres of music in today's time. It would be interesting to see if not participating in jazz does significantly reduce the chance of getting an instrumental teaching job.

Gould suggests that change in music education moves slowly, but an argument could be made that progress is progress no matter the speed. It is worth discussing the optimistic view that music education just needs more time. Perhaps in another thirty years, the gender lines will be less cut and dry and more of a blur with a greater percentage of students crossing the lines. What is important to note is that the

happiness and success of the student and the future musicians is the first priority. It can be assumed that no student can be happy and successful if they are being oppressed and presently, women are being oppressed, starting as early as elementary school.

All of the studies reviewed for this topic are quantitative studies, mostly due to the content of the topic. To the knowledge of the researcher, no qualitative studies exist in which musicians are looked at individually with regards to their instrument selection. Furthermore, there are few studies that describe how musicians feel about their instrument choice and the opportunities and experiences it has provided or not provided for them. In regards to female music educators, there have not been any studies that interview current female high school band directors.

There is a current research gap measuring the selection of musical instrument and its ramifications from elementary school through adulthood and how instrument selection could affect one's college experience and career opportunities. At this moment and with current music education practices, female musicians are at a disadvantage. While it is evident that desegregation is happening at the elementary level, no evidence points to this outcome at the middle school level or higher. With the intent to improve current music education practice, I have examined these literature gaps, focusing primarily on female music educators and their experiences in relation to their primary instrument.

### **Chapter 3**

## **METHODOLOGY**

### **Rationale for Design**

The purpose of this study was to add to existing literature on gender bias and musical instrument selection. Two research questions guided this inquiry:

1. What reasons do female musicians give for their choice of primary instrument?
2. How do female musicians describe their relationships and social experiences in relation to their instrument selection?

There are numerous quantitative studies on gender bias and musical instrument choice. Researchers have studied which gender tends to pick a certain instrument as well as bias that occurs at the elementary level (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Delzel, 1989; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994). Other researchers have surveyed middle school students on instrument selection as well as participating in jazz band (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993; McKeage, 2004). Finally, studies documenting female band directors at the high school and collegiate level offer startling statistics in reference to gender inequality (Griswold & Chroback, 1981; Payne, 1996). Female musicians are disproportionately put at a disadvantage because



of gender bias. This injustice can be traced in the literature to a student's instrument selection.

However, there is little qualitative research in this area. Because my topic is under-researched, I chose a case study design, defined by Stake (1995) as an investigation of the "particularity and complexity of a single case, coming to understand its activity within important circumstances (Stake, 1995, p. xi). By interviewing two female high school band directors, this study allows their voices tell a rich story that enhances existing quantitative findings. Qualitative documentation of female high school band directors' experiences in relation to: (a) selecting instruments, (b) subsequent experiences connected to their instrument choice, and (c) career opportunities are important contributions to this body of literature. Through use of a feminism lens, this study hopes to contribute to the vein of inquiry and explore why females are disproportionately put at a disadvantage because of gender bias and subsequent instrument selection.

### **Researcher**

I am a current instrumental music education masters student who plays the bassoon, a gender-neutral instrument (Abeles and Porter, 1978), but played the saxophone all throughout grade school. Because I chose saxophone, I had opportunities in my music education that would not have been available had I chosen flute, clarinet, or bassoon.

My experiences and biases as a band director have allowed me to witness firsthand how some gender biases occur at the elementary level and then manifest as

student musicians age. Finally, while in high school, I had the pleasure of having a female band director. I was aware at the time that this was a rare occurrence but her presence in my life as a role model helped shape me into the researcher, musician, and educator that I am today. It should be noted that my experiences as a saxophonist growing up are consistent with the literature on jazz participation as are my recollections of the importance of having a female role model while I was in high school.

### **Theoretical Lens**

I approached this study through a feminism lens with an emphasis on gender inequality. Macionis and Gerber (2002) state feminism research should focus on two main topics: (a) the research should focus on women and society, and (b) the research is grounded in the assumption that women are treated subordinately. In the literature, researchers suggests that women are not given the same musical opportunities as men throughout music education because of their instrument selection. According to Payne (1994), women only represent 20% of instrumental music instructors at the secondary level. By interviewing female high school band directors, gender inequality can be highlighted in a way that has yet to be seen in the current literature.

## **Ethical Concerns**

Gender bias and gender stereotypes were addressed, as well as gender inequality. Participant's identity has been kept private and pseudonyms have been used whenever directly referring to the participant in the study.

## **Procedure**

While enrolled in a graduate level research class, I reviewed literature on gender bias and musical instrument selection. Before conducting the research, I completed all tasks and requirements according to the University of Delaware's Institutional Research Board (IRB). I completed IRB training for research with human subjects and proceeded to design a study that allowed me to explore reasons behind gender bias during the musical instrument selection and the inordinately small percentage of high school female band directors.

In this study I interviewed two female high school band directors about their musical instrument selection process and their experiences and relationships in relation to their instrument choice. I submitted an abstract, interview questions, and consent form for approval. IRB approval is presented in Appendix E.

## **Recruitment**

The participants were recruited with a convenience sampling procedure. Because there are so few female high school band directors, I sought participants by asking professors and colleges if they knew any female high school band directors.

Both participants were found using this method. Each participant is a female high school band director who is currently employed in a high school. The participants attended and graduated from an accredited college or university with a degree in music education, earning a minimum of a bachelor's degree in their subject.

Originally I sought to find a participant who played a literature-defined, stereotypically male instrument such as saxophone, trumpet, trombone, or percussion and one who played a stereotypically female instrument such as the flute or clarinet. This sampling goal is consistent with Howe's (2014) claim that many female band directors play stereotypically male instruments. I felt that this variety in participant instrument choice would add depth and diversity to the findings. Ultimately, one participant played saxophone, a stereotypically male instrument, while the other participant played French horn, a gender-neutral instrument.

Participants' names have been changed to protect their identity. The first participant will be referred to as Clara and the second participant will be referred to as Libbey.

### **Description of Participants**

Clara is a female high school band director and is currently in her 11<sup>th</sup> year of teaching. She is between the ages of 35-40, is Caucasian, and lives and works in a small town in the mid-Atlantic region the United States. Clara works at a public high school and teaches band, private lessons, and music theory. She also coaches the marching band in the fall, runs an afterschool jazz band in the winter, and conducts the

pit orchestra for the school musical in the spring. Clara's primary instrument is saxophone, which she has been playing since 5<sup>th</sup> grade. She grew up in the same mid-Atlantic town in which she currently teaches and came from a supportive, affluent family. Clara's family was not overly musical as she describes her father as "tone deaf" but their supportive nature was noted as they financially supported the purchase of musical instruments and weekly private lessons. Clara went to a private college in the Northeast and graduated with a bachelor's degree in music education and is currently certified to teach.

Libbey is a female high school band director and is currently in her 3<sup>rd</sup> year of teaching. She is between the age of 25-30, is Caucasian, and lives and works in the Southwest region of the United States. Libbey works at a private Christian school and teaches band to grades 5-12, private lessons, and teaches 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grade American History. Libbey's primary instrument is the horn, which she has been playing since the 6<sup>th</sup> grade. Libbey grew up in the Southeast but moved to the mid-Atlantic in 7<sup>th</sup> grade where she completed her education. Libbey came from a supportive, affluent, and musical family. She stated that her family was heavily involved with the church where they sang very often. Libbey also had piano lessons from ages 6 through 10 and claimed that she did a lot of her playing by ear. Libbey went to a state college in the Southeast and graduated with a bachelor's degree in music education and is currently certified to teach.

## **Interview Setting and Rationale**

Following Rubin & Rubin's (2011) model for conducting interviews, I interviewed Clara and Libbey three times over the course of a three-month period beginning in Fall 2013. Each interview lasted approximately one hour; each participant was interviewed once a month. I conducted the interviews via FaceTime (ver. 7.0.6) and recorded the conversation using GarageBand (ver. 6.0.5).

The interview protocol was grouped into themes based on my literature review. Interview questions were formulated to most accurately answer the research questions. Once completed, a graduate level research class from an accredited university in the Mid-Atlantic United States vetted the interview questions. Based on their feedback, I adjusted word choice and sentence structure of several interview questions.

In the first interview, the questions I asked were designed to answer my first research question: What reasons do female music educators give for their choice of primary instrument? Specifically, I asked participants questions that concentrated on primary instrument selection as well as their grade school music education experiences. The first interview was centered on the participant's personal K-12 music education, their instrumental selection process, and their relationships, memories, and experiences from their middle school and high school years. Questions in the first interview deal with the musical instrument selection process in detail and were formulated based on the literature wherein researchers focused on recruitment efforts at the elementary and middle school level (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000; Johnson & Stewart, 2004; Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993).

Questions in the first interview also addressed the second research question: How do musicians who cross the gender line describe their relationships and social experiences in relation to their instrument selection? Participants were asked to recall their band directors and to describe their experiences in relation to their instrument while they were in grade school. Interview questions were formulated based on literature wherein researchers surveyed high school students and their ensemble participation (Grisold & Chroback, 1981; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994).

In the second interview, questions focused on the participant's music education training at the collegiate level. The second interview concentrated on their collegiate experiences and their teacher training and focused primarily on the second research question. Included in this interview were questions about their private instructor, methods courses they may or may not have taken, and their student teaching experience. Interview questions were formulated based on literature where the researchers surveyed college students on ensemble participation, teaching training, jazz participation, and teacher preparation (Grisold & Chroback, 1981; McKeage, 2000; Wiggins, 1997).

Finally, the third interview focused on their current careers as music educators. The third interview focused on their current career, how they obtained their teaching position, and how they feel about being the minority as a female high school band director. Interview questions were formulated based on literature that focused on feminism in music performance and music education (Payne, 1996; Gould, 2005;

McKeage, 2004; Howe, 2014). Further explanation of the interview process is explained in the data analysis section.

### **Data Collection**

Data were collected in Fall of 2013. I collected this data by recording interviews with GarageBand (ver. 6.0.5). Each interview was then transcribed into a Microsoft Word (ver. 14.0.47) document and coded for analysis. Prior to each subsequent interview, I provided each participant with a transcript of their previous interview, inviting them to elaborate on, strike, or amend any of my questions or their responses during the next interview. Neither participant asked me to revise any of the interview transcripts. At the beginning of Clara's second interview, I asked her to elaborate on a comment she had made during her first interview. Data collected was then transcribed and coded for analysis. Interview questions are presented in Appendix A. I actively took notes during the interviews and strove to allow subjects to do most of the talking.

Participants were invited to read the transcriptions and elaborate on, strike, or amend any information they provided during the interview. Participants were also invited to ask any questions in regards to the transcriptions. Full interview transcriptions can be found in Appendixes B-D. All data collected during this research study was stored on a password-secured hard drive in a locked office. The data will be saved for three years upon completion of the study at which point it will be erased.



## **Data Analysis**

Following Stake's (1995) model for analyzing a case study interview, each participant's background information was meticulously described as well as descriptions of their current careers so the reader is provided with a detailed description of the two individuals. The transcriptions of the interviews were analyzed to both answer the research questions and to explore emergent findings.

Following comparative case study procedure, the participants are similar and can be comparable. For instance, despite their difference in age, teaching experience, and primary instrument, they have similar experiences (Kaarbo & Beasley, 1999).

## **Analysis Timeline**

I followed Marshall and Rossman's (2011) guidelines for collection, organization, coding, and analysis of data. Before each interview, the participant was provided with the interview questions for preparation. During the interview, I asked the pre-planned questions and when necessary, stopped to ask the participant to elaborate on or further explain an answer. Some answers did lead to follow up questions that were not part of the original interview questions. I asked these follow up questions to enhance the information provided without deviating from the main topic.

Upon completion of the interview, I transcribed the interview by hand. A graduate English major from an accredited college in the Mid-Atlantic then audited the completed transcriptions. This student compared the audio recording to the written transcript and found them to be accurate. Upon completion of the audit, I read the

transcriptions and determined if I needed participants to clarify anything during the next interview. Transcriptions were then sent to the participants electronically before the subsequent interview for member checking.

## **Coding**

Each interview transcription was coded after it was audited and sent back to the participants using the coding table. A Microsoft Word (ver. 14.0.47) document was created for theoretical memos and included potentially emergent themes and as a means of organizing and recording thoughts on the data throughout the data collection and coding process.

I created a preliminary coding table while developing this study. This table used theory-generated codes derived from the literature. During analysis, I engaged in line-by-line coding, noting whether data: (a) answered my research questions or (b) pointed toward emergent findings. I sought to use the participant's voice in as much of my analysis as possible. My coding was primarily inductive, wherein I discovered patterns, themes, and categories from the data (Patton, 2002). Following line-by-line coding, I used axial coding to group data into conceptual categories. These groupings can be seen in the coding table found in Appendix F. Finally, I connected my analysis back to the literature review.

Once all six interviews had been individually transcribed, audited, member checked, and coded, I then re-coded the data from the transcriptions for cognitive ownership in preparation for documenting the findings. Finally, I sent participants

their three interview transcriptions for a final member check. Each participant confirmed accuracy of the transcriptions.

### Validity

Each participant was provided a full transcription of the previous interview before each subsequent interview for member checking. They were provided the opportunity to elaborate on, strike, or amend any of the information they provided while answering the interview questions. The interview questions were vetted by a graduate level introduction to research class from an accredited university in the Mid-Atlantic United States.

### **Auditing**

A graduate English major from an accredited college in the Mid-Atlantic audited completed transcriptions. This student compared the audio recording to the written transcript and found them to be accurate. Upon completion of the audit, I read the transcriptions and determined if I needed participants to clarify anything during the next interview.

### **Member Checking**

Before each interview, the participant was provided with the interview questions for preparation. During the interview, I asked the pre-planned questions and when necessary, stopped to ask the participant to elaborate on or further explain an answer. Some answers did lead to follow up questions that were not part of the

original interview questions. I asked these follow up questions to enhance the information provided without deviating from the main topic.

### **Triangulation**

To triangulate data, I (a) compared the interview data from each participant's three interviews against one another; (b) compared interview data to existing literature, analyzing the interview data against the literature; and (c) compared and contrasted the interview data between both participants.

Triangulation was first achieved by taking Clara's three interviews and Libbey's three interviews and analyzing the data for patterns and themes between the respective interviews. For example, I searched for themes that occurred through all three of Clara and Libbey's interviews.

Next, I analyzed all six interviews against the current literature. For instance, both Clara and Libbey's recollections of their instrument selection process is consistent and corroborates with the literature on the musical instrument selection process.

Finally, I analyzed for similarities and differences between the two participants. Following comparative case study procedure, the participants are similar and can be comparable. For instance, despite their difference in age, teaching experience, and primary instrument, they have similar experiences (Kaarbo & Beasley, 1999). I compared Clara and Libbey's transcriptions were compared using pattern

matching. These patterns were derived from the coding table which was derived from the literature. The coding table can be found in Appendix F.

The transcriptions of the interviews were also analyzed for emerging themes. Complete interview transcriptions can be found in Appendices B-D.

### **Limitations**

Analysis and findings in this study focused primarily on gender bias instrumental music and is limited to two individuals who are both female high school instrumental educators and is limited to two participants. Because this study is through a feminism lens and highlights a gender inequality expressed through a lack of female high school band directors, no males were selected for this study. While gender plays an important role in the content of this study, sexual orientation does not. Their identities have been protected throughout this study and pseudonyms have been used when addressing them directly in the study.

### **Transferability**

Findings from this study are limited to the information, experiences, and memories of these participants only and cannot be generalized. While the findings corroborate and are consistent with extant literature, additional research is required to explore this topic of inquiry.

## **Chapter 4**

### **FINDINGS AND INTERPRETATIONS**

In this chapter, I present findings to answer my research questions based on participant responses during our interviews. I then interpret the data relating to both research questions. Data from each individual interview were analyzed against existing literature, for themes within each participant's respective interviews, for similarities and differences between the two participants, and for emergent data. These themes included: (a) the instrument selection process, (b) jazz participation, (c) gender identification, (d) feminism and current career, and (e) teaching style. Findings and interpretations are presented in order in regard to the research questions.

#### **Description of Participants**

##### **Clara**

Clara is a female high school band director and is currently in her 11<sup>th</sup> year of teaching. She is between the ages of 35-40, is Caucasian, and lives and works in a small town in the mid-Atlantic region the United States. Clara works at a public high school and teaches band, private lessons, and music theory. She also coaches the marching band in the fall, runs an afterschool jazz band in the winter, and conducts the pit orchestra for the school musical in the spring. Clara's primary instrument is

saxophone, which she has been playing since 5<sup>th</sup> grade. Clara went to a private college in the Northeast and graduated with a bachelor's degree in music education and is currently certified to teach.

### **Libbey**

Libbey is a female high school band director and is currently in her 3<sup>rd</sup> year of teaching. She is between the ages of 25-30, is Caucasian, and lives and works in the Southwest region of the United States. Libbey works at a private Christian school and teaches band to grades 5-12, private lessons, and teaches 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grade American History. Libbey's primary instrument is the horn, which she has been playing since the 6<sup>th</sup> grade. Libbey went to a state college in the Southeast and graduated with a bachelor's degree in music education and is currently certified to teach.

### **Choosing their First Instrument**

In the first interview, I asked participants to describe how they chose their primary instrument. Participants shared reasons for (a) choosing their instrument, (b) which instrument they preferred, and (c) their feelings about their final decision.

When asked about which instrument appealed to them, both Clara and Libbey expressed interest in the saxophone. They both shared it was a "cool" instrument, appealing to them, and was one of the first instruments each participant tried. Libbey said, "I had my heart set on playing saxophone. I was going to play saxophone" (Interview 1, #8). Conversely, Clara was interested in playing the saxophone but it

was her third choice after trumpet and percussion. She also noted which instruments she did not want to play: “My whole rationalization as a 4<sup>th</sup> grader was that I wanted an instrument that was cool and to me the clarinet and flute were like wimpy, girly instruments and trombone was too big” (Interview 1, #8).

### **Timbre Preference**

Timbre preference also played a role in Clara’s instrument choice. She is quoted multiple times saying that she wanted to play a cool sounding instrument. She also at one point grouped “cool” with “masculine” and stated that both are appealing to her in regards to choosing an instrument. “Yeah to me they seemed cool. I was always kind of a tomboy so I think that I was drawn to the instruments that to me seemed more masculine than to the instruments that seemed feminine” (Interview 1, #12).

Timbre preference affected Libbey’s choice after she experienced success producing a tone on the horn and she liked the way that it sounded. She was apathetic about her choice at first and even a little disappointed that she was unable to play the saxophone or another woodwind but then claimed that in the end it was the right choice by saying the following: “I thought well that looks cool and I held up my hand to try it and she showed me how to make a noise and how to make a buzz and everything and I got a note out on the first try, a huge blast with what was actually a decent tone and she said, hey can you make that note go lower? and I did and I didn’t even know how I was doing it... But I was still so disappointed because I wanted to



play saxophone but horn ended being the right choice cause it paid for college”  
(Interview 1, #8).

### **Parental Involvement**

When asked about parental involvement, Libbey did not mention anything about her parents in regards to instrument choice while Clara’s parents had a stronger influence in her instrument choice. For instance, Clara wanted to play trumpet and percussion more than the saxophone but her parents were against her playing either of her top two choices, sharing, “The first instrument that I wanted to play was the trumpet and my parents said ‘we’re not having a trumpet player in the house. It’s too loud.’ I said ‘okay, how bout the drums?’ and they said, ‘no way are you playing the drums.’ So I said ‘fine fine fine, how about the saxophone?’ and they said, ‘okay the saxophone’” (Interview 1, #8). So while timbre preference was important in Clara’s decision to narrow down the instruments to three, her parents were also very influential in the decision process.

### **Band Director Influence**

Band directors’ influence played a larger role in Libbey’s instrument choice than it did Clara’s. For example, Libbey tried all the instruments as a 5<sup>th</sup> grader in a petting zoo setting. She tried the saxophone, was unsuccessful, and then proceeded to try the clarinet, flute, and oboe, all of which were unsuccessful. Finally, one of the band directors at the school approached her about the horn and had her try it. Once

Libbey could produce a tone successfully as well manipulate the tone, the band director asked her about her grades and made the proclamation that Libbey was a horn player. ‘You’re a horn player!’ and she said, ‘Are your grades good because you gotta be smart.’ And I said, ‘Yeah, my grades are good.’ And she said ‘great! You’re a horn player’” (Interview 1, #8).

During analysis of data to answer this research question, Clara provided knowledge of strategies some band director’s use when demonstrating instruments to future band students. These trade secrets are not commonly found in research literature, and band directors rarely acknowledge engaging in them, yet they can affect which instrument a student chooses to play. Clara remarked that some elementary band directors give students very hard reeds when they try the saxophone and sometime the clarinet as a means to manipulate their band population and create a more balanced ensemble. Here she states “And you know that thing that the schools...I’m sure you’ve either read about this or heard it but where the schools they let the kids try instruments and they make things like trombone, French horn, and oboe very easy to play and they put really hard reeds on saxophones so kids can barely play it so nobody picks it” (Interview 1, #26). She also said, “There are actually schools in my area that do that. And they do that so that they don’t get like 300 starting saxophonists and like 1 trombone player” (Interview 1 #28).

## **Interpreting Instrument Selection**

Clara and Libbey's accounts of how and why they chose their primary instruments were consistent with the literature highlighting importance of timbre preference (Johnson & Stewart, 2004) and band director influence, parental influence, and the importance of modeling (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000). Both participants enjoyed the timbre of their primary instrument. While Clara did not get to play her first two choices (trumpet and percussion), she enjoyed playing saxophone. Libbey wanted to play a woodwind instrument, and tried to play each one during the recruitment process. Nevertheless, in time she grew fond of the horn and enjoyed playing it. Clara's parents played a role in her decision by not allowing her to play trumpet or percussion but still allowing her to play one of her top three choices. In contrast, Libbey's band director influenced her decision by providing her with a horn and declaring her a horn player after she was able to produce a tone, bend the pitch, and confirm that she had good grades.

Both participants reported saxophone as one of their top choices and stated that it was a "cool" instrument. When I asked Libbey why she wanted to play the saxophone she said, "I just remember that it sounded really cool and I was like man, you can play all sorts of jazzy stuff with it. I don't even think I had a specific reason, I just thought it looked cool" (Interview 1, #10). Similarly, Clara also stated that the main reason she wanted to play saxophone was because it was cool. "My whole rationalization as a 4<sup>th</sup> grader was that I wanted an instrument that was cool" (Interview 1, #8). The popularity of the saxophone and its image of a "cool"

instrument is consistent with Fortney, Boyle, and DeCarbo's (1993) finding that most students listed saxophone as their favorite instrument regardless of gender or whether that was their primary instrument.

The importance of instrument modeling is documented in the literature (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000). While the gender of the performer did have an impact of the desirability of some of the instruments to the students, some instruments such as the saxophone and percussion rose dramatically after the intervention concert regardless of the performer's gender. Clara's experience in the instrument recruitment process supports the literature as she reported watching an intervention concert, which guided her opinion of trumpet, percussion, and the saxophone as being cool instruments.

The influence of modeling continues to be an important factor in a music student's life. While intervention concerts can help students form an opinion of an instrument, modeling and imitation exercises at all levels of a musician's education are important and essential to musical achievement (Delzell, 1989). It is also important for female musicians to have female role models. Harrison and O'Neill (2000) reported a spike in interest in percussion and saxophone after watching a female performer. They also reported a decrease in interest in the violin after watching a male violinist. Such intervention concerts have lessened gender biases in music education at the elementary level.

While neither participant reported gender stereotyping in their personal instrument selection process, it is still an issue that exists in music education. In

elementary education gender biases are trending downward (Johnson & Stewart, 2005) yet in middle school, the biases intensify. Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo (1993) reported that out of 990 middle school band students, 72% of saxophone players were male, 90% of flautists were female and 90% of trumpet and percussionists were male. Libbey reported a firsthand experience of what many would consider a result of gender bias in middle school: she was the only female in a class of 50 brass and percussion students.

To answer the second research question, each participant was asked questions about their social experiences growing up, their relationships with their teachers and professors, their current careers, and their femininity. Both their responses led the researcher to believe that the instrument they chose when they were younger set the path for their entire musical career. When asked if they felt their musical instrument played a role in obtaining their current teaching profession, each participant stated it did not.

### Social Experiences and Relationships

To answer my second research question, I asked questions about their relationships and social experiences in regards to their primary instrument as well as their current status as a high school band director. Based on the information from the interviews, I have organized the data into the following subcategories: (a) jazz and instrument selection, (b) gender identification, and (c) feminism and current career. I also present data supporting an emergent theme regarding teaching style.

## **Jazz and Instrument Selection**

According to the literature, most instruments in a traditional jazz or big band setting are stereotypically “male” instruments, including trumpet, trombone, saxophone, bass, and percussion. Also, many instrumental music teachers do not feel comfortable teaching jazz or improvisation. Through the voices of the two participants in this study, it becomes evident that instrument selection plays a monumental role in the ability to participate and teach jazz and improvisation. Clara felt that she has been much better prepared to teach jazz than her counterpart, Libbey. Nearly all of Clara’s perceived qualification to teach jazz stem from the fact that she plays the saxophone, which is a traditional jazz instrument. Conversely, Libbey, who feels unqualified and uncomfortable in teaching jazz, plays the horn, a non-traditional jazz instrument.

The ripple effect of playing a jazz instrument can be seen clearly through Clara’s experiences. She began playing saxophone in jazz band in middle school and right from the very beginning she was one of few females participating, which never seemed to bother her. In fact, it allowed her to make friends and to gain the respect of her male counterparts as seen by the following quote:

So yeah, I actually did have some nice friendships because of that but I think I always got along well with the other people in the saxophone section even though they were almost exclusively guys so I never felt like that was a deterrent from having friendships or from being close with the other people in the section... Yeah, so I don’t know if that was just me or it was because they

respected me because I was a good player but either way, I didn't have any trouble having friends in the section (Interview 1, #58,60).

Because Clara participated at a highly successful rate in a mostly male environment from a young age, her continuous participation in similar male-heavy environments allowed her to be de-sensitized to any uncomfortable feelings in being one of few females. Further, Clara not only participated in jazz, but also was one of the best in her band throughout her music education. Here she was able to take solos, gain more knowledge and exposure to jazz styles and technique, as well build her confidence.

I asked both participants about their participation in jazz while they were in middle school and high school and both expressed interest in participating but only Clara was able to. Libbey, because she played the horn, attempted to learn the piano parts for her school's jazz band but then determined that she was not good enough. When I asked her if she was disappointed about not participating in the jazz band she said, "Yeah I was. I was going to try it since I had some piano experience so I thought maybe I could do piano but then he gave me some music to try out on and I was like, "Mr. Teflon I'm not that good. And I tried it a little and it just didn't work out and they ended up getting someone who was a lot better at piano than I could ever be. She ended up being a piano major actually" (Interview 1, #50).

When I asked the participants about jazz in our second interviews, this time it was in relation to teacher training. Both participants stated that they did not receive any training in jazz education, practices, or any lessons on teaching improvisation.

After I asked this question, Clara's response was "You know, not until I took a couple graduate classes a couple summers ago because even though I did jazz and some private lessons and I always played in jazz bands, there wasn't anyone who ever talked about how to teach jazz or how to teach jazz band or how to teach kids improvisation or how to teach kids how to swing or different styles so I think I was very lucky to have a background like that because I don't know what people do when they have to teach a jazz band and they play a non-jazz instrument...like I really don't know what they do...I have no idea because it must be so difficult. I did not get any teacher training that talked about how to teach jazz band" (Interview 2, #55).

When I asked Libbey about her preparation to teach jazz and improvisation she delivered the following response: "I never learned anything of jazz. My knowledge of jazz is about this much and I feel like that's a huge gap in my education" (Interview 2, #72). While both participants had similar responses to my question about jazz and teacher training, Clara is comfortable teaching jazz while Libbey is not. In fact, Libbey admitted to purposefully not having a jazz band in her program because she does not feel comfortable teaching it. When I asked her if she has any plans of starting a jazz band she said, "Not any time soon because I need to learn about jazz"(Interview 3, #78).

Finally, while Clara is much more experienced in jazz and has been playing jazz music her life, she still considers jazz a "man's world" stating the following: "...I've definitely felt like an outsider and the place that I feel it the most is when I go to jazz events because I get the impression that jazz is still a boy's club and when I'm



taking kids to try out for region jazz or junior region jazz sometimes I'm the only women there of all the band directors and I wouldn't say that I'm not welcomed but that it's strange that I'm there to them so that's the place where I feel it" (Interview 3, #42).

### **Interpretations of Jazz and Instrument Selection**

There is an inherent gender gap in jazz both in the performance world and in music education (Gourse, 1995). Clara had a rich jazz education, participating in ensembles as early as 6<sup>th</sup> grade and taking private lessons in jazz only beginning in 8<sup>th</sup> grade. While Clara was included in jazz bands because she played a jazz instrument, she was aware that she was continuously one of few females in the jazz bands from middle school to the present. When remembering her middle school jazz band she said, "There were no other female saxophone players and actually now that I think about it, I don't think there were any more females in the jazz band. I remember there was another trumpet player and there was me" (Interview 1, #42).

Libbey expressed interest in participating in jazz band while in high school but knew that she could not do so on horn. She tried to audition on piano, her strongest secondary instrument at the time, but still felt that she was not good enough to join the band. "I was going to try it since I had some piano experience so I thought maybe I could do piano but then he gave me some music to try out on and I was like, 'Mr. Teflon I'm not that good'" (Interview 1, #50). This theme of students wanting to

participate in jazz on a non-jazz instrument or on a secondary but being excluded is documented in the literature. McKeage (2004) documented participation in jazz ensembles from high school to college, and reasons for participating. While 52 percent of females participated in jazz at the high school level, only 14 percent continued at the collegiate level. Participants reported that the main reason they did not continue to participate in jazz at the college level was because they did not play a jazz instrument (McKeage, 2004). Like Libbey, the students felt that they were not good enough on a secondary instrument to continue playing. Further, many females who participated in high school jazz band did so because their band director made accommodations for them such as transposing trombone parts for the horn or saxophone parts for the clarinet (McKeage, 2004).

At the collegiate level, it is expected that the top jazz performing ensembles have traditional jazz instrumentation. However, according to the National Standards for Music Education, all the teachers need to be prepared to teach jazz and improvisation (NAfME, 2014). If more situations such as those found by McKeage were to occur, it would allow students to participate in jazz studies regardless of their primary instrument or gender. This creates more of a jazz lab, opening up the possibility for more students, male and female, to participate in jazz and develop their improvisation skills.

There is a documented relationship between jazz participation and preparation in jazz pedagogy (Wiggins, 1997; McKeage, 2004). Both participants reported little to no preparation in jazz or improvisation in their teacher training programs. Clara stated

that she owed all of her perceived qualifications and comfort level in teaching jazz to her experiences playing in a jazz ensemble for most of her life:

There wasn't anyone who ever talked about how to teach jazz or how to teach jazz band or how to teach kids improvisation or how to teach kids how to swing or different styles so I think I was very lucky to have a background like that because I don't know what people do when they have to teach a jazz band and they play a non-jazz instrument...like I really don't know what they do...I have no idea because it must be so difficult. I did not get any teacher training that talked about how to teach jazz band (Interview 2, #55).

Libbey made similar claims about not feeling prepared to teach jazz and also stated that her teacher training provided no preparation to teach jazz or improvisation. "I never learned anything of jazz. My knowledge of jazz is about this much and I feel like that's a huge gap in my education" (Interview 2, #72).

According to Wiggins (1997), 50 percent of 132 high school band directors reported that they were unprepared to teach jazz or improvisation. Libbey also stated that she feels unprepared to teach jazz and stated that she does not want to start a jazz program at her school until she feels more prepared to teach jazz and improvisation. According to the literature, there is currently a gap in the teacher training curriculum in the form of jazz pedagogy and improvisation and unless a student is able to participate in a jazz band, they do not get the experience and knowledge needed to feel prepared in teaching jazz and improvisation (Wiggins, 1997). Finally, McKeage (2004) claimed that the exclusive and small instrumentation of the jazz ensemble puts

many future music educators at a disadvantage. It places female instrumentalists at a further disadvantage because of the previous mentioned gender biases that are inherent in the instrumentation of a jazz band.

### **Gender Identification**

In the literature review I identified four different gender classifications: feminine, masculine, androgynous, and undifferentiated. When I asked participants to describe themselves, both identified themselves as tomboys. For the purpose of this study, consistent with Sinsel, Dixon, & Blades-Zellar's (1997) research on children's psychological sex type identification; the term tomboy will be associated with androgynous.

In her first interview, Clara stated "I was always kind of a tomboy so I think that I was drawn to the instruments that to me seemed more masculine than to the instruments that seemed feminine" (Interview 1, #12). Both participants also expressed an aversion to overly feminine things. For instance, Clara called the flute and clarinet "wimpy, girly instruments" (Interview 1, #8). While Libbey did not make any negative connotations on specific instruments, she did express some scorn for what seemed to be a more feminine sorority than the one she joined, stating that they wore "pearls and cardigans" and she was more comfortable wearing jeans and a t-shirt (Interview 2, #16). Finally, Clara crossed even more gender biases with her love of sports and science: "When I was in middle school and when I was younger and then

also actually part of high school I was playing on town, rec sports teams so I also played soccer in the fall and I played softball in the spring and in middle school I was doing both music and sports” (Interview 1, #70). When considering applying to college, Clara expressed some interest in studying science and said, “...I also really liked science and I really liked the Natural Sciences, especially Biology and I sort of internally debated going into music or pursuing a science because I really enjoyed them both a lot” (Interview 1, #116).

Libbey also called herself a tomboy in our first interview. In fact, she even takes it a step further and actually classifies herself as “one of the guys” when describing her memories of being one girl in a 50 piece middle school brass class. “It was a good thing that I was kind of a tomboy because I was able to fit in pretty well...I was able to hold my own. A lot of the guys...well I ended up being one of the guys” (Interview 1, #30). Libbey further classified with males in subsequent interviews as well. In our second interview I asked her how she felt about having an evenly mixed horn studio while in college in comparison to being in a nearly all male brass class, which she experienced in middle school. She said, “Yes and no because I wasn’t really used to dealing with girls. Girls are catty. Girls are mean. Even though there were times where we got along with each other, we just did not understand each other because I’m one of the boys and they are not” (Interview 2, #22).

Both participants are confident individuals. This confidence is evident through their opinions of themselves as musicians and current educators. When Clara spoke of her success on the saxophone, she made it clear she was always one of the best

players, stating “Yeah, I was basically first chair in everything since I started playing so”(Interview 1, #48). Similarly, Libbey makes an equally confident statement when asked about how she feels as a female band director. “I’m going to take off my modest-me hat for a moment. I’m good” (Interview 3, #72).

Both participants were accepted into honors bands/orchestras at the middle school and high school level and both list their success on their instrument as a reason for choosing to pursue music in college. Clara’s statement best sums up how both participants felt about continuing music after high school. “I mean I loved music, I had a lot of success there, I felt like I fit in there with all the music people and the band people, I felt comfortable in that environment. I enjoyed playing my instrument in both solo settings and in band settings, I enjoyed practicing, so there wasn’t anything about music that I didn’t like” (Interview 1, #118).

While both participants appeared to be confident individuals, they also both enjoy being different. They do not seem bothered by situations that would make others feel uncomfortable. For instance, Libbey was the only female in a 50-piece brass and percussion class and she adapted well and continued to be one of the best players. Similarly, Clara continued her success in jazz as a first alto player. She had no trouble improvising solos and performing at a high level despite being one of few females in the ensemble.

## **Feminism and Current Career**

In the third interview, I asked each participant questions about being a female high school band director. They were asked to (a) describe their experiences as a female in a male-heavy industry, (b) describe their own femininity, and (c) their opinion of what role gender played in obtaining their current teaching position. When asked if they ever felt mistreated, alienated, or discriminated against in the workplace because of their gender, neither participant reported experiences any instances of mistreatment or discrimination. Both participants described supportive co-workers and neither worked at a school where other male band directors are present. Both participants had a supportive male principal who treated them fairly.

Curiously both participants stated that sometimes they did feel alienated or intimidated at conferences or festivals but they perceived it was because of their lack of experience as new teachers, not their gender. Clara felt a little alienated when she attended regional jazz meetings: “I don’t talk to many of them but I’m not sure if that’s related to gender or to my lack of annual participation” (Interview 3, #46). Libbey made similar claims stating that she felt intimidated because of her status as a new teacher and said, “Now at stuff like region auditions and region clinics, then I felt a little intimidated...less so now that I kind of know how things go but it’s less the fact that I’m a woman and a lot more the fact that these guys have been teaching 20-30 years” (Interview 3, #42).

## **Interpretation of Feminism and Current Career**

It is stated in the literature that many women feel the need to enhance their femininity when on stage or in front of a large group of people, especially in male dominated situations (Clawson, 1999). When asked if they ever felt the need to enhance their femininity, each participant initially responded “no” but their definition of feminine and their reasons to enhance or not to enhance their beauty were different. Clara differed with the prevailing notion that music education is not that feminine of a job to begin and is quoted saying, “I sort of get the impression that people see like a music teacher as a job where you’re always doing the kind of down and dirty things. You’re always moving chairs and stands and you’re always moving big equipment. I think people expect you to not be as feminine but I don’t feel like I have to enhance it” (Interview 3, #50).

As stated before, the participants’ views on what is feminine and what is not are different. For instance, Clara is against wearing a dress to concerts and prefers black pants and a plain, black top and says, “I know there’s some conductors who will conduct in like some sequined-y kind of dress or like something that’s black with patterns on it but I feel like the performance is about the kids and not about me so I usually just wear black slacks and a plain black top” (Interview 3, #54). In contrast, Libbey refuses to wear a pantsuit and instead goes for a dress and is quoted saying, “If I’m going to get up there then I’m going to look good and it’s not really enhancing my femininity so much as that when I’m going to get up in front of loads of people I want



to actually look professional and the best way I can do that is by wearing a nice dress. I refuse to go the pants-suit route though. I am not Hillary Clinton” (Interview 3, #50).

Embedded in Libbey’s last quote is another difference between the two participants when it comes to enhancing their beauty at concerts. Libbey wanted to look professional and was concerned with her own personal image and how other teachers and the parents of her students view her. Her main goal in is look professional and older. “I’d rather look professional and modest than the type-A bombshell because in some ways I think if you do that you might lose respect from parents. The kids might love it. Some of the dads might love it but you have to have the respect of the moms too. And especially since I am really young at this school and because I am by far the youngest faculty member there’s some ways I have to look professional to look older” (Interview 3, #54).

Clara also is against looking overly feminine at concerts but her main focus is on her ensemble. She does not want anything that she does to take away from the students and the music they are creating: “I don’t feel comfortable conducting in anything that has much of a heel as far as heels are concerned because I feel kind of off balance and I also don’t like to conduct in a dress because I feel like it moves people’s attention towards me and away from the performing group so I try to stay as neutrally black as I can” (Interview 3, #54).

The final difference between the participant’s views on enhancing their femininity is their views on dressing up. Clara does enjoy dressing up in an appropriate setting and told a story of when she was a featured soloist playing a jazz

piece and she dressed in a very feminine fashion. “I performed at a teacher talent show last year and I played an arrangement of Harlem Nocturne, which is pretty slinky and pretty sexy and I did wear a very seductive black dress and heels for that but that was a situation where I was the one doing a solo...”(Interview 3, #54). In contrast, Libbey does not enjoy wearing makeup or putting on jewelry and feels pressured to do so to look older. “I used to go without make-up but I look 16 so I had to start wearing make-up, I had to start wearing jewelry and it’s not that I particularly enjoy putting it on everyday, it’s just I have to look older than my kids because I still get mistaken for an 18 year old and I’m almost 26” (Interview 3, #54).

I asked each participant whether they felt their primary instrument helped them obtain their current teaching position. Both participants felt that their primary instrument did not play any role in the hiring process. Even though I did not ask if gender played a role in the hiring process, Clara believed she was hired because she was a woman because of a scandal between the former male band director and a student. She feels that in this instance, being female increased the likelihood that her current employer would hire her. “I will say though that I feel like I was definitely hired because I’m a woman. The gentleman who had been at my position before me at my current job was only there for 1 year and without going into excruciating detail, he was accused of having a relationship with a student and he ended up ending the year being escorted out by the police so I definitely think they were looking to hire a woman. Definitely” (Interview 3, #58).

Both Clara and Libbey were self-aware and reported knowing that they were in the minority as female high school band directors. Both participants claimed that being female did not put them at a disadvantage and they both reported that they have always felt fairly treated by their administrators, co-workers, and students. According to the literature, only 20%-24% of instrumental teachers at the middle school and high school level are female (Grisold & Chrobak, 1981; Gould, 1994; McKeage, 2000; Zervoudakes & Tanur, 1994). It should be noted that the above-mentioned studies were quantitative studies measuring demographics only. None of the studies asked questions regarding harassment, mistreatment, or sexism. Conversely, Clara and Libbey reported that they have never felt harassed or mistreated because of their gender. While gender inequality is not present in the form of treatment, gender inequality is present in the form of underrepresentation. This underrepresentation is further highlighted by Payne (1996) who reported that females make up the majority of bachelor degrees and 50% of masters degrees earned in music education, yet only 20% of those future female music educators go on to teach at the high school level.

Lamb's (1994) goal of liberal feminism for music education includes (a) equality in instrument selection; (b) ability for males and females to equally partake in jazz studies; and (c) promotion of more female music educators at all levels of music education, including at the high school and collegiate level. Gould (1994) claims that women tend to primarily gravitate towards education positions involving young children. Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) report that women tend not to hold leadership role in the field of music such as running a high school band program. Finally,

McKeage (2004) stated that there is a direct correlation between the lack of female band directors and the lack of females participating in jazz stating the importance of the jazz ensemble to many high school instrumental programs.

Clara and Libbey are fully aware that they are in the minority as female high school band directors. They are unique in being female high school band directors yet their experiences are not unique and are consistent with the literature regarding feeling isolated. Both participants made comments about high school directors being part of the “good old boys club”.

When talking about going to a jazz conference Clara stated: “when I go to jazz events because I get the impression that jazz is still a boy’s club and when I’m taking kids to try out for region jazz or junior region jazz sometimes I’m the only women there of all the band directors and I wouldn’t say that I’m not welcomed but that it’s strange that I’m there” (Interview 3, #42). Libbey made similar claims when recalling a memory of male band directors making fun of a female colleague at a festival. “You can tell which band directors look down on you for being a woman and which ones don’t. There’s just a little group of them...like last year at one of the clinics, the junior high clinic, there was a female director there and there were a few of the “good ole boys” and they were all old, white men and they were standing in the back kind of talking, making fun of the woman on the podium” (Interview 3, #42).

### **Tough Love vs. Teddy Bear**

The following section is an emergent theme from the data. Throughout the interviews, each participant described past teachers and professors in a way that began to form a pattern. Based on the information in the interviews, Clara described most of her teachers, elementary through college, as “gentle, supportive, and kind” and even referred to her middle school band director as a “teddy bear.” In contrast, Libbey described many of her teachers as strict, sarcastic, no nonsense and scary, and described getting a bit of “tough love” from some of her teachers.

I have categorized descriptive terms used by the participants to describe their teachers at varying stages in their education. In table 1.1, I present these themes organized by “tough love” and “teddy bear.” I have categorized descriptive terms used by the participants to describe their teachers at varying stages in their education.

Table 1.1. Tough Love vs. Teddy Bear

<b>Libbey's Teachers: Tough Love</b>	<b>Clara's Teachers: Teddy Bear</b>
Strict	Big
No-nonsense	Happy
Sarcastic	Loveable
Scary	Gentle
Mean	Supportive
Yells in the classroom	Kind
Commands respect by fear	Commands respect by showing respect

When asked to describe their elementary, middle school, high school, and collegiate teachers, both participants remembered their teachers vividly and gave

detailed descriptions of them. Clara described most of her teachers in a positive way. When I asked her to describe her elementary band director she said, “I also remember him being very patient and very soft-spoken. I can’t recall him ever raising his voice at us or saying anything that wasn’t friendly or kind and positive. He was a really a, he’s deceased now, but he was a really gentle soul” (Interview 1, #34). Similarly, she spoke very highly of her high school band director. “Jerry is a really big guy, he’s very tall and a little bit on the heavy side and he had a really big beard and he looked really scary to me as a kid but he was like one of those big teddy bear sort of guys. He was just friendly and loving and caring. He’s incredibly smart. He has a really great sense of humor and he’s a very, very talented [saxophone] player” (Interview 1, #80). She also stated: “So he was very, very talented and very, very nurturing, I mean he would always have time for a lesson and I know frequently I would have lessons after school when everybody else had already left for the day and he and I would sit and play duets and those were our lessons, I mean he was a big musical force in my life” (Interview 1, #82).

Like Clara, Libbey also spoke fondly of her elementary/middle teachers. What is interesting is how their definition of fond is different. For instance, when Libbey spoke of her middle school band director, it was in a fond manner but the descriptors she used were different than those used by Clara. “She was very patient but very no-nonsense. She would not take anybody’s bull and she just kind of had a calming influence and she really encouraged competition and we were all over that” (Interview 1, #20). Contrary to Clara, Libbey did not describe all of her high school band

directors in a positive manner. “He was very condescending... he would kind of talk down his nose at you and he had written a few pieces that were published” (Interview 1, #66).

In the second interview, I asked both participants to describe their primary teachers and the directors from their primary ensembles. Clara spoke in detail about her primary lesson instructor while Libbey often moved back and forth between describing her lesson instructor and her ensemble directors.

Both participants had demanding primary instrument instructors and both participants described their teachers as “strict”; however, it is their accompanying adjectives that set them apart. For instance, Clara said the following about her saxophone teacher: “If you didn’t come prepared you did not get a good grade for your lessons. There were no freebees, there were no gimmies, and he could definitely tell if you hadn’t been practicing. He was strict but never in a nasty way or a condescending way, he just really wanted to push people” (Interview 2, #8). In contrast, Libbey stated the following about her horn professor: “Terrifying...terrifying is a good word. He seemed so nice and sweet when you first met him, when you were an incoming freshman and learning about the school and then you were actually in his studio and...well...he likes to weed out the weak...only the strong survived. He would not accept any excuses at all and if you came into a lesson with him you better know your stuff there will be hell and with me, since I didn’t practice as much as I should have, there was hell a few times. He definitely gave a lot of tough love” (Interview 2, #8 & #12).



While Libbey's teachers fell more into the tough love category and Clara's into the teddy bear category, Clara did experience a "tough love" teacher while she was student teaching and she did not respond well to him. Clara did not respond well to a "tough love" teaching style. When asked to describe her cooperating teacher, she spoke negatively about him and his teaching methods. "My cooperating teacher was an asshole. He was chauvinistic, he got the kids to respect him because they were scared of him, he screamed and yelled all the time and was constantly raising his voice, always, always, in lessons and in rehearsal and my impression from that, just to sum it up was that if this is what good teaching is supposed to be, then I'm never going to teach" (Interview 2, #30).

In contrast, Libbey continued to respond well to other "tough love" teachers she encountered in collegiate ensembles and while student teaching. When asked to describe one of her band directors, Libbey spoke very fondly of her and even claimed that she was her idol. "...Rachel Bishop, who was for a very long time, my hero. We called her Darth Bishop because she knew exactly what to say to cut you down but at the same time motivate you (Interview 2, #26). Later in the interview, she used similar descriptors when talking about this professor. "She was very, very driven and she knew exactly what she wanted and she knew exactly how to get it and she would make sure that you would follow that plan whether you wanted to or not" (Interview 2, #84).

Based on the data collected in the first two interviews about each participant's band directors, primary teacher memories, and the emerging pattern between the two teaching styles the participants reported, I asked each participant in the last interview

if they currently try to emulate any of their previous teachers or professors. Clara claimed that she does not try to emulate any of her previous teachers and instead stated that she prefers a classroom management style that matches her personality. “So I think for me being successful in the classroom is having a mix of being strict when I need to be but also being fun. So I found a way, that for me works with my personality so that I don’t have discipline issues in the classroom. I think a big part of that is actually not ever yelling because as soon as you lose control like that, it doesn’t mean anything” (Interview 2, #65). While Clara said she does not emulate any of her previous teachers, she did acknowledge the value in experiencing a teaching style she did not like and again mentioned her cooperating teacher. “I think part of the reason that I got placed with him was that he was a saxophone player also so maybe they thought that would give me something in common with him but he was just such a different person than I was that we didn’t really have any common ground even on just an individual, person to person level. We just didn’t really have much in common. I think it was good for me to see that because I see programs like that around where I teach now and I have colleagues that I see at like honors band auditions that teach in programs like that and it’s just not for me. I even know it now that I just do not enjoy programs like that so I guess it was good, I learned what I didn’t want which is a good thing” (Interview 2, #48-52).

Unlike Clara, Libbey stated that she does emulate some teaching styles from her previous teachers, Dr. Bishop in particular. “I realize that the way I lead an ensemble as far as just kind of a combination of fighting sarcasm mixed up with okay

you messed up, do it again but do it better. I do a lot of that like Dr. Bishop which I didn't really realize until recently" (Interview 3, #60). She also listed her cooperating teacher and her horn professor as teachers that she tries to emulate in her classroom. Libbey identifies her predisposition towards using sarcasm as problematic because of her school's policy on sarcasm in the classroom. Nevertheless, she continues to use sarcasm and stated: "I do a lot of that like Dr. Bishop which I didn't really realize until recently because one of the things we are supposed to be getting rid of in our classroom is sarcasm and I am so bad at that. I love sarcasm. Sarcasm is a great way to get to the point so that's been a struggle" (Interview 3, #60).

### **Lack of Role Models**

Throughout their music education, both Clara and Libbey had almost exclusively male teachers. Libbey did have one collegiate band director who is female but many of her other teachers, including her primary lesson instructor, high school teachers, and cooperating teachers were all male. Clara had exclusively male teachers from middle school through college with the exception of a few music education professors. Clara and Libbey are unique in breaking this cycle and becoming high school band directors yet their personal music educations were not unique as it is consistent with the literature that the majority of high school and collegiate band directors are male. The lack of female teachers at the high school and collegiate level contributes to lack of role models for potential new female band directors. This cycle

of not enough women in the field perpetuates a consistent low percentage of female high school band directors.

### **Interpretations of Lack of Role Models**

Female high school band directors often do not have any role models or mentors (Harrison & O'Neill; Howe, 2014). Female role models are highly important for future female band directors. Many times, male band directors do not encourage women to pursue teaching high school band as a career (Howe, 2014). When first considering majoring in music education, Clara's band director advised her against majoring in music education. She quoted him saying, "Music is really different, or anything is really different when it's not your hobby anymore and you do it for a paycheck and he said, 'I know you really love this and I want to make sure you're making the right decision and I really think you should re-evaluate and make sure really what you want to do'" (Interview 1, #116).

Howe traces the lack of female band directors to mentor future female band directors stems all the way back to the instrument selection process and states that women have not selected primary instruments that are deemed most appropriate for teaching high school band, namely brass instruments. This highlights the importance of instrument selection and how it can alter the life experiences and potentially hamper career opportunities, especially for female musicians. If Lamb's (1994) goal of liberal feminism is to ever be achieved, gender biases in musical instrument selection needs to be eradicated at the elementary and middle school level; it is an integral part of the

process in eradicating the under representation of female high school band directors (Howe, 2014).

Clara and Libbey stated that they did not feel that their primary instrument played a part in them obtaining their current teaching position. At the surface, it may not have been a factor, however there is consistent literature that shows a pattern between instruments chosen and perceived qualifications for teaching high school band especially instruments commonly included in a traditional jazz band (Gould, 1994; Howe, 2014; McKeage, 2004; Payne, 1996).

## **Summary**

To answer the first research question, I asked each participant to describe, in detail, how and why they chose their primary instrument. Participants shared reasons for (a) choosing their instrument, (b) which instrument they preferred, (c) how they felt about their decision. Participants also stated if there were any outside influences that contributed to their decision such as their parents, their band director, or their friends. The data provided by the participants largely corroborated with the literature which lists timbre preference as the most important factor in instrument selection followed by parental involvement, band director involvement, and peer pressure (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993; Johnson & Stewart, 2004)

To answer the second research question, I asked questions about their relationships and social experiences in regards to their primary instrument as well as their current status as a high school band director. It is evident from the data that the

participants' primary instruments impacted their social and musical experiences from grade school to the present. By examining Clara's interviews, one could see how playing the saxophone has allowed her to pursue her passion in jazz. As a horn player, Libbey was excluded from jazz but instead was given opportunities to play in symphony orchestras. Both participant excelled in a primarily male environment from a young age and grew to be confident players and educators.

## **Chapter 5**

### **SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

#### **Summary**

With the intent to improve instrumental music instruction, the purpose of this study was to explore influences on instrument selection as well as gain personal insight into musical experiences of female music educators who cross the gender line with their instrument selection and/or their career choice.

The following questions guided this study:

1. What reasons do female music educators give for their choice of primary instrument?
2. How do musicians who cross the gender line describe their relationships and social experiences in relation to their instrument selection?

Due to lack of qualitative research on gender bias and music education, I used a comparative case study to answer the research questions. Further, I approached this study through a feminism lens with an emphasis on gender inequality. Following Rubin & Rubin's (2011) model for conducting interviews, I interviewed two participants each three times over the course of a three-month period beginning in Fall 2013. I transcribed each interview and analyzed them using theory-generated codes (see Appendix F).

## Participant Recruitment and Description

The participants were selected using a convenience sampling. Following comparative case study procedure, the participants are similar and can be compared. Despite their difference in age, teaching experience, and primary instrument, their shared experience as female high school band directors allow for comparison (Kaarbo & Beasley, 1999).

Originally I sought to find one participant who played a stereotypically male instrument such as saxophone, trumpet, trombone, or percussion, and one who played a stereotypically female instrument such as the flute or clarinet. This sampling goal is consistent with Howe's (2014) claim that many female band directors play stereotypically male instruments. I felt that this variety in participant instrument choice would add depth and diversity to the findings. Ultimately, one participant plays saxophone, a stereotypically male instrument, while the other participant plays horn, a gender-neutral instrument.

Each participant is a female high school band director who is currently employed in a high school. The participants attended and graduated from an accredited college or university with a degree in music education earning a minimum of a bachelor's degree in their subject. The names of the participants have been changed to protect their identity. Participant 1 is referred to as Clara and participant 2 is referred to as Libbey.

### **Description of Participants**

Clara is a female high school band director and is currently in her 11<sup>th</sup> year of teaching. She is between the ages of 35-40, is Caucasian, and lives and works in a small town in the mid-Atlantic region the United States. Clara works at a public high



school and teaches band, private lessons, and music theory. She also coaches the marching band in the fall, runs an afterschool jazz band in the winter, and conducts the pit orchestra for the school musical in the spring. Clara's primary instrument is saxophone, which she has been playing since 5<sup>th</sup> grade. She grew up in the same mid-Atlantic town in which she currently teaches and came from a supportive, affluent family.

Libbey is a female high school band director and is currently in her 3<sup>rd</sup> year of teaching. She is between the ages of 25-30, is Caucasian, and lives and works in the Southwest region of the United States. Libbey works at a private Christian school and teaches band to grades 5-12, private lessons, and teaches 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grade American History. Libbey's primary instrument is the horn, which she has been playing since the 6<sup>th</sup> grade. Libbey grew up in the Southeast but moved to the mid-Atlantic in 7<sup>th</sup> grade where she completed her education. Libbey came from a supportive, affluent, and musical family.

## Data Collection and Analysis

### **Data Collection**

Following Rubin & Rubin's (2011) model for conducting interviews, I interviewed two participants each three times over the course of a three-month period beginning in Fall 2013. Each interview lasted approximately one hour; each participant was interviewed once a month. I conducted the interviews via FaceTime (ver. 7.0.6) and recorded the conversation using GarageBand (ver. 6.0.5). I

interviewed Clara in October, November, and December of 2013. I interviewed Libbey in November and December of 2013 and January of 2014.

Interview questions were created to best answer the research questions and were framed based on extant literature. The first interview was centered on the participant's personal K-12 music education, their instrumental selection process, and their relationships, memories, and experiences from their middle school and high school years. In the second interview, questions focused on the participant's music education training at the collegiate level. The third interview focused on their current career, how they obtained their teaching position, and how they feel about being the minority as a female high school band director.

I conducted each interview using FaceTime (ver. 7.0.6) and recorded each interview using GarageBand (ver. 6.0.5). Upon completion of each interview, the recordings were transcribed in a Microsoft Word (ver. 14.0.47) document. An auditor checked the transcriptions against the original audio recording. The audited transcriptions were then sent to each participant for member checking before the next interview.

## **Data Analysis**

I created a preliminary coding table while developing this study. This table used theory-generated codes derived from the literature, which can be found in Appendix F. During analysis, I engaged in line-by-line coding, noting data that (a) answered my research questions and (b) pointed toward emergent findings. I sought to use the participant's voice in as much of my analysis as possible. Following line-by-

line coding, I used axial coding to group data into conceptual categories. Finally, I connected my analysis back to the literature review.

My coding was primarily inductive, wherein I discovered patterns, themes, and categories from the data (Patton, 2002). Most of my findings related to the first research question (memories of instrument selection) largely corroborated with extant literature. Findings relating to the second interview question (social experiences and relationships) were primarily emergent in nature.

## Data Results

### **Instrument Selection**

Both participants provided detailed descriptions of their musical instrument selection process and their responses are largely consistent with and corroborate with the literature in which timbre preference, parental influence, and band director influence are the main reasons students list for choosing their primary instrument (Johnson & Stewart, 2004). For example, both participants reported remembering saxophone as being a cool instrument. Libbey stated the following: “I had my heart set on playing saxophone. I was going to play saxophone” (Interview 1, #8). Clara’s parents influenced her ultimate instrument choice; they would not allow her to play the trumpet or percussion and then settled on allowing her to play the saxophone. “The first instrument that I wanted to play was the trumpet and my parents said ‘we’re not having a trumpet player in the house. It’s too loud.’ I said ‘okay, how bout the drums?’ and they said, ‘no way are you playing the drums.’ So I said ‘fine fine fine, how about the saxophone?’ and they said, ‘okay the saxophone’” (Interview 1, #8). Conversely,

band director influence played a role in Libbey's instrument selection as her band director promptly declared her a horn player after Libbey demonstrated she was able to produce a tone, manipulate the tone, and prove that she had good grades.

While neither participant reported experiencing gender biases during their instrument selection process, their experiences are consistent with the literature on the process itself. For instance, Clara was given an intervention concert and Libbey was provided with a petting zoo. Both settings are described as being used in previous studies (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Harrison & O'Neill, 2000).

### **Social Experiences and Relationships**

During all three interviews, I asked each participant questions related to their jazz experience and training. Clara and Libbey's experiences and recollections are consistent with the literature. According to the literature, most instruments in a traditional jazz or big band setting are stereotypically "male" instruments, including trumpet, trombone, saxophone, bass, and percussion. Also, many instrumental music teachers do not feel comfortable teaching jazz or improvisation. Clara felt that she has been much better prepared to teach jazz than her counterpart, Libbey. Nearly all of Clara's perceived qualification to teach jazz stem from the fact that she plays the saxophone, which is a traditional jazz instrument. Conversely, Libbey, who feels unqualified and uncomfortable in teaching jazz, plays the horn, a non-traditional jazz instrument. Both participants stated that they did not receive any training in jazz education, practices, or any lessons on teaching improvisation.

In the third interview, I asked each participant questions about being a female high school band director. These questions were derived from feminist literature on

beauty enhancement, gender inequality, and feelings of isolation (Gould, 2005; Howe, 2014; Payne, 1996; McKeage, 2004).

Clara and Libbey's responses largely corroborate with the literature. Both participants recalled instances where they felt the need to dress nicely, either for a concert or a performance, but did not feel the need to enhance their femininity during the average school day. Clara recalled a memory in which she performed at a faculty concert. "I played an arrangement of Harlem Nocturne, which is pretty slinky and pretty sexy and I did wear a very seductive black dress and heels for that but that was a situation where I was the one doing a solo..."(Interview 3, #54).

In regards to gender inequality, Clara and Libbey both acknowledge that they are in the minority as female high school band directors and both report not having role models and feeling isolated or awkward at times at professional development sessions, festivals, or conferences. Libbey made a comment that described how she feels at conferences despite not being personally harassed herself. She stated: "You can tell which band directors look down on you for being a woman and which ones don't. There's just a little group of them" (Interview 3, #42).

Neither Clara nor Libbey reported being personally harassed, or discriminated against; their stories do corroborate and are evidence of gender inequality among high school band directors. Lamb's (1994) goal of liberal feminism for music education includes (a) equality in instrument selection; (b) ability for males and females to equally partake in jazz studies; and (c) promotion of more female music educators at all levels of music education, including at the high school and collegiate level. According to McKeage, (2000) only 20%-24% of high school band directors are

female, proving further than gender inequality does not always exist in actual mistreatment but can come in the form of under-representation.

### Conclusions

Consistent with the purpose of this study, both participants provided insight into (a) musical instrument selection process and (b) social relationships and experiences in relation to their primary instrument. Clara and Libbey's stories, while not generalizable to other populations, are consistent with extant literature pointing to three reasons female high school instrumental music teachers are underrepresented: (a) gender biases during the instrument selection process, (b) the exclusionary nature of jazz bands in music education, and (c) the lack of female role models at the high school and collegiate level.

These participants' primary instrument selection has affected many of their life experiences and has played an integral role in the experiences they did or did not have in their personal music educations. Both participants are self-proclaimed "tomboys" and they are both confident, assertive, and enjoy being different. These personality traits are consistent with Howe's (2014) claim that female high school band directors have to be "assertive, competitive, and confident to succeed" (Howe, 2014, pg. 300). Clara and Libbey possess these qualities and they play traditionally non-female instruments. With these facts in mind, success and confidence can be traced throughout each participant's personal music education from the day they chose their primary instrument to their current careers as high school band directors.

Clara plays saxophone and enjoyed all the benefits of growing up in a male dominated atmosphere. Here she grew comfortable taking solos and became a confident and successful performer. Clara is a skilled musician and the success she experienced allowed her to be respected despite being one of few females in many ensembles in which she participated. Outside of the obvious benefits of being included in jazz ensembles throughout her life, such as learning to improvise and learning various jazz literature and styles, Clara also developed a sense of normalcy in being in male dominated groups and in turn saw being one of few females as empowering. “I set myself apart because I worked so hard and had a lot of success. I think at the time I really enjoyed being different and I really enjoyed doing something that not a lot of women did” (Interview 1, #102).

Like Clara, Libbey’s experience as a young horn player allowed her to grow comfortable in male dominated environments. In middle school she was one female in a class of 50 brass and percussion students and she claimed that she became “one of the guys.” This amount of male interaction can be traced through her teacher training where she made remarks about why she does not like having too many women in her horn studio.

The biggest turning point for Clara and Libbey came while they were in middle school and high school. Clara was able to join the jazz band because she played a jazz instrument. Libbey was excluded from the jazz band because her primary instrument, horn, is not a jazz instrument and she did not feel talented enough to join the band on piano, her next strongest instrument. Inclusion or exclusion in jazz is critical to teacher

preparation and perceived qualifications to teach jazz and improvisation to students. Both participants recalled almost no jazz participation in their teacher training and only Clara feels comfortable and qualified to teach jazz while Libbey does not. In fact, Libbey's discomfort in teaching jazz and improvisation has kept her from implementing them in her classroom despite jazz and improvisations being included in the National Standards for music education.

Clara and Libbey's experiences highlight how important their primary instrument selection was and how their choice sets up a chain of events that effects all of their musical experiences up to the present. Clara and Libbey are unique individuals. They are not only statistically unique, as they are part of only 20 percent of female high school band directors, but they are unique in their instrument selection, their success as musicians, and the empowerment they take from being successful high school band directors. Their music education, however, was consistent with existing literature: Clara and Libbey grew up with predominantly male band directors from middle school through college. It is also consistent with the literature that only those who play jazz instruments, which are nearly all stereotypically male instruments, get to participate in jazz ensembles and get experience improvising.

There is a link between jazz participation and preparation to teach jazz and improvisation. Historically, inclusion in jazz is determined by instrument; traditional jazz band instrumentation includes stereotypically male instruments and more males participate in jazz than females. This highlights a gap in education for female musicians. As Howe (2014) stated, females do not choose primary instruments that are



currently deemed appropriate for teaching high school band. The fact that there are “appropriate” and “inappropriate” instruments for teaching high school means that from the instrument selection process, females are placed at a disadvantage if they were pressured to go along with gender biases when choosing their instrument. According to Howe (2014), brass instruments are deemed most appropriate for teaching high school band; brass instruments are also the most predominantly featured instrument family in the jazz band. According to this logic, if females are dissuaded from choosing a brass instrument, they will have less of a chance at participating in jazz band, which will then lead to them having less of a chance of being hired to teach high school band.

Becoming a female high school band director is not a “normal” career choice for many females who graduate with a music education degree. Clara and Libbey are aware that they are in the minority and it is good for music education that people like Clara and Libbey, among others, are breaking the mold and increasing the number of female high school band directors. However, there are still too few females teaching high school instrumental music. Right now there is an inequality in the field of music education. Inequality does not always exist in the form of harassment and mistreatment but instead in the form of underrepresentation. Females are severely underrepresented in the field of high school instrumental education. Ideally, studies like this will encourage continued attention to the need for equity in high school instrumental music education.

Lamb's goal of liberal feminism will not be reached until (a) gender biases in the instrumental selection process are eradicated, (b) all students, regardless of instrument, are included in jazz ensembles, and (c) there are more female role models and mentors for future female band directors. Until then, as Gould (2005) stated, students and teachers will continue to be limited in their choice of occupations and instruments. Perhaps most significantly, the profession will continue to suffer from the loss of female contributions.

### Recommendations

Future research on this topic is timely and warranted as it is still a pressing issue in music education. Future researchers should examine female band directors and instrument selection with more participants in different contexts such as age, teaching experience, or primary instrument. How unique were these participant's experiences? Do results from this study point towards a blueprint for female high school band directors? For example, how many female high school band directors are assertive, confident, and competitive as Howe (2014) suggests? Does self-perception as a tomboy and the enjoyment of "being different" have on other female high school instrumental music educator's path towards their current role? Researchers may wish to survey current female high school band directors on their primary instrument to prove or disprove Howe's claim that brass instruments are the most appropriate instrument for teaching high school band.

Future researchers may also examine the relationship between jazz participation in grade school and jazz pedagogy in teacher training. Researchers may survey current undergraduate music educator majors about their jazz participation. Future studies may examine current instrumental methods courses at Universities and how much or little they incorporate jazz and improvisation in their curriculum.

Finally, in future studies, researchers may wish to examine how having a family affects the career options of female musicians. For instance, Fitzpatrick (2013) states that women face discrimination during the hiring process and are looked down upon if they wish to begin a family. It would be interesting to see how many middle school and elementary teachers list family obligations as reasons why they teach younger children.

Because of gender bias, female musicians are currently at a disadvantage if they wish to pursue high school instrumental instruction as a career. This injustice can be traced in research literature to a student's instrument selection, lack of females participating in jazz, and lack of female role models at the high school and collegiate levels. The two female high school band directors who participated in this study tell a rich story that enhances existing literature; however, this study only scratches the surface of a critical issue in music education.

## REFERENCES

- Abeles, H. F., & Porter, S. Y. (1978). The sex stereotyping of musical instruments  
*Journal of Research in Music Education*, 26(2), 65-75.
- Brown, B. (2012, September 27). Interview by J. Smith [Personal Interview]. Artistic  
innovations, The University of Delaware.
- Consortium of National Arts Education Associations (1994). *National Standards for  
Arts Education: What every young American should know and be able to do in  
the arts*. Reston, VA: Music Educators National Conference.
- Conway, C. (2000). Gender and musical instrument choice: A phenomenological  
investigation. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, (146),  
1-17.
- Doubleday, V. (2008). Sounds of power: An overview of musical instruments and  
gender. *Ethnomusicology Forum*, 17(1), 3-39.
- Eros, J. (2008). Instrument selection and gender stereotypes. *Applications of Research  
in Music Education*, 27(1), 57-64.
- Fitzpatrick, K. (2013). Motherhood and the high school band director: A case study.  
*Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, (196), 7-23.

- Fortney, P. M., Boyle, D. J., & DeCarbo, N. J. (1993). A study of middle school band students' instrument choices. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 41(1), 28-39.
- Glass, I. (Performer) (2012, November 11). Middle school. *This American life*. [Audio podcast].
- Gordon, E. E. (1984). *Manual for the Instrument Timbre Preference Test*. Chicago: G.I.A. Publications.
- Gordon, E. E. (1986). Final results of a two-year longitudinal predictive ability study of the Instrument Timbre Preference Test and the Musical Aptitude Profile. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 89, 8-17.
- Gould, E. (1994). Getting the whole picture: The view from here. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 2(2), 92-98.
- Gould, E. (2005). Nomadic turns: epistemology, experience, and women university band directors. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 13(2), 147-164.
- Gourse, L. (1995). *Madame jazz: Contemporary women instrumentalists*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Green, L. (1994). Gender, musical making, and education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 2(2), 99-105.
- Griswold, P. A., & Chroback, D. A. (1981). Sex-role associations of music instruments and occupations by gender and major. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 29, 57-62.

- Harrison, A. C., & O'Neill, S. (2000). Children's gender-typed preferences for musical instruments: An intervention study. *Psychology of Music*, 28(1), 81-97.
- Howe, S. (2014). *Women music educators in the United States: a history*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.
- Johnson, C. M., & Stewart, E. E. (2005). Effects of sex and race identification on instrument assignment by band directors. *Journal of Research in Music Education*. 52(2), 130-141.
- Lamb, R. (1994). Feminism as critique in philosophy of music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 2(2), 59-74.
- Macionis, J., & Gerber, L. (2002). Society. The basics. *Sociology*, (4),
- McKeage, K. M. (2004). Gender and participation in high school and college instrumental jazz ensembles. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 52(4), 343-356.
- Payne, B. (1996). The gender gap: Women on music faculties in American colleges and universities, 1993-1994. *College Music Symposium*, 36, 91-101
- Sinsabaugh, K. (2005). *Understanding students who cross over gender stereotypes in musical instrument selection*. (Doctoral dissertation), Available from Proquest Dissertations and Thesis Database. (3175728)
- Tarnowski, S. M. (1993). Gender bias and musical instrument preference. *Applications of Research in Music Education*, 12(1), 14-21.
- Wai-Chung, H. (2009). Gender differences in instrumental learning among secondary school students in Hong Kong. *Gender and Education*, 21(4), 405-422.

Wigfield, A., Lutz, S. L., & Wagner, L. A. (2010). Early adolescents' development across the middle school years: Implications for school counselors.

*Professional School Counseling* , 9(2), 112-119.

Zervoudakes, J., & Tanur, J. M. (1994). Gender and musical instruments: Winds of change? *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 42(1), 58-67.

## **Appendix A**

### **INTERVIEW QUESTIONS**

#### **First Interview: Instrument selection and public school music education experiences**

- 1) Tell me about how and why you chose your primary instrument
- 2) What were your musical experiences prior to instrumental lessons?
- 3) Please describe your elementary band director.
- 4) Please tell me about some of your experiences in Middle School Band
- 5) Which ensembles did you participate in?
- 6) Please describe your social life while in Middle School including any positive or negative interactions that stick out from your time in Middle School Band
- 7) Please describe your Middle School band director
- 8) What made you want to continue band into High School?
- 9) While in High School, which ensembles did you participate in?
- 10) Please describe any interactions, positive or negative that stick out as part of your High School Band experience.
- 11) Please describe your High School band director
- 12) When and why did you decide to pursue music after High School



### **Second Interview: College Experience and Teacher Training**

- 1) Where did you go for your undergrad and what did you major in?
- 2) Please describe your studio as well as your primary instructor
- 3) Which ensembles were you able to participate in? How did you feel about the ensembles?
- 4) Please describe the directors of the major ensembles.
- 5) Did you pick up any secondary instruments?
- 6) Tell me about your teacher-training program. Be as detailed as you can.
- 7) Please describe your experience and knowledge of jazz before your teacher training.
- 8) Tell me about your student teaching experience
- 9) Please describe your cooperating teacher(s). What were your impressions of him or her?
- 10) Were you satisfied with your student teaching experience?
- 11) Tell me about what you did, career wise, immediately after you graduated.

### **Third Interview: Current Professional Life**

- 1) How long have you been a high school band director?
- 2) Please describe your past and current teaching duties.
- 3) Tell me about the other instrumental teachers in your district.
- 4) Please describe your relationship with your supervisor and/or principal.

- 5) Do you feel you are treated fairly by colleagues and students in comparison to male band directors?
- 6) Do you conduct or participate in any bands or groups outside of your teaching duties? If so, please elaborate.
- 7) Have you ever felt intimidated by male directors at festivals, conferences, or profession development sessions? If so, please elaborate.
- 8) Do you ever feel the need to enhance your femininity?
- 9) How much of an impact did your primary instrument have on obtaining your current teaching position, if any?
- 10) What are your overall thoughts, impressions, and feelings about being a female high school band director?

## **Appendix B**

### **FIRST INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS**

#### **Clara Interview 1**

1. I – Okay so I sent you a copy of the interview questions and you were able to look them over, correct?
2. P – Yes. Correct
3. I – Okay, so when we do this, if possible, if you could elaborate as much as possible and try to avoid yes and no answers.
4. P – Absolutely
5. I – Yeah, okay. Alright, so I guess my first question is: What were your musical experiences prior to instrumental lessons and how and why did you choose your primary instrument?
6. P – Sure, alright, so um, my experience with music before I started taking lessons was virtually nothing, my parents are not musicians, although my mother had played an instrument when she was younger. My father is completely tone deaf and the earliest memory that I have with music is just singing along to the radio in the car so I had no exposure to playing an instrument. I had some relatives that played instruments but they were quite

distant relatives so I think I always knew that I could sing. At one point I sang for a little bit in the church choir but I had no experience playing anything whatsoever. In the school program in which I grew up we did not do recorders or any kind of Orff instruments or anything like that. So, I always sang in the choir in school but had zero experience actually playing anything.

7. I – Okay.

8. P – We were allowed to choose instruments in 4<sup>th</sup> grade and I remember the local music store came into school and they demonstrated all the instruments for us and based on that demonstration we got this form that we could take home to our parents and then we told our parents which instrument we wanted to play. So the first instrument that I wanted to play was the trumpet and my parents said “we’re not having a trumpet player in the house. It’s too loud.” I said “okay, how bout the drums?” and they said, “no *way* are you playing the drums.” So I said “fine fine fine, how about the saxophone?” and they said, “okay the saxophone.” So it was actually the third instrument I picked and my whole rationalization as a 4<sup>th</sup> grader was that I wanted an instrument that was cool and to me the clarinet and flute were like wimpy, girly instruments and trombone was too big.

9. I – Okay

10. P - ...so I just picked trumpet and then drums and then saxophone being my third choice.

11. I – Okay. That’s interesting. Okay so you picked the trumpet, saxophone, and drums because you thought they were the coolest?
12. P – Yeah to me they seemed cool. I was always kind of a tomboy so I think that I was drawn to the instruments that to me seemed more masculine than to the instruments that seemed feminine.
13. I – Okay, um-
14. P – Yeah and to me the clarinet and flute definitely seemed feminine and the trumpet and the drums and the saxophone seemed, you know, to me to more masculine and cooler and more fun.
15. I – Okay. When they did the demos, did someone demonstrate or did they have kind of a petting zoo?
16. P – They had us sitting in what was kind of like the cafetorium kind of room so we were like sitting in the audience and they had someone on the stage that would actually play the instruments so we weren’t allowed to touch them or try them but we could look at them and then we heard somebody playing them.
17. I – Was it the same person?
18. P – To be honest, I don’t remember. I do remember sitting in that cafetorium listening but I don’t remember anything about the people that demonstrated except that they demonstrated them.
19. I – Okay, I’m sorry but do you remember, by any chance, what they played? Like did they all play the same thing or did certain instruments play-
20. P – Like the style of music?

21. I – Yeah, like did someone play Star Wars and then another person played a Bach thing?
22. P – Ah, you know what? I have absolutely no memory of what they came in and played. I do remember that what they played seemed very short to me like they didn't play for very long.
23. I – Okay. It's just interesting. I read a study where people came in and they demonstrated the instruments and like a lot of people liked the saxophone but it was cause the demonstrated played Star Wars.
24. P – Haha. That's pretty funny
25. I – Yeah, so they had to go back and had everyone play the same thing so they could make sure that wasn't the reason the kids were choosing the instrument as opposed to gender.
26. P – Wow. And you know that thing that the schools...I'm sure you've either read about this or heard it but where the schools they let the kids try instruments and they make things like trombone, french horn, and oboe very easy to play and they put really hard reeds on saxophones so kids can barely play it so nobody picks it.
27. I – I did not know about that.
28. P – Yes. There are actually schools in my area that do that. And they do that so that they don't get like 300 starting saxophonists and like 1 trombone player.
29. I – Right

30. P – They actually try to talk up the odd instruments and try to discourage people from playing the common ones because they know they're going to get 100 people playing that anyway so they really talk up like tuba and bassoon and oboe and trombone and french horn because they don't want a band of all clarinets, flutes, saxophones, trumpets, and drummers.
31. I – Okay. That's interesting. I didn't know that.
32. P – Yeah. It's crazy.
33. I – Okay. Well I guess we can segue that into...can you tell me what you remember about you elementary and middle school band directors?
34. P – Yeah, absolutely. The gentleman that I had for 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> grade...um, he was very proper. His name was Mr. Richards and he was one of those guys that still like slicked his hair back with that earl cream sort of stuff and he always wore a suit and if you can picture him, he was very like 1950's looking and he was very quiet and tall and thin and very, very serious. But I also remember him being very patient and very soft-spoken. I can't recall him every raising his voice at us or saying anything that wasn't friendly or kind and positive. He was a really a, he's deceased now, but he was a really gentle soul. I had him for 4<sup>th</sup> grade and 5<sup>th</sup> grade so the first two years of band. And you wanted middle school band directors as well?
35. I – Yes please.
36. P – Alright, so in the middle school that I attended, there were 2 full time band directors and there were two part time band directors. So the two full time band

directors, one was a man and one was a woman and they were about the same age. I would say that, at the time, they were both probably in their mid 40's so they had been teaching for some time but they were not near the end of their careers. The guy was a trumpet player and the woman was a clarinet player and they were bubbly, happy, and again really friendly, really supportive people but they were both really big personalities. They always had a silly nickname for everyone and they also both had tempers so when we would be, what you would call "typical middle school kids" they would frequently raise their voices at us but it was never in a way where we thought they were angry. It was in a way where they were trying to calm down crazy middle school kids.

37. I – Okay

38. P – So, I mean, there are probably easier ways to do but I guess what I'm saying is that even though they would sometimes raise their voices or sometimes appear angry, they were never intimidating.

39. I – Right. Okay

40. P – Yeah, and I got along great with both of them. I feel like I had a good personal relationship with them and I don't know if that's because I was a talented player or it was because they have that kind of relationship with everyone but I know that I felt like I had a very good relationship with them. Like they would be the kind of people where now, if I were to call them, they would have no problem inviting me to their home and we would probably talk for hours...because I felt very, very comfortable with them from my three



years of middle school. The two part time band directors, one of them was the guy that I had in the elementary school, and the other one was a much younger teacher who primarily did lessons and jazz band only. The older teachers were the ones that actually did some lessons and conducted the concert bands. And I didn't get along as well with the younger teacher who did jazz band. He, in my opinion, seemed to play favorites, and appeared to be kind of chauvinistic to me. And there were other saxophone players who I knew, who I absolutely knew, that were not as good as I and he seemed to like them quite a bit more than me. So, I mean, he didn't really deter me from doing anything but I felt like he had favorites and I wasn't one of them and I felt like it was because I was a woman.

41. I – Okay, so you played in jazz band in middle school. Was it mostly males in the jazz band?

42. P – Um...I'd say mostly. There was, in my grade, a trumpet player that was a girl and she was a very good player. There were no other female saxophone players and actually know that I think about it, I don't think there were any more females in the jazz band. I remember there was another trumpet player and there was me.

43. I – Okay.

44. P – Yeah, so I was in the jazz band and I was in the concert band as well.

45. I – Were you first chair? Or did they do that in middle school?

46. P – Yes. Yeah, Yeah.

47. I – You were first chair in concert band and jazz band?
48. P – Yes. Correct. Yeah, I was basically first chair in everything since I started playing so...
49. I - Okay. Cool.
50. P – Yeah, and at that point I pretty much only played alto. Some other people had moved on to tenor and bari and I had tried bari a couple times but I preferred alto so I just always played alto.
51. I – Okay. So, did you do, uh, did you do solos and stuff in middle school?
52. P – I remember doing solos in jazz band. Some of them were written out and some of them were improvised. The improvised ones, a lot of us had trouble with, um, the guy who did the jazz band kind of helped us, but the one who helped me more was the male trumpet player, the older full time teacher. He would help me with the solos a little bit. I don't remember having any solos in concert band but I guess that's the nature of the literature at that age level.
53. I – Okay. So just one more question about the jazz band: Did they have non-jazz instruments in it, in your jazz band? Like french horns playing parts that were transcribed or anything like that? Transposed, sorry, not transcribed.
54. P – No we did not, we kept the like traditional big band instrumentation.
55. I – Okay.
56. P – Absolutely.

57. I – So you said some thing about jazz band and about being first chair but do you have any other memorable experiences from middle school, especially in regards to friendships, or just like saxophone specific?
58. P – Yeah, I mean I can talk about...I did audition for Area Band and also for Junior Region band in 7<sup>th</sup> grade and in 8<sup>th</sup> grade and I was accepted into both of those both years and I remember, even auditioning for these honors bands, even Junior Region, being like the entire northern third of Delaware of kids in 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade and I was still one of the only female saxophonists. There was another female saxophone player that I met in 8<sup>th</sup> grade, she played tenor, she lived in Smithville, and she actually turned out to be a pretty good friend of mine and I think because most of the other saxophone players were guys, maybe she and I just started talking to each other more at rehearsals because were the only two girls in the saxophone section and I remember I actually hung out with her outside of the band after the band festival had ended. So yeah, I actually did have some nice friendships because of that but I think I always got along well with the other people in the saxophone section even though they were almost exclusively guys so I never felt like that was a deterrent from having friendships or from being close with the other people in the section.
59. I – Okay, so um –

60. P – Yeah, so I don't know if that was just me or it was because they respected me because I was a good player but either way, I didn't have any trouble having friends in the section.
61. I – Right. So um, just for clarification, and I'm sorry but...
62. P – No it's fine.
63. I – ...You went to middle school in the 80's?
64. P – Yeah, uh, let me thing, yeah my 8<sup>th</sup> grade year, I would have graduated in 1988 from 8<sup>th</sup> grade so that would have been 1985-88.
65. I – Okay, Yeah just so I can get a time.
66. P – Yeah, and it was 6<sup>th</sup> through 8<sup>th</sup> grade.
67. I – Okay, cool. So, um, you made the honors bands in middle school and you continued into high school with saxophone and like you said before, you were still first chair. So was your success at the saxophone the main reason why you wanted to continue playing in high school?
68. P – Say that one more time. I didn't hear you.
69. I – Was the fact that you were so successful at the saxophone in middle the main reason why you wanted to continue playing into high school?
70. P – Yeah, I would say it was. Although I won't say that it was the only reason because when I was in middle school and when I was younger and then also actually party of high school I was playing on town, rec sports teams so I also played soccer in the fall and I played softball in the spring and in middle school I was doing both music and sports. So I was playing on the rec teams in

town, I was playing on the school teams at the middle school, and then I was doing music stuff. And then when I got to high school, I made a decision because it seemed like music in high school was going to be a lot busier than music in middle school so I really took some time to think about how much I liked sports and how much I liked music and even though I think I liked them both equally, I was better at music and I also found that the people whom which I was friends with were not the sports people, like I never really fit in with the sports people and I always fit in with the music people so I'd say it was partially due to my success on the instrument and also due to the activities that my friends were pursuing.

71. I – Okay cool, so can you describe you high school? Like the socio-economic status, the size, it starts in 9<sup>th</sup> grade correct?
72. P – Yeah, absolutely. It's a 9-12 high school. It's a school district that consists of two high schools so it's a two-high school 9-12 district. West Central being one of them and West Southern, which serves Chatham and Morris, being the other one. My high school only served one town; it was only for Pike Creek, which is like the southwest corner of Morris County. The high school while I was there was probably about 1,100-1,200 students total so each grade was just around 300 students, maybe less, maybe like 250-300 students. The town is pretty wealthy, so I would describe it as upper-middle class. The high school was almost exclusively Caucasian. At the time I was there, there were probably a handful of families that were Indian, a handful that were any kind of Asian.

There really weren't any families that were from the Middle East or from South America that I really recall so it was almost entirely upper-middle class and white.

73. I – Okay, and how big was the band in comparison to the school? Was it a large program or a small program?

74. P – In comparison to the program at the middle school or just in general?

75. I – Ha, I guess compared to Cherokee?

76. P – Alright. I guess at the time that I was in the band program, the marching band had about 50 people in it and the concert band, there was usually two different classes of concert band...each one had about 50 kids in it. So you'd think that the concert band was around 100 people and then about 50 people ended up being in the marching band including the color guard. So I wouldn't say it was a humungous program. I'd call it about average sized.

77. I – Okay. So not quite like Richmond sized?

78. P – Yeah, definitely not and definitely not that intensity level. My band director was very much into music for the sake of music and not music for the sake of competition and trophies so it was very friendly, family, type of community atmosphere where if you wanted to compete you could try out for honors bands but he didn't really foster competition among the people in the band itself, he more fostered a sense of unity and teamwork and working together.

79. I – Cool, can you tell me more about the high school band director?

80. P – Yeah, absolutely. I still keep in touch with him, his name is Jerry and I think one of the most important things for me is that he's a saxophone player so I remember very specifically him coming down to the middle school when I was in 8<sup>th</sup> grade and I remember my female band director introducing me to him. Something like, "This is Margaret, she's been in Junior Regions and she's a really talented player, you're going to love having her in the high school." And I remembered as a kid...Jerry is a really big guy, he's very tall and a little bit on the heavy side and he had a really big beard and he looked really scary to me as a kid but he was like one of those big teddy bear sort of guys. He was just friendly and loving and caring. He's incredibly smart. He has a really great sense of humor and he's a very, very talented player I mean he could sit down and...I mean when he was in college he was not a saxophone major, he was a woodwinds major so he could play flute, clarinet, saxophone, and bassoon all equally well.

81. I – Cool.

82. P – So he was very, very talented and very, very nurturing, I mean he would always have time for a lesson and I know frequently I would have lessons after school when everybody else had already left for the day and he and I would sit and play duets and those were our lessons, I mean he was a big musical force in my life.

83. I – Cool. Did you take lessons outside of school?

84. P – I did, yes. I started taking lessons in 8<sup>th</sup> grade and I decided to take private lessons with a guy who primarily taught jazz and the reason I did that was because I felt that in school I was getting more and more classical instruction and that I would be a more well rounded player if I studied jazz also instead of doing what I thought was going to be the same stuff I would do during the school day. So from 8<sup>th</sup> grade and up to and including my junior year I took lessons with the same guy who was a jazz saxophonist.

85. I – Nice.

86. P – Yeah, it was really good.

87. I – So did you participate in any bands outside of school, like did you play in any jam bands or anything like that?

88. P – I never did anything like that. I did get very into jazz in high school and there was a guitar player who was a couple years younger than I who was super into jazz and he and I would kind of like jam together sometimes so like we would take out a copy of the real book and he would just pick a chart and he would just play chords and I would improvise. So we kind of hung out and played a little bit but I was never in a band that had like a horn section or anything like that. I mean I guess I did all the typical high school stuff. I did jazz band, I did marching band, and I auditioned for all those honors bands. So I did Area Band, which is like local, like 35 high schools, and then I did Region which is of course is the northern third of the state and I did All State and I did those every single year of high school. Sometimes I made it in on two



instruments and I had to pick and then my senior year I convinced my band director to let me try out for Region Jazz and I played in that, I played bari. So I did a lot of playing outside of school but it was all in the context of honors bands.

89. I – Which two instruments did you audition on that you had to choose?

90. P – Alto and bari.

91. I – Okay.

92. P – Yeah, and they were always two different solos. And when I was younger, like my freshman year, I was mostly getting into stuff of bari because at that time there weren't a lot of good bari players. Not to say that I wasn't good, but at the time there weren't too many people at the time who legitimately played just bari. And then as I got older I started to make things on alto as well and then I usually picked alto because the parts are better.

93. I – Right. And the solos are usually easier too right? For the bari sax?

94. P – Say again?

95. I – The solos are easier right? Sometimes?

96. P – Yeah I would say so and there was less competition and I had played a lot of bari already because I had been playing a little bit in middle school kind of off and on and then I kind of experimented with it a little more in high school and actually there was one point...I actually just remembered this now...my band director actually put together a saxophone quartet. So he played and then it was me and two other students at the time and we played stuff, now that I

think about, all through high school where it was me and him and two other saxophone players. So I guess I did do a little bit of playing outside of school but it was still a school-affiliated group and we played jazz arrangements...the Lenny Kneehouse sax quartets that they all sort of sound the same but their all sort of jazzy so we would play those after school sometimes. Yeah, it was really great.

97. I – Alright. Were most of your friends in the band?

98. P – I would say that all of my friends were in the band. Yeah.

99. I – Okay so basically your social network was pretty exclusive to the band and you were cool with that?

100. P – Absolutely, yeah I mean I was totally fine with it. I think a lot of kids in high school...everybody is looking for a group to which they feel like they belong and this was an area, not only where the teacher liked me and I liked him and where the other kids liked me and respected me because it was unusual for someone to be in as many honors bands as I was and I would actually say that I was actually the only person from my school that was ever in...actually probably the last one...that was ever in All State for 4 years. So I think a lot of the kids really looked up to me and respected me and that's a really nice feeling to walk in someone where and be liked and respected by your peers, not just your teachers who see you doing a good job so yeah, it was very important to me.

101. I – Cool. So you never felt any pressure or anything negative being the only female saxophonist in high school?

102. P – You know I didn't but I think that's because I set myself apart because I worked so hard and had a lot of success. I think at the time I really enjoyed being different and I really enjoyed doing something that not a lot of women did, I liked carving my own path and to me, the saxophone was part of that because at the time it wasn't...at least from my perception, it wasn't an instrument that women played and I remember I would go to family functions and it would be like "Ah Margaret what are you doing?" "I play the saxophone." "The saxophone? Oh really" and everyone was so surprised that I played the saxophone, I guess because it is stereotypically a man's instrument or at least at the time it was. So there was always kind of an initial shock when I told people I played saxophone but I really liked being different.

103. I – Nice. And your family, they always supported you playing saxophone? They never wish you played something else?

104. P – No, you know, they never said anything like that and they were the first ones to always come to any concerts and to drive me around to my private lessons, they would drive me to all these rehearsals and auditions all over the place all the time. They were very, very supportive of my music and I guess that's just indicative of my parents in that they always wanted us to choose the thing that we liked and pursue it and they were never picky about what that thing was. They just wanted us to find something that we fit into and enjoyed.

105. I – Okay. You have siblings?
106. P – Yes, I do, I have one younger sister, and she's 4 years younger.
107. I – Does she play any instruments?
108. P – She at one point played...she started on the flute...she played in elementary school and in middle school and she played for a year or two of high school and then she found that it really wasn't for her so she stopped playing. So she doesn't play anything any longer, she tried to play the guitar for a little while and I'm not sure she carried through with that, I believe its gathering dust somewhere.
109. I – Okay. Did you play any other instruments besides the saxophone in high school?
110. P – Yeah, I did. I got bored in marching band so I taught myself how to play baritone treble clef so I ended up playing that in marching band for 2 years, my sophomore year and my junior year and my senior year I wanted to learn trumpet so I taught myself trumpet and I was getting into playing in the pit orchestra for the musicals because I did that every year in school as well and of course when you play a lot of the old-style musicals, there's a lot of doubling so I also learned how to play clarinet and bass clarinet. And that I actually got a little help from my band director on but I wanted to buy a clarinet so my parents bought me an old, junker clarinet so I could have one to play. I did play a little bit of flute in high school but I was god-awful so I didn't really play very much. I did enjoy playing clarinet though.

111. I – Okay, cool so your view on clarinet definitely changed from when you were small to when you were in high school?
112. P – Yeah, I mean I definitely think it did. I think I enjoyed it so much in the context of doubling for the shows and to me, it was neat that everybody in the pit played one instrument but the woodwinds played two or three.
113. I – Yeah.
114. P – Yeah, and it was sort of like a badge of honor, like I’m carrying all these instruments and all these cases and all this stuff and it felt really special to be able to play more than one instrument. It was a sense of accomplishment.
115. I – Okay, so when you graduated, did anything or anyone specifically affect your decision to go into music ed? Or did you want to go into music ed at first? I should ask that first.
116. P – Yeah, you know what? That’s an interesting story. I had obviously always loved music and it was always my passion and my thing and it was always wonderful for me but I also really liked science and I really liked the Natural Sciences, especially Biology and I sort of internally debated going into music or pursuing a science because I really enjoyed them both a lot and my private teacher actually told me not to go into music and of course I was like “Why? Why would I not want to do this? I love this?” and he said, “Margaret, music is really different, or anything is really different when its not your hobby anymore and you do it for a paycheck and he said, “I know you really love this and I want to make sure you’re making the right decision and I really think you

should re-evaluate and make sure really what you want to do.” My high school band director, who again was like my role model...my mentor...he basically said the same thing too so I did do a lot of soul searching. In hindsight, I think it would have been good for me to do a little bit of researching into other careers having to do with music. I sort of saw music education as the only way to make money as a music major because performing classical saxophone gets you absolutely nowhere and I didn’t see a performance degree as something I was particularly interested in so I chose music education because I wanted to do music and education seemed like I would be able to get a job. So I will admit that I had absolutely no interest in teaching but it seemed like a good career choice so that I would be able to get work when I graduated.

117. I – Okay, but you definitely knew that you wanted to pursue music?

118. P – Absolutely, yeah. I mean I loved music, I had a lot of success there, I felt like I fit in there with all the music people and the band people, I felt comfortable in that environment. I enjoyed playing my instrument in both solo settings and in band settings, I enjoyed practicing, so there wasn’t anything about music that I didn’t like.

119. I – Okay, well this wasn’t in the questions but could you go into a little bit about your audition, like which schools you were looking at and why?

120. P – Yeah, sure. I did set up a couple of parameters for myself some of which were geographical and some of which were musical. So I knew that I wanted to go away for school, like I wanted to get out of Delaware just to have

the experience of going to college and I knew I wanted to go somewhere that was far enough where I felt like I was away but close enough where if I wanted to come home for a weekend, I could so I set myself a limit of about four hours away thinking that would be reasonable if I wanted to come home if I wanted to but also to get that “at school” experience. I knew I wanted to go to school that was kind of medium sized just because I felt like if I went to a small school it would feel like high school and I went on campus visits with some of my friends that were looking at larger schools like the Penn State’s and stuff like that and that to me felt really overwhelming, coming from such a small town, that seemed pretty scary to me. So with those limits in mind, there were not a whole heck of a lot of schools that fit all of those. Central State College happened to and when I visited the campus, I loved the town and I loved the area, I liked the idea of being in upstate New York so for me it was like a “love at first sight” and this fits what I want. I really had no idea how good the music program was until I got there.

121. I – Interesting...wasn’t it all built around the school of music, the conservatory?

122. P – Yeah, I mean Central State College was originally a conservatory of music and when they moved the rest of the campus out of town and up onto a hill, about a mile away, in the 1960’s, that’s when they started building more things around the conservatory but I guess what was important to me too was that I didn’t want to go to just a conservatory, like people were talking about

New England Conservatory and some other places that I could have auditioned but I definitely wanted a Liberal Arts experience and I wanted to take classes other than music classes all day which is good for me because I got some classes that were music and then pretty much every semester I had one class outside of the school of music so I got to see some other people and I got to experience some other things. So I enjoyed that.

123. I – Cool, so going back to your high school band, can you talk about the gender make up of that, like was it mostly males on the male instruments and females on the female instruments? Were there any other people like you?

124. P – There were not that many. There were a couple of girls that played trumpet, one of them was pretty good, other than that I'd say it was very stereotypical. I mean there were like one or two girls on percussion who were good but the clarinet and flute sections were almost totally women, most of the brass sections was all guys, there was one very, very good french horn player who was a senior when I was a freshman who was a woman but I don't know if that's an instrument that's gender specific.

125. I – Yeah, its gender neutral.

126. P – Yeah, I mean it was very stereotypical. It was what you would expect.

127. I – Did you have double reeds?



128. P – Yeah...I'm trying to think...yeah we had bassoon players on and off, they were usually women, and we had a couple oboe players and they were usually women as well.
129. I – Okay, and the principals, was there any gender differentiation in that? Was the principal clarinetist also a female and principal flutist also a female?
130. P – Thinking back on it, I don't think there were any male flute players, there were a couple guys in the clarinet section but they usually weren't the best players so they were kind of like in the middle of the section.
131. I – Okay, and do these hold true for your elementary bands and your middle school bands?
132. P – You know, from what I can remember, yes. Elementary I just remember being humungous and again I don't remember a lot of guys playing clarinet or flute, which was pretty stereotypical too.
133. I – Okay, so you had 1 elementary school director, 4 middle school directors, 3 male and 1 female, and you had 1 high school band director who was a male?
134. P – That is correct.
135. I – Okay, did you take choir or take music appreciation or anything like that in high school? Or keyboard?
136. P – Yeah, I did choir on and off during high school, I was definitely more interested in band but I did the actual choir class...when I was in high

school there was actually like an 8 or 9 period day so there were a couple different lunch periods during the day and if my lunch period happened with a choir period, I would kind of sing in the choir but I didn't really join choir and then there was one year...it might have been two...where I auditioned for this evening choir called Concert Choir which was like an advanced group so I was in that like once or twice also. So I definitely enjoyed singing and music but band was my primary focus. My high school did offer two years of music theory and I took both of those.

137. I – Okay, was the teacher for that male or female?

138. P – For music theory, the way that we did it at the time, there were two different teachers so the band director, who was male, taught the actual theory and the part writing and stuff like that and the choir teacher, who was also male, taught the ear training and the sight singing so they sort of like split the class.

139. I – Did your school have an orchestra?

140. P – At the time it did, the orchestra program was just beginning and there were only about 30 kids in the orchestra.

141. I – Was it strings only?

142. P – Every once in a while they would add winds but I would say that 80% of the time it was strings only

143. I – Okay, and was that director male or female?

144. P – At the time I was there, it was a male teacher.

145. I – Okay cool, thank you.
146. P – Sure.
147. I – Alright, well I asked all of my questions...I'm trying to think if I wanted to go back or elaborate on anything...um...no...do you want to elaborate on anything?
148. P – No, I don't think so, I think I tried to go into a much detail as I could about most of the stuff that you asked so I don't think so.
149. I – Alright, awesome, okay. I'm going to turn the recorder off, if that's okay.
150. P – Alright. That's fine.

#### **End Interview**

#### **Libbey Interview 1**

1. K: So...hi! I'm Kelly. It looks like you're in your band room. Are you in your band room?
2. S: I'm in my band office, which used to be a closet.
3. K: Okay, exciting. So we'll start with the first question: What were your musical experiences prior to instrumental lessons and how and why did you choose your instrument?
4. S: I've been around acapella music my entire life...like since the womb. We're Church of Christ. Church of Christ does not have instrumental music in its

services, its all acapella music and depending on the church you go to its beautiful so I've been able to hear harmony since I was a little, bitty kid and my parents say that I could sing before I could talk and they like to tell embarrassing stories about me wearing a boa and standing the stairwell trying to sing opera as a 3 year old. I started taking piano lessons when I was 6 and did not learn how to read music for the first 2 years and my parents did not know what until I forgot my music and I went to a lesson and she said "oh you forgot your music that's okay we'll do some sight reading today." And I couldn't point where middle C was. So Dr. Gordon and Dr. Greno told me that was probably the best thing that I could've done for musical development but boy my parents were mad!

5. K: Did you memorize the music?
6. S: I would have my teacher play it first and I would remember it by ear and play it at home. As long as she played it first I could remember how it went and it didn't always work out the best but she would say, "okay lets fix these mistakes and we'll do it next week." So it worked out really well for about two years and probably would have worked out even longer if I hadn't forgotten my music.
7. K: So when did your music program start?
8. S: Well we just had vocal stuff until the 6<sup>th</sup> grade and I grew up in Springville, Missouri and it only had 1 middle school, 1 junior high, and 1 high school and the middle school they had done something kind of new; one side of the

building was the 5<sup>th</sup> grade campus and the 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> grade campus was on the other side. They had a cafeteria in the middle that served as the gymnasium that was for the 5<sup>th</sup> grade. But after school one day all the 5<sup>th</sup> graders trooped over the middle school side in the band room and everybody tested out the instruments all at once and it was interesting...I was actually getting sick at the time and didn't know it which is usual for me. But, I had my heart set on playing saxophone. I was going to play saxophone and then I went into the room and he said, "okay this is how you make a noise." And I tried to make a noise and I couldn't get a single sound out. So I was like, okay saxophone isn't going to work out...maybe clarinet! So I tried clarinet and went to the other side of the room to the guy who was doing clarinet. He showed me how to make a noise and I could kind of sort of squeak out a note...so that didn't work...let me try the flute! I tried the flute, couldn't get a sound out. I couldn't get a sound out of the oboe and by this time I was really disappointed cause...man! I really wanted to play a woodwind instrument! So I went to the bigger band room where they were testing all the brass and I was like okay, I guess I'll try this. Gilliam Raymond, she's still one of the head honchos here in Missouri, she was testing for horn people. She said, "Does anyone want to try this?" And I thought well that looks cool and I held up my hand to try it and she showed me how to make a noise and how to make a buzz and everything and I got a note out on the first try, a huge blast with what was actually a decent tone and she said, "hey can you make that note go lower?" and I did and

I didn't even know how I was doing it so she said, "You're a horn player!" and she said, "Are your grades good because you gotta be smart." And I said, "Yeah, my grades are good." And she said "great! You're a horn player!" But I was still so disappointed because I wanted to play saxophone but horn ended being the right choice cause it paid for college!

9. K: Yeah, I can relate. I play the bassoon. Why did you want to play the saxophone so badly?
10. S: I don't really even remember, I just remember that it sounded really cool and I was like man, you can play all sorts of jazzy stuff with it. I don't even think I had a specific reason, I just thought it looked cool. Now that I've been playing the horn for so long I can't even imagine wanting to play anything else.
11. K: Do you remember how you felt when you were first successful at producing a tone on the horn?
12. S: At that point I was just so tired, I was like, oh that's cool. I was a little bit excited but that was when I apparently started running a fever so I was not in the best of tempers. It would have been interesting to see how I would have felt if I had been well at the time. I did end up missing the next two days of school.
13. K: So how they presented the instruments...did they have a sort of petting zoo? Nobody demonstrated what each instrument sounded like?
14. S: They had a choir and a band concert that the 7<sup>th</sup> graders did in the gymnasium. The band set up on one side of the room and the choir set up on

the other. They didn't really do a petting zoo. They didn't really show off each individual instrument. The band played a couple songs and the choir sang a couple songs to give you an idea of what they did. They actually did the actual testing...Springville has a massive band program and it's a very wealthy district so there were two different band rooms four smaller rooms so there was a room where they were doing percussion where you had to march in time and be able to clap rhythms and they had a room for clarinet and saxophone, they had a room for flute and oboe...I don't think they had bassoon...and then they had a room for all the brass. It was an interesting experience and looking back on it I wonder why I wasn't more inclined to try more instruments. So, I make my kids here try everything. We spend about two weeks and we have every single kid try every instrument. That way I ended up having a girl on tuba and a couple guys on flute and it worked out pretty well.

15. K: Very cool. So you started band in 6<sup>th</sup> grade...so you said there was a middle school, a junior high, and a high school?

16. S: Yes.

17. K: So was middle school 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grade?

18. S: Middle school was 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> grade. 5<sup>th</sup> grade was all on its own. It was the upper elementary 5<sup>th</sup> grade. That was the first time they would take everybody from all different elementary schools and throw them into one building and junior high was 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> and then high school was 10-12<sup>th</sup>. Actually I think it worked out pretty well, I think more schools should follow that plan.

19. K: Yeah probably. So instead of being able to describe your elementary band director, would you be able to describe you middle school band director and then your junior high band director?
20. S: Well I actually moved in 7<sup>th</sup> grade so I had one band director for 6<sup>th</sup> grade and then we moved to Maryland and they do middle school like everywhere else does so 6<sup>th</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup>, and 8<sup>th</sup> grade middle school and everything else high school but I had Ms. Chester and we were really fortunate to have so many talented directors because I had class with just horn players. There were 10 of us and we met the last period of the day. It was fantastic! We were able to focus on individual things that horns have a problem with like we didn't use the same method book as everyone else, we used one that was designed for beginning horn players. She was very patient but very no-nonsense. She would not take anybody's bull and she just kind of had a calming influence and she really encouraged competition and we were all over that. We were always practicing to see who could one-up the other on chair tests.
21. K: So that was your band director? She was a horn player or horn major?
22. S: I don't know if that was her primary instrument but she definitely did a lot of stuff with high brass. She taught the trumpets as well.
23. K: Alright...and did she conduct the band?
24. S: No...we didn't actually have the band all together until the end of the year.
25. K: Okay.



26. S: What they started doing was before school, once we got closer to the concert, everybody would meet together there early and we would get together and play a great big band and I thought it was the coolest thing and I started begging to come earlier cause I got to hear everybody else's parts. I don't think Ms. Chester was the one who directed that, I want to say it was the flute teacher...not entirely sure though. The way that Springville work was that they had two directors at the middle school and one at the junior high and one at the high school but they all went back and forth to each other's schools like the guy who taught at the high school, he would come to the middle school to teach the low brass and the junior high people would come to the middle school to teach percussion so the directors were very cooperative. I wish I could remember who conducted that one...I think it was Ms. Taylor, the flute teacher.
27. K: Okay, so they you said you moved? So did you move to a place with a similar situation or did you have an actual band class?
28. S: Well...it was a culture shock. I went from a town that had 1 high school with about 500-600 people to a middle school...in this county...Southern County...there were 10 high schools and all of them had at least 1,500 students. It was a huge population difference and my middle school had about 800 people in it. It was two stories, it was humungous, and I was scared to death. Oh and that's another thing...as beginning horn students, they started us on single horns...which worked okay but the first day of school in my new

middle school, my middle school band director handed me a double horn and I had no idea what to do with it. I was like, it had an extra button and it has extra stuff on it! How do I use this? And I remember crying after the first day of school saying “none of the kids like me and I don’t know how to play the new horn!” Poor little me. But it worked out alright. I learned the fingerings pretty quickly, he gave me a fingering chart and the teacher there...how they had it was they had it was the 7<sup>th</sup> grade was split into a brass class and woodwinds class. The brass class again met the last period of the day, it had 50 people in it and I was the only girl.

29. K: Wow.

30. S: The only girl and the day it was really brought home to me was one day Mr. Teflon he stopped everybody and he said, “guys, guys, guys stop! I have a really important question.” And everybody’s like “okay, what is it?” and he said, “I’m stuck on such and such level of this video game. How do I get past it?” And I just sat there and rolled my eyes while all the guys were like “you do this and this and this!” I’m still not a gamer person even if I am an uber-nerd. But yeah, it was kind of different. It was a good thing that I was kind of a tomboy because I was able to fit in pretty well...I was able to hold my own. A lot of the guys...well I ended up being one of the guys. It was a lot fun, although sometimes I wished I wasn’t the only girl because the guys would think that flatulence was hilarious and next door, in the other band, all the woodwinds would be practicing and it was all the girls and a few guys on

saxophone and clarinet and they'd be all dainty and stuff and we're over here...all the guys are passing gas and burping and thinking they're having a grand old time and I was like ahhh get me out of here. But it really worked out well having a brass class because we could all hear each other and since our band director was a brass person, he was able to get a little more in depth with us. Well, it was brass and percussion. The percussion were in that room too. Yeah...actually...I think all of them ended going to jail. Not the best percussion section ever. But he was really, really patience. He was also very goofy at times but he could also...I don't remember him yelling much when I was a student of his but apparently he yells an awful lot now so I don't know if that's something that I just never picked up on or if its developed as he kept on directing but he was very, very patient with teaching me fingerings and I ended up taking horn lessons from him until my sophomore year of high school.

31. K: Okay, so did he conduct your 7<sup>th</sup> grade brass class only and you had someone else for 8<sup>th</sup> grade or you had this guy for 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade?
32. S: I had him for 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade cause it was him and it was Ms. Thomas who did the woodwinds and they would take turns conducting different songs on the concert but they would both end up conducting and for 8<sup>th</sup> grade Mr. Teflon took over and we actually had so many people we couldn't meet in the band room, we had to meet on the stage. The stage was our classroom, which was pretty cool cause we got to play in the auditorium all the time!
33. K: Cool. Can you describe him a little bit?

34. S: Yeah...just really goofy. Well with a name like Teflon...none of us could spell it...actually I'm still not sure I could spell it cause it was like T,E,F,O,E,P,F,L,I,N or something like that but we all just called him Mr. T and he was never one of those people to be like oh that's a girl instrument or that's a boy instrument, that's something that kind of stood out to me. Since it was a class of all guys, he ended up running it really informally and we ended up learning a lot of stuff cause he would throw in little tid-bits about history...its kind of hard to remember back on middle school because I think I blocked a lot of it out but I just remember having a lot of fun in middle school band because he really did make band fun. I had an excellent time with it. I need to learn some tips for him because I have 8<sup>th</sup> graders and I'm like how was band ever fun for me? How can we make it fun?
35. K: So were you just in the concert band? Was that the only ensemble you participated in while in middle school?
36. S: That was the only band ensemble in middle school. When I was in 8<sup>th</sup> grade, I was in choir but because of scheduling stuff I had to be in the 7<sup>th</sup> grade choir and I was wishing I wasn't. I was fun to sing and all but...well...I'm trying to think of a way to say this...it got very ghetto. There were a lot of people in there that did not want to be and they would be sitting there talking about stuff...and this wasn't just black kids...this is black kids and white kids...but it was an experience...and I was really glad...but that whole year was a train wreck...our poor choir director...I don't know how I he put up with us.

Because, you got your guys and their voices are changing and they cannot sing bass but they can't sing their falsetto voice they used to and they're really frustrated so...well...the last concert we did for choir we ended up...it was sure a train wreck getting there...the train got to the station barely.

37. K: So do you have 1 or 2 memories that really stick out from middle school band?

38. S: Well, the video game one, that was really sticks out because it was just so typically of the kind of stuff that happened in our class then I remember yelling at my friend Shane, he was the other horn player, well he was the only other one in that class and he wrote in the fingerings for everything and I did until I learned the fingerings and then I stopped but it just annoyed me that instead of playing he would be marking the fingering and I was like, "you should have already learned this dude!" and he kept doing in even in 8<sup>th</sup> grade...I don't know if he ever stopped.

39. K: So, how did being the only girl make you feel?

40. S: Well...some days when they were busy passing gas and burping, it would make me feel a little bit outnumbered I guess and I remember one day there was a girl coming in that was going to play flute and was a new student and she was very stereotypically beautiful. She looked like a high schooler as a 7<sup>th</sup> grader and all of the guys as soon as she left were all like "oh man I wanna go out with her! I wanna date her!" and I was sitting there feeling inadequate because here I've been all year and nobody looked twice at me...so...that was

probably a good think in retrospect...I wouldn't have wanted to date any of them but just little things like that where most of the time I didn't even realize I was the only girl until something like that happened.

41. K: Okay, that makes sense. And in terms of your horn section...were you one of the better students?

42. S: In middle school I was the best. Considering it was the first year playing the double horn, I made district band 4<sup>th</sup> chair...or no...the first year I tried out I made district band 6<sup>th</sup> chair out of 8 and then next year I made 3<sup>rd</sup> out of 8 and I made district band every single year and I got to try out for all state my freshman year but I...sorry my computer is trying to die on me...I got to try out for all state but braces interfered one year and my string broke during the audition kept me from making it. If I had been smart I would have been like "oh no my string broke! Let me try this again!" We had a pretty good horn section in middle school I mean as far as middle school goes. We could get most of the parts out, we didn't have any second parts, it was all first like we were all unison. We did a lot of playing with the saxophones, a lot of playing with the saxophones until 8<sup>th</sup> grade year and we were a pretty good 8<sup>th</sup> grade band...we played music from Braveheart...we played the Irish gig from Titanic...a lot good music that actually let us be more independent and that was a lot of fun. But in high school, I was one of the best in high school but I had stiff competition. The first year I had the first chair all state player who was my section leader and he graduated and then there were four of us in the

horn section in the concert band and we were constantly changing seats back and forth and I always ended beating them for district band but Jeff beat me one year for all state.

43. K: What made you want to continue band in to high school?

44. S: I wasn't given an option.

45. K: By your parents?

46. S: My mom and dad said "no you're doing band, you're going to keep doing band cause marching band is awesome and you will love it." But I was going to stick to band anyway because I really liked playing the horn. I liked the instrument, I liked the music I got to play, I liked having lessons even though I didn't like practicing for them and it was just never something I could picture myself quitting, it was never really an option for me, I never considered it.

47. K: Okay, and just one more question about your middle school...did it have a jazz band?

48. S: It did but since I was a horn player I didn't really qualify.

49. K: Were you bummed? Were you upset that you couldn't play?

50. S: Yeah I was. I was going to try it since I had some piano experience so I thought maybe I could do piano but then he gave me some music to try out on and I was like, "Mr. Teflon I'm not that good." And I tried it a little and it just didn't work out and they ended up getting someone who was a lot better at piano than I could ever be. She ended up being a piano major actually.

51. K: Okay, that makes sense. So once you were in high school, did you have one band director all 4 years?
52. S: Not all 4 years. My 1<sup>st</sup> year, we only had Mr. Townsend and my 1<sup>st</sup> year was a transition year for the high school. The school had been undergoing remodeling and because it wasn't big enough so the 9<sup>th</sup> grade, for many years, had been on what was called the "west campus" which was across town, all the 9<sup>th</sup> grade was there together and he would go over there and teach the 9<sup>th</sup> grade and then come back and teach 10<sup>th</sup>-12<sup>th</sup> grade classes and all of the band people would meet together for marching band I think on the 9<sup>th</sup> grade field but my year was the first year everybody was all together so you still had just the 9<sup>th</sup> grade band and the 10<sup>th</sup>-12<sup>th</sup> grade band. Me and a few other people were really, really good ended up changing that where he let you audition into band but...poor Mr. Townsend...he had so much stuff...he was trying to run a marching band, he was trying to run piano class, he was trying to run a jazz band, he was really into jazz and he taught 3 band classes...I think he taught a percussion class too...very, very busy. I had him for two years, and then my junior year we added Mr. Adams...he was a percussionist...he was the most ADD person I have ever met. We had our own kind of music hallway and while everyone else was going to lunch...for some reason the band had packed up early someone had played (Participant begins to sing melody) and he jumped out of everybody going to lunch and was like "(Participant makes Asian ninja noise)." And then he pulled over his head to make himself look



like a ninja...yeah ADD band director and we had both of them for only a year and Townsend announced that he was moving to Pennsylvania, that was where he and his wife's family were from, so that made sense, because they wanted to have a family and they needed grandparents to help raise babies. They're both band directors. Then Adams ended up quitting and going to dental school and then we got...it was actually a big loss...they were going to do this nationwide search for band directors because we were kind of like a magnet school, a specialty school for the arts that you had to audition to get into so it was really important to get a really good band director. They told us yeah it'll be a nationwide search, nationwide search and they ended up hiring two people from the county one of whom was the specialty center's director's husband and we were like conflict of interest! But nobody listened to us, we were kids. It was really difficult having two new band directors my senior year of high school because Townsend was just this great mentor...I really enjoyed being his student and was so upset when he left because he was just a fantastic band director, very sequential. He would pick out literature that would really challenge you but that also allowed us to learn something else. We played a transcription of a Mendelssohn piece and then for an assignment he was like write a nonsense article about one of Mendelssohn's contemporaries but you didn't get to make up who the contemporary was so you had to learn what a contemporary was and then we had to find out about the time period he lived in so you could know what kind of composer he was and like what a composer

might have been doing then so it really made us think and I really liked that.

We didn't do anything like that with Mr. Spruce and Mr. Bartlett.

53. K: The two new band directors were both male?

54. S: Yup. There were female band directors in our region but they were mostly middle school, very few in the high school.

55. K: Okay, which ensembles did you participate in while in high school?

56. S: I was in the concert band all 4 years, marching band, and I also auditioned the spring of my freshman year for the Southern County Youth Orchestra and I did that for the next 3 ½ years and that actually ended up being a really great experience and it made me a much better player, I had to learn to transpose but it was the second concert I ever did, I was this poor little freshman and I had to transpose Berlioz *Symphonie Fantastique*. I was playing Bb basso on a C horn and I had no idea what I was doing! I brought it to Mr. Teflon and I was like "help me!" It was fun. I mean I look back on it now and it was fun but at the time it was torture.

57. K: Were you continually the only girl in your section in high school?

58. S: Yes...well yes and no. In marching band I wasn't and John graduated after my freshman year and all the other girls that were in the section graduated and then the other girl in the section ended up quitting music all together and went off to do other things and we were all kind of relieved because she was kind of a jerk. It was just me and Townsend told me that he did not want me to be section leader as a sophomore even though you're a much better player than

anybody I have coming in. One of the flute players wanted to play horn so he said what I'm going to do is I'm going to make her the section leader in charge of marching and you're going to be the section leader in terms of playing and it worked out fantastically. Me and Sally had such a great time...it was us and it was 5 freshman guys and we were the Mighty Marching Mellophones. We had mellophone parties at my house. We made t-shirts. We made our own pepperoni bread because my mom had such a good recipe. I had the best time with those guys. It was me and Sally and all of them and we pretty much stayed...I mean once concert season started we all weren't all that close anymore but during marching band was tight.

59. K: Cool. Were you ever intimidated in high school by being the only girl in your section?

60. S: Not by being the only girl. I was definitely intimidated my freshman year but not because I was a girl. It was because the first chair was the guy who was the first chair horn player in all state. He was nice to me...he was kind of a jerk to everyone else. His nickname was Hitler. So the next year me and Sally were just following in his footsteps because she was the marching Nazi and I was the drill Nazi. We didn't realize until we had a German foreign exchange student how other people might see that as very inconsiderate.

61. K: Perhaps. Sorry I lost my thought...so the brass section in your band...was it mostly males? The trumpet, trombone, and tubas?

62. S: Yeah, there were a few girl trumpets. I don't think there were any girl low brass...no I take that back there were a couple of girls who played trombone. Bridget played trombone and she was very good and she kept those boys in line...oh she might not have been the section leader but man she ran that section.
63. K: Do you think that being a really good player...do you think it earned you some respect in your section also so that the guys were more likely to take you seriously?
64. S: Definitely. I don't know if I would have been intimidated about being a girl if I hadn't been such a strong player. But I was better than all of them and I knew it at least until about junior year when they started actually practicing and beating me but we had very interesting chair test days so I managed to stay top of the pack but just barely.
65. K: That's cool that you were able to thrive in that type of competition. That's pretty cool. Can you go back and describe the new band director you had in your senior year? Can you describe his personality?
66. S: We got 2 of them. Mr. Spruce we all loved him. He was very laid back, very fun, but also very conscientious. I mean he really made us learn our stuff and he was very respectful of the fact that we were coming off of a well-loved band director. He and Townsend were friends and if Townsend hadn't left he and Mr. Spruce would have made the best team. It would have been fantastic. I felt grateful that he was that way towards us, he didn't change anything about the

marching band so I didn't have to all new stuff as a senior. They changed a lot after I graduated but by then everybody trusted him and they could get on with it. The other band director was very condescending towards students and I did not like that or appreciate it and that was the main difference. Townsend and Mr. Spruce and Mr. Harper the orchestra director talked to us like adults. He was very condescending. He was actually one of the reasons I got into music ed. I was like I'm sure I can do this better than he did. That's a horrible reason to get into music ed but he would kind of talk down his nose at you and he had written a few pieces that were published and the thought that he had a little more credence as a composer like he was the obvious choice to teach music theory even though the people who had taken music theory 1 had Townsend...we would all kind of sit in the back row and just kind of sit like this (Participant demonstrates sitting with poor posture looking skeptical). We were awful. We would heckle him during class. He would teach us something..."that's wrong!" "No it's not wrong" "Look at the book!" We literally learned this last year. I mean looking back we were really mean but at the time...we were supposed to take AP music theory exam and it was really frustrating for the people who had already taken theory 1 with Morehouse where you learned the very basics and then you did theory 2 learning for the AP music theory test but it was also composition and you had to write all your own pieces. My senior year they combined everybody into one big music theory class and by Christmas there were still violins who didn't know what a

key signature was. These were juniors in high school mind you. So it was very frustrating for us to be in that class cause we had gotten into it because we wanted to compose and then we were supposed to take the AP theory test...hold on just a second...bible class is letting out across the way. My school is in a church building.

67. K: Okay.

68. S: Okay I think it's a little quieter now. It was a month before the AP theory test and we had not seen a single sample test, not a single sample question. Bartlett did not seem to know a single thing about the test except for what day it was and we were getting really concerned because we wanted to do well on this test, we wanted to use it as college credit and I went on to collegeboard.com and it would let you get a practice test but you had to be a teacher in order to access it and I told him that and he was like "well Libbey, I don't have a collegeboard account." And I got so fed up that we went to the music lab and we...we had music lab...that was pretty cool. We had to work on our own projects but instead of working on my project I went to collegeboard.com and I registered as a fake teacher and I printed out a practice theory test for all of us. That was like the defining moment where I was like...I'm sure I can do this better. I was so arrogant. I have been a director for three years and in that time I've figured out exactly how much I don't know.

69. K: Okay, I guess we can use that transition into what made you want to continue and do music ed into college?

70. S. I originally wanted to do composition. It took me a really long time to figure out that I'm terrible at composition cause I can actually hear really great music in my head but actually getting down on paper...it doesn't work out so well. I wanted to be the next great film composer. Howard Shore was my idol, John Williams too. I was like aw I can write great music like them but towards the end of my senior year I was like you know what? These compositions...I'm really not that good at it. I've never been able to pull off a single good composition that I've ever written which I hadn't written much, which was part of the problem. But I think what I ended up doing...I was taking horn lessons with Evelyn...she was a NYU horn major who actually could not play horn anymore because of a muscle disease that attacks your lips but she still made mega bucks giving lessons to us and she got me into college. Because after awhile Mr. Teflon was like "I can't teach you anymore, I'm sending you to Evelyn. She recommended...she was like "you know you don't want to do performance for a living; I can tell that about you." And I said, "Yeah, you're right I don't love my horn quite that much." She said, "Why don't you do music education and get a performance certificate?" So I thought about that and I ended up changing to that when I went for orientation. I made the right choice because I love teaching whereas I do not love practicing nearly that much and I definitely don't love being hunched over a computer trying to get the music in my head out onto some sort of staff paper.

71. K: When you were looking into choosing a school...could you go into some of your thought process and then maybe a little bit of the audition process?
72. S: Like college?
73. K: Yeah. So like in your senior year of college, what was your thought process in choosing a college?
74. S: I didn't have much of one actually. I auditioned for the University of the Mid Atlantic, they had a brand new music program and I liked their music director...he was a pretty nice guy but they didn't have music education and about mid way through the summer was when I decided to switch and I was...no it was before that because I ruled UMA out pretty early because they didn't have music education. It must have been the spring when I decided to switch I just didn't actually do it until orientation at SSC (Southern State University). But I ruled out UMA because they didn't have music ed yet, they only had performance and I auditioned for Mid Atlantic Tech. I loved Tech, loved the people, loved the professor. Wally Easter is a fantastic man...wonderful horn player. But, Tech didn't quite feel like home and it was going to be really expensive for me to go there even with a music scholarship. Then my friend Kelly, she was a senior when I was a freshman in high school and we had kept in touch and she had come over to my house to visit during the summers and she was like "you know, I think you would really like SSU. I think you should check it out." So I did, and I went down there and fell in love with it. I just loved the school of music, I loved the whole atmosphere of it. I



didn't feel like a number like when I was trying to make a decision, Jessica Dale, one of the recruiting people there, she would call me and say "Hey! How are you doing? Your audition still gets talked about." And then my friend Dave...who I actually ended up dating for the first end of high school and beginning of college, he was one of the big finds for SSU and they gave him a massive scholarship to the point where they were told they could never give a scholarship that big again. But since I was dating Dav she would be like "how is my favorite Osprey couple?" She started calling us both that before we decided we were going to Southern but I just felt like a person and it was just the whole atmosphere of the school of music...it felt really friendly and that's changed a little bit now. The atmosphere of the school of music definitely changed the end of my fourth year and beginning of my fifth year. I didn't like all of the direction it was going because it felt like it was getting too big if you know what I mean. Like our band director, Mr. Cooper, whenever new people would come to the school of music like new freshman, he would get our their file, get out their picture to see what they looked like, learn where they were from, and learn their names. He knew the name and face of every single incoming freshman and that's the kind of school that I went into and that's changed a lot.

75. K: Okay so um...

76. S: So I still have a lot of respect for Mid Atlantic Tech. I got along well with their horn studio because Mr. Fruitdale and Wally Easter had played together

in the Marine Band so our horn studios would try to get together every now and again and even if it was in informal stuff like horn workshops. I would have been happy at Mid Atlantic Tech too I think but SSU, it was a lot cheaper to go to, they gave me a lot bigger scholarship.

77. K: Very cool. So looking back on high school, again are there any memories that really stick out? Either positive or negative.

78. S: Some of both. I auditioned for district band as a freshman and nobody thought I would do very well because I was a freshman and the district is huge, we're talking 50 horn players competing for 8 spots and I got in there and I thought I had done a terrible audition and I had been a runner for other people because the auditions were held in my middle school so I knew my way around so I volunteered to be a runner so that only gave thirty minutes to warm up for my audition. I got in there and I thought I did a terrible job and then I came out...I had been in the bathroom crying because I cry when I'm angry...and as I was coming out and making my face look normal again, both Mr. Townsend and Mr. T came and found me and dragged me over to the audition results and were like "Look!" and I was 4<sup>th</sup> chair which meant that I got to audition for all state as a freshman and that was apparently ridiculous to everybody and I was not the only anomaly. The guy I ended up dating who was the big scholarship winner, he was the other freshman who got first chair and I want to say that we were some of the only freshman in the band but that was really cool. I still smile whenever I think about it. There was another time...well we were

playing the Mendelssohn piece that I mentioned earlier, and I wish I could remember what it was. There's a part where there's a horn solo and it has a turn in it and I had just kind of guess what the turn did based on how it looked and we were playing the piece and he was getting really upset because nobody else knew their parts and we got to the horn solo and I played it, and I played the turn and it was the first time I had ever done it and it came out sounding pretty okay and after awhile he stopped the band and he looked at me and was just like, "Thank you. You practiced. I can tell you practiced, you wouldn't have been able to get that turn if you didn't." I hadn't practiced. I had guessed. I should have kept my mouth shut because I said as much to the saxophones next to me and they ratted me out. So then...I have a lot of good memories from high school. We had our mellophone parties, we were the Mighty Marching Mellophone, we all had nicknames like drill Nazi. My friend Jeff Baldwin, we found out his middle name was Baldwin, so of course we had lots of fun with that. We had Bob...we called him Silent Bob...because...well his other name was SBD because he never talked except when he cursed. We would never hear a word out of his mouth and then all of a sudden we would hear some curse word randomly we'd be like "Bob was that you?" My first year, I could get away with making some of the guys do push-ups if they cussed. After that, I couldn't get away with it anymore, they were too comfortable with me. My junior year we played the best music. We played Army of the Nile for march for contest, we played a piece called Suite...well

you may of heard of it...I think it's pronounced like Suite Francis or something like that, has five movements in it...grade 6 piece and we did all grade 6 music that year which was really cool. There weren't many other high schools doing that. Then we ended up with this piece called Morning Alleluia...if you ever get the chance to play it, do. It is so cool. It's a sunrise in Japan, its this guy looking out over Hiroshima and is reflecting over how much it has changed since the bomb and how it's become a thriving city again. Really cool piece and both Townsend and Adams in the same time period...they were both within like two days of each other...one of their birthdays was on the day we had concert festival and the other one was like the day before and we went in there and we played this grade 6 music and we wanted to do well and that was a new feeling for me...and we did, we got straight 1's and that made us qualify for a Maryland honor band for the first time in like 20 years of the school's history. To be a Maryland honor band you have to get a 1 in marching and your top band has to earn a 1 so that was...aw that was cool. We were all freaking out and we were all like "Happy birthday Mr. Townsend! Happy birthday Mr. Adams!" and we sang them happy birthday while they posted score results and then we threw him a surprise party that Monday. We were supposed to be listening to our concert recording and while one of them went to the office and instead of listening, we all went and set things up for a party and I still have some fantastic pictures of Townsend wearing a clown hat sideways with a balloon sticking out of his mouth. Great

blackmail material. His students in Pennsylvania found this picture and he was like, “where did this come from?”

79. K: Awesome.

80. S: Lots of great memories from high school. It was really neat to be in a band that wanted to do well.

81. K: Awesome. So we’re almost approaching an hour so at this point do you want to say anything else in regards to the questions? Anything that we didn’t cover?

82. S: Let me look over them again. Let’s see. Nothing else I can think...well...yeah nothing else I can think of off the top of my mind but if I remember anything else, I can email you.

83. K: Okay, awesome.

84. S: Yeah, I got lots more high school memories that are really fun but yeah...I could go on about those all night.

85. K: Okay I’m going to turn the recorder off right now.

86. **End Interview**

## **Appendix C**

### **SECOND INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS**

#### **Clara Interview 2**

1. I: Okay, well I asked in an email if you could clarify something that you said in the last interview about the band director that you said was condescending and I just wanted to ask what he did or what he said that made you feel that way because it didn't seem to reflect in your position in the jazz band.
2. P: Yeah, I don't think it reflected on my position at all but the things that I remember...of course this was so many years ago...the things that I remember had to do with like going in for lessons or for extra help or just being offered opportunities outside of the band, like for example there was another saxophone player in my grade, his name was Jimmy, he was primarily a tenor player and I mostly played alto so we didn't really compete at all but he was also a very good player and the middle school guy who did the jazz band would frequently offer him a lot of extra help. "Hey Jimmy can you come in during this time I can show you some stuff for your solo. Hey Jimmy I wrote this out for you. Can you check this out?" And he never really did that for me. So I don't think it affected how I did in the band, I just felt that he was being

offered more help than I was or perhaps being offered more opportunities to play just with that teacher outside of the class than I was getting.

3. I: Okay. Well I guess we can jump into the second interview questions. So first one, kind of easy, where did you go for your undergrad and what did you major in?
4. P: I did my undergrad at Central State College and was a music education major.
5. I: Okay. Can you describe your primary teacher?
6. P: Yeah, my primary teacher was Sean Moss. Looking back on it now, I would describe him as strict but incredibly knowledgeable and talented and when I auditioned there, I didn't actually know how good he was and even after I got accepted I didn't realize that he was really a well known name in classical saxophone, not only in Upstate New York, or even the East Coast, or even the country, but that he's pretty much world renowned so...He definitely a wonderful man. I think as I got to know him a little bit better he warmed up a little bit more and I think he was like that with most of us, I think he was very concerned about the teacher-student relationship and keeping that very professional but once you got him in a smaller setting, a less formal setting, like a saxophone quartet rehearsal, he would kind of open up and be kind of silly and goofy sometimes. He's a wonderful guy, I still keep in touch with him.
7. I: Cool. So how were lessons with him?

8. P: Lessons with him were...I actually found them to be pretty difficult because even though I worked hard in high school, I was a very, very big fish in a small pond. I had a lot of success with Area Band and Region Band and All-State Band in high school and I don't think I was ever challenged enough to humble me until I got to college so that was a bit of a difficult transition for me like being challenged and having to work harder than I ever worked before was hard for me so I admire that he pushed me as much as he did. The way they ran things at Central State College was that for music education majors lessons were 30 minutes, once a week and you definitely had to come prepared. If you didn't come prepared you did not get a good grade for your lessons. There were no freebees, there were no gimmes, and he could definitely tell if you hadn't been practicing. He was strict but never in a nasty way or a condescending way, he just really wanted to push people and he told me once in my lesson in my senior year that he felt that if a student hadn't left the college as a better player than he, then he had not done his job which I thought was pretty scary to think that in 4 years we should be better than someone who was so world renowned in the classical saxophone world but that's how hard he pushed us and how high he set his standards.
9. I: How did you get along with the other studio members?
10. P: I got along with all of them really well. Central State College is not known as a really big school for graduate students so the whole time I was there I only remember one or two grad students. The studio usually consisted of about 20-



24 players and with all of us being undergrads, we got along really well. So there were like 3 different bands that you could play in, there was the Wind Ensemble and then there were two other equal bands: the Symphonic Band and the Concert Band so you saw these people all the time whether it was in repertoire class once a week or whether it was in ensembles or in quartets. There was not a big graduate studio so you got to know everybody really well so I feel like I got along with everyone really nicely.

11. I: Were they all male?

12. P: They were mostly male, I think the time while I was there, there were 2 female saxophonists who were a year older than I and there was another one who was 2 years older who actually left school early because she got accepted into the Navy Band in DC and there were one or two players younger than I. So I guess that's about a third of the studio were women, which was new for me because up to that point I had been one of the only women playing saxophone.

13. I: Cool

14. P: Yeah it was really cool.

15. I: What ensembles did you participate in at college?

16. P: You had to be in a band every semester so like I said before, there was a Wind Ensemble and the top players got into that or into the orchestra which I was ineligible for playing saxophone because they didn't really pick repertoire where saxophones played so the wind ensemble was the top ensemble so I was

in that for 2 years, my junior year and my senior year and the other 2 years I was in one of the two equal bands which are called the symphonic band and the concert band. So I had the same conducted by freshman and sophomore year and the same conductor my junior and senior year.

17. I: Okay. Did you play in the jazz band?

18. P: Oh, yeah I did. Central State College actually had 2 levels of jazz band. I played in one or the other almost every semester so they ran it as a semester class, it was not a full year class and I was in one of those almost all the time. There might have been one or two semesters that I didn't because I was busy but I did that nearly all the time. I was in a saxophone quartet most of the time I was there and it was actually the same quartet for like 2 years so it was a lot of fun and then there was one year where I played in the pit orchestra for one of the musicals.

19. I: Okay, cool. So for your bands...could you describe the directors?

20. P: Absolutely. The one I had for Symphonic Band, his name is Harry, and I had him for my freshman and sophomore year. He was actually a string bass player who had just fallen in love with concert band music and he had been one of the band directors at Central State College for quite a few years by the time I had gotten there. I guess I would put him in his early 50's when I had him like however long ago that was...he's since retired but he was also a high school football coach so he had this sort of like big teddy bear, jock mentality about him and was always calling us "guys" like "hey guys, we can do this

better.” He had a very coaching mentality, which I found pretty endearing. I don’t know of anybody that didn’t like him. He was approachable and friendly and just kind of a happy guy although he did tend to berate people during rehearsal if they didn’t play something right but it was usually in a kind of friendly way so he would say some really scathing comment but everybody would laugh about it. He did have his standards and he did push us but he was a really approachable and really friendly guy. The gentleman I had for wind ensemble, George Willows, he has since left Central State College, I think he’s in Cleveland now. He was wonderful. I actually met him when I was in high school because he conducted one of the Delaware Regional bands and although I wasn’t in the band that he conducted, I remember seeing him around. He was this little, tiny guy with a big shock of white hair and lots of energy. He was just dynamic on the podium. He could get stuff out of a band that I’ve almost never seen from anyone else before. He was very picky and very demanding but also very friendly and almost a little too friendly with some of the female students sometimes but that never really bothered me and I don’t think I got along with him any worse or any better because of that.

21. I: Just like...old man cheeky comments?

22. P: Yeah stuff like that and actually I mention this here...I don’t know if you’ll want to include it but he actually ended up leaving Central State College because of a scandal with a student and it was actually someone who was a friend of mine but again I never felt like he treated me any differently or

treated anyone else any differently because of that or because I knew the girl who was involved with that so I actually feel that he was fair, and friendly, and kind and I actually did an independent study with him on wind band literature because it was a half semester class and it wasn't offered any other time I could take it so when I actually had some time he let me take this independent study with him. So he was really generous to me that way. Very nice guy.

23. I: My cat just tried to break in, I'm sorry.

24. P: I was wondering what the heck that was. Okay.

25. I: Alright, so did you pick up any secondary instruments and play them seriously in college?

26. P: I didn't really do too much in college I mean I picked up clarinet in high school enough so that when I played in the pit I was proficient enough in both high school and college on clarinet and bass clarinet that I could do that. I never took any lessons on them in college. I had played a lot of brass instruments while I was in high school whether it was in marching band or just on the side but I never studied them formally. I guess the most exposure I got with them...the way they ran the secondary program at Central State College is that on every secondary instrument, you had a semester long class and then you had to pass a proficiency on that instrument so the ones that I already knew, those classes were quite easy for me so I guess to an extent I did play some but not to the point of taking lessons on another instrument.

27. I: Okay. I guess going back...can you describe the directors of the jazz ensembles before we go on to teacher training?
28. P: Yeah, sure. His name was Sal White and he was one of those cool jazz cats who would always speak to everyone and be like “hey man, yeah we’re going to do this.” He had this sort of laid back, husky sort of voice and it was common knowledge that he would invite students to go see jazz gigs with him and everyone would smoke pot in the car and he was really cool and really hippy and just the absolute nicest man you could possibly imagine. So I not only respected him a lot, he was a guitar player, and a very fine player, but I feel like I learned a lot from him. He was always willing to help you out with solos or go over changes with you or just run down a chart. The jazz program while I was at Central State College was not terribly big, so I think that perhaps he had a little bit more free time than other professors so it was never an issue if you made an appointment and just wanted to go over some stuff or talk about a recording you heard. He was again, just really approachable and just a really kind man. I liked him quite a bit and I learned a lot from him.
29. I: Nice. So the next question is about your teacher training. So tell me about your teacher training including methods courses that you took, you talked about the tech classes a little bit...mostly I’m interested in the methods courses.
30. P: We did have to take class voice even being instrumental music ed. Usually you took that your freshman year, just to get some experience. We also had to

take class strings, which most people took opposite their student teaching because it was only a half semester class so I did have classes on those as well. I remember having an elementary music class, which I just detested. I just could not get into the little kids, could not get into like the sing-song things or the orff instruments, or any of that. I just didn't interest me much. The teacher had supposedly written quite a few texts both college and otherwise on elementary music so she was apparently very good but it just wasn't my cup of tea. I remember observing some elementary classes. They were both choirs and instrumental ensembles like orff instruments and recorders and things. We didn't actually get a lot of experience teaching that. When we did our first student teaching experience, it was during our junior year and it lasted all year round and how they handled it at Central State College was that you were broken into groups of 3 or 4 with 1 supervising teacher and also once a week that teacher would drive you to a local elementary or middle school and you would have experience teaching kids private lessons. The way they did it was that you had 3 students: 1 that played your instrument, 1 student that played an instrument in the same family as yours and 1 student who played an instrument from a different family. So I remember having a saxophone student, a trumpet student, and I had a percussionist student too. So there was one point where I had a percussionist but the percussionist quit so I got a clarinet instead so they tried to give you some instruments you had experience with and some instruments you didn't know and sometimes you got observed by the teacher

from the school where you were student teaching and sometimes you got observed by your teacher from the college. Like I said, that lasted for a whole year and the way that my placement worked, the school where I was placed, something had happened so I was only there for half a year along with 3 other kids from Central State College so we actually transferred to a different school for the second half of the year. But it was nice because you got to develop a little relationship with the kids and we hadn't had any experience doing band at that point but we were taking conducting classes and I guess we had all the regular psychology classes like everyone else would have. You know like the child abuse seminars and the drug abuse seminars and all that. Your real student teaching experience happened your senior year and it lasted for half a semester. And for that experience, you as a student got to choose when you wanted to go and I chose the last half of the semester of my senior year I guess cause at that point I had gotten really into instrument repair and I had taken a bunch of instrument repair classes and I really enjoyed them and I was actually considering pursuing a certificate in instrument repair which Central State College did not offer so I figured I wanted to student teach at a time when I would not do marching band and I would not do the musical and I wouldn't have tons of extra-curricular commitments because I wasn't completely certain I wanted to teach at that point. I mean I loved all of the secondary instrument classes and I loved doing those lessons but I didn't feel like I wanted to do like a high school band director job at that point because the repair thing just

became really appealing to me. I was also really interested in music theory and was considering going into a masters program in theory at that point so I decided to chose to student teach in a semester where I wasn't so busy. The school that I was placed was like the premier student teaching placement. Centralville high school is in the Center County School District and it is one of the biggest music programs in the state of New York. I was actually there with another instrumental student teacher from Central State College and I almost never saw her and we were there at the same time because they have 3 full time band directors and she was with the brass guy and I was with the woodwind guy. My cooperating teacher was an asshole. He was chauvinistic, he got the kids to respect him because they were scared of him, he screamed and yelled all the time and was constantly raising his voice, always, always, in lessons and in rehearsal and my impression from that, just to sum it up was that if this is what good teaching is supposed to be, than I'm never going to teach. So my student teaching experience was awful...absolutely terrible. He would let me conduct the freshman band and then when he got observed, he would put me in front of the wind ensemble so he could show off his wind ensemble to the teachers from Central State College and I had mentioned before that I was really into music theory, loved music theory, but he wouldn't let me do anything in the music theory class because he wanted to do that himself. So he would let me observe but he would never let me teach anything, even though it was theory 1 so I left student teaching with a really bad taste in my mouth.



31. I: Okay. Can you elaborate a little bit more about your cooperating teacher?

How was your working relationship with him?

32. P: I felt like my working relationship with him was actually pretty decent. He usually left me alone like he would observe me doing stuff the first couple of times...for example, when he had kids come in for lessons, he would do the lesson and then kind of like hang out in the background and offer suggestions but after 2 or 3 times he said “you know what Margret? I feel comfortable letting you do these lessons and I’m going to go do something else.” So he would spend that time doing his prep work and I didn’t even see him on the days I did lessons like he was just off doing whatever which in some ways was flattering to me but in other ways it made me feel as if he didn’t really care what I was doing because I felt like if he wanted to help me out or offer a suggestion, he would have stayed around so that I could have learned something. But instead he chose to do something else, which again, I will take as a compliment that he felt comfortable leaving me with his kids but I don’t feel like I learned a lot from him. Just like for the freshman band, it was wonderful to get some podium time but I don’t feel like I learned a lot rehearsing that band during the day and then rehearsing a different band when I got observed when I didn’t know those kids as well and the literature was much harder to conduct so I’m not sure I got a lot out of it that way.

33. I: Did he offer good feedback?

34. P: To tell you the truth, I don't remember him offering much feedback at all.

He seemed pretty happy with what I was doing and he didn't really offer a lot...I got an A+ from him but I don't know if really saw me do a lot of stuff and I know there were things that I could have done better but I felt as if he didn't really suggest them to me. I guess sort of the icing on the cake to this situation was that a very good friend of mine, who was also a saxophone player, had done his student teaching in the same school the year prior to me and he went during marching band season and he and the cooperating teacher ended up being the best of buddies and they did all this stuff together and the cooperating teacher let my friend Matt do all these jazz bands and all this extra stuff so I was expecting to go in there and just get tons of experience and when he didn't let me do a lot I just felt like, "wow, I don't know why I'm not getting these opportunities when my friend was here just last year and he got all these opportunities from the same teacher.

35. I: Did you ever ask him?

36. P: The teacher or my friend?

37. I: Ask the teacher.

38. P: I did press him about the music theory thing because that was an environment where I felt incredibly comfortable and the only answer we ever gave me was that I just like to do this class myself. I don't know...perhaps he had a student teacher who he wasn't happy with the theory thing or I don't know...

39. I: Okay. Was he respected amongst his peers at the district?
40. P: The impression that I got was that he was. There were some of his students at Central State College as music majors while I was there and they all loved him and some were men and some were women so as a teacher I think they liked him quite a bit, I think he was respected because of the quality of his program but I'm not sure how much he was respected as a person. I never really heard anything about that and I'm not sure I would have while I was teaching there but just because the program was very successful, in so far as how many kids they had and how many awards the marching band and the jazz bands and the concert bands had won at festivals and competitions, he was respected in that way.
41. I: Okay. Did you have a supervising professor? Like one person who would come and observe you while you were student teaching?
42. P: Yeah, I did. I never really felt like I got to know her very well but she offered me a lot more feedback than he ever did and I feel like the comments she gave me were useful and appropriate so I do feel like I got a lot from her. She was helpful to me.
43. I: Did she teach the instrumental methods class?
44. P: No, actually her only job was supervising student teachers. All of the instrument classes...you mean as far as the secondary instruments? Those were all taught by the teachers who actually taught that instrument at Central State College, or they were taught by grad students if the teacher happened to have a

grad student that semester. So I would say that about half the time I had a grad student for those and the other half I had like the actual clarinet professor or the tuba professor, which is really pretty awesome to learn those instruments from people who were masters on those instruments.

45. I: Cool.

46. P: Yeah, it was great.

47. I: So I have a question, but I guess you already answered it...were you satisfied with your student teaching experience? I mean you said you weren't so what do you think could have made it more satisfying?

48. P: Well I'll back up and I'll say that I think it was good for me to see a program that was so different from any program that I had come but I think I would have been more successful if I had been at a program where I had a better relationship with the cooperating teacher and also perhaps a program that was a little smaller because I think that one of my strengths is my personality and getting to know the kids and really making a connection with them and that was difficult for me in a program that large. There were just so many kids that by the end of my student teaching, I just had no idea who they were because I just never saw them because the program just had hundreds and hundreds of kids in it. So I think if I was at a program that was a different size, I would have felt more comfortable and like I said, if I had a better relationship with the cooperating teacher that might have made it easier for me. But I think part of the reason that I got placed with him was that he was a saxophone

player also so maybe they thought that would give me something in common with him but he was just such a different person than I was that we didn't really have any common ground even on just an individual, person to person level. We just didn't really have much in common.

49. I: He also sounds very different from the teachers that you had while you were going through music ed.

50. P: Yeah, I guess he was and like I said, I think it was good for me to see that because I see programs like that around where I teach now and I have colleagues that I see at like honors band auditions that teach in programs like that and it's just not for me.

51. I even know it now that I just do not enjoy programs like that so I guess it was good, I learned what I didn't want which is a good thing.

52. I: Okay, so were you also satisfied with your teacher training as a whole at Central State College?

53. P: I would say that I felt more satisfied and less satisfied in certain aspects. I was never really comfortable conducting and I think it took my first teaching job to get my comfortable on the podium. That was something in which I zero experience until I went to college even though my high school band director had given us the opportunity to do that sometimes, I never took it and I'm going to chalk it up to a maturity thing, I just think I needed to be older to be comfortable doing something like that. I was never a great public speaker either and I think being the center of attention on the podium at that point in

my life was not something that was good for me. I think as I started teaching, that became something that I really enjoyed and really grew into but I don't think I got enough experience during my teacher training or during my student teaching. As far as secondary instruments are concerned, I felt way over prepared and I even look at colleagues of mine now who are graduating from teacher training programs and they don't get nearly what I got at Central State College as far as playing other instruments. So I still feel very comfortable sitting down with a high school kid in a lesson playing trombone with them, or clarinet, or flute, or really anything but bassoon but luckily I don't have any bassoon students right now but I can sit down and play with probably  $\frac{3}{4}$  or kids or I can play something else in the same key or transpose fast enough where I can play with them in a lesson. So that's something in which I feel very, very comfortable so I think it varies.

54. I: Okay, so you have an extensive background in jazz but did you ever go over jazz in an education setting in your methods classes?
55. P: You know, not until I took a couple graduate classes a couple summers ago because even though I did jazz and some private lessons and I always played in jazz bands, there wasn't anyone who ever talked about how to teach jazz or how to teach jazz band or how to teach kids improvisation or how to teach kids how to swing or different styles so I think I was very lucky to have a background like that because I don't know what people do when they have to teach a jazz band and they play a non jazz instrument...like I really don't know

what they do...I have no idea because it must be so difficult. I did not get any teacher training that talked about how to teach jazz band.

56. I: Okay, so my last question is what did you do career wise immediately after you graduated?

57. P: I worked in retail. I was so disgusted in my student teaching that I could not imagine ever teaching and I actually probably didn't play my saxophone for 3 or 4 years, it just sat in the case. I stayed in Central State College for 1 year and I worked at this family-owned like deli, bakery, catering place, which I adored, it was a fantastic job and then one of my best friends was moving to Boston to start a masters program at New England Conservatory and she was looking for a roommate and I had no idea what I wanted to do so I moved there with her and then I actually worked in retail there for 3 years so I spent 6 years after my undergrad doing nothing in music at all. And then I sort of had an epiphany and thought well if I ever want to teach, I have to do it soon because a provisional teaching certificate only lasts for 10 years and then it becomes null and void so I said okay, if I ever want to teach I should do it now. So I decided to pursue teaching 6 years after my undergrad so I started teaching at a local music store and I was doing lessons there, I was doing private lessons. I got hired for a part-time position at the school at which I now teach. They had this adjunct program where they had someone who came in during the day and just taught lessons so I did that and then when the position at Cherokee was advertised, I applied for that, as well as for many others, and they called me in

July for the program because the person that they had originally hired had declined so in July they had no teacher to start in September so they interviewed me and hired me like within an hour. So I think it was just right place, right time, I think it was just good timing and that was a great place for me to get back into teaching because not having taught for so long, I didn't want a big program and that was perfect because it was so small, it was an easy commute, and I felt like it was kind of a no pressure situation because of the size of the program. So that was a very comfortable fit for me and I definitely enjoyed being there, but it was a difficult community in which to teach so when the opportunity came for me to teach at my ala mater, I took that and then a few years after I left, they eliminated the full time high school band director position at Cherokee so it worked out very well for me.

58. I: Was the reason that you went so long before going into teaching, was it solely your cooperating teacher?

59. P: I think that was some of it. I think so of it had to do with me not doing enough research about fields in music before I enrolled in a music education program because I loved music...well not past tense...I love music so much and I knew I wanted to do something in music because I considered some other fields but I knew that music was the field I wanted to pursue and I just chose music education because I didn't really look at anything else and I knew that performance was a stupid choice as a classical saxophonist. So I went into that degree not fully understanding or perhaps not fully thinking through what it



was going to entail when I graduated except that it was a way to have a music degree and have a job at the end of the graduation process instead of having a music degree that didn't really give you anything like a straight performance degree for example. So I think it partly had to do with that and as I said before I had gotten into instrument repair and kind of considered doing that so I think that was part of the reason too. I think some of it was that I just needed a break, that all that time of very intense practicing and playing perhaps just burned me out a little bit and I think I needed a little time away from it to appreciate how much I loved it and how much I missed it.

60. I: Okay, do you think your cooperating teaching not allowing you to teach theory and not involving you in as many things as he did your friend, do you think it had anything to do with you being a female?

61. P: I think it did and perhaps I'm making connections that aren't there but to me there were so many similar things between my friend and I that also did his student teaching there that that's one of the only reasons I can really pick out because I don't feel as if my friend was a better player than I, I don't think he was qualified to be a better teacher than I was at that point and the only thing I can think of is that maybe they just got along better but I'm not sure. I mean, like I said, perhaps I'm making connections that aren't there but that strikes me as part of the reason that he didn't let me do things.

62. I: Do you think that he took you seriously while you were on the podium conducting the bands?

63. P: I will say that he was respectful when I was on the podium like he would just kind of hang out in the back of the room or just leave the room. He definitely treated me in a way that the kids respected me while I was on the podium if that makes sense.
64. I: Yeah. So I just want to know how it makes you feel being a female conductor when all your band directors that you had were male like how do you feel about that and how does it effect how you command a classroom?
65. P: I'll address the classroom issue first. I think that no matter what you teach and what age and what gender you are, you have to find a way of addressing the students that fits your personality and I think there are a lot of teachers, especially young teachers who try to be friends with the students and they try to get the kids to something they like to do like "hey guys, lets do this now." And like "alright buddy, we're going to try to do this." And they try to be too friendly without having enough of that teacher-student line that needs to be there. I think conversely, there are teachers who try to be too strict and the kids rebel because it just doesn't suit their personality. So I think for me being successful in the classroom is having a mix of being strict when I need to be but also being fun. I had a student and she's a music education major now at James Madison and she told me last year in music theory that...and this was at the end of the year when she had decided she wanted to be a music education major...she said "you know what Schaefer? I just love the way you work in the classroom because we can have fun with you and we can talk to you but we

understand when it's time to get work done." And to me, I just thought that was one of the best compliments I could have received. So I found a way, that for me works with my personality so that I don't have discipline issues in the classroom. I think a big part of that is actually not ever yelling because as soon as you lose control like that, it doesn't mean anything. If the kids always have a thought that maybe you might raise your voice, I think they're always scared to push you a little further. I don't think that being a woman has too much to do with that at least not from my standpoint. And you had asked something earlier in that question...I don't remember what it was though. It was something about being a female high school band director or being a female band director and having mostly male band directors?

66. I: Yeah, so I guess what I'm try to ask is that you try to emulate the teachers that you had like sometimes what works for a male in terms of conducting a band just wouldn't work for a female so I guess do you run into that at all?

67. P: You know I'm not sure I run into that where I am now because my feeder district only has 1 middle school, the kids start playing their instruments in middle school, and the middle school band director is a woman so the kids that I have had only had female band directors. Now it might be different if I were in a district that fed me from a school with male teachers but maybe it's different because of that...or maybe it's not, maybe that's just the way it is and that I has nothing to do with it...I don't know.

68. I: Okay, just 1 more broad question. Was there anything in Central State College, like any memory that you had, positive or negative, that was directly related to your gender?
69. P: You know, not that I can think of. The only division I ever felt, and I don't know if this is relevant to what you're asking or not, was that there was always competition between performance majors and education majors and I did always pride myself on being an education major that played as well as the performance majors. I guess there must have been enough females in my studio that it wasn't that big of a deal. I always did feel like...and actually maybe this is relevant...in every jazz ensemble in which I played, I was usually like 1 of only 2 or 3 women. So in the jazz world, I think some of that is even still true now, in the jazz world there is definitely a gender gap and I don't know if that is because of preconceived notions about playing jazz or about exposure to jazz or maybe the instruments people are playing and their use in a jazz band, I'm not sure but I was always one of very, very few women in jazz band especially women who played bari. So I think it always caught people by surprise when I was playing bari but nobody ever said anything to me specifically gender wise about it.
70. I: Well, alright, I don't have any more questions. Do you want to go back and elaborate on anything or think of anything else?
71. P: I can't think of anything now but if I think of anything I'll make sure I shoot you a message or an email or something.

72. I: Okay, cool. I'm just going to turn the recorder off.

### 73. End Interview

#### Libbey Interview 2

1. K: Alright let's start off with a nice, simple question: Where did you go for your undergrad and what was your major?
2. S: Southern State University. I was a music ed major and since I didn't know when to quit, I also had a performance certificate and I had a Spanish minor and I was in the Honors College. That's why it took 5 years to graduate.
3. K: Okay, that was my next question. You were there for 5 years?
4. S: Yup.
5. K: Did you have the same horn instructor all 5 years?
6. S: I did. We always joked that the only thing that would stop Mr. Pepperfield was death and well that's what ended up stopping him.
7. K: Can you describe him?
8. S: Terrifying...terrifying is a good word. He seemed so nice and sweet when you first met him, when you were an incoming freshman and learning about the school and then you were actually in his studio and...well...he likes to weed out the weak...only the strong survived. There was 1 guy who quit after 2 lessons, changed his major completely and never went back to the School of Music again. But he was a *good* teacher. I don't really agree with all his

methods but the one cool thing about how he taught was that he distilled everything down to a science like if you're going to teach a horn player, it's going to come naturally to you so you're going to figure out how they struggle with it so when they have this problem you have to do this, when they have that problem, you're going to do this. But he expected the absolute best out of you. He did not accept excuses. He called them "e" words and they were banned from the studio and if you knew what was good for you...if you messed up you would just grin and bear it and face it like a man because there was no other way you got away with it with dignity.

9. K: Did you have to practice a lot?
10. S: Oh good grief, yes. I did not practice near as much as I should have because there were couple times where I got away with a couple of hours a week but that's on top of rehearsals for orchestra and marching band and concert band. I would have been so much better if I had actually made more time to practice but I didn't.
11. K: Can you go into a little bit more about how he was in the lessons? You said he was terrifying and that he didn't take any excuses but can you go into a little bit more about his personality? Any other traits that jumped out at you?
12. S: When you walked into your first lesson with him it was like a test. He would assign as much as he could possibly cram into 1 lesson just to see how much you can handle. So I was about to hyperventilate after the first lesson. I mean he was very, very stern but he was still nice and until you finished your

freshman year he was going to be pretty brutal like he would mean and grumpy and grouchy and a lot of people absolutely hated him. But a lot of it he did for show too because to quote “I have a reputation to uphold.” After your freshman year and you kept going with it and you proved yes you were serious about learning how to play the horn, then he got a lot nicer. The older I got, the nicer he got to me and that seems to be the general pattern for the studio. Well there were certain things that he...my accompanist didn’t know the music one time and he kicked him out! He said, “Do not come back here until you know the music!” He would not accept any excuses at all and if you came into a lesson with him you better know your stuff there will be hell and with me, since I didn’t practice as much as I should have, there was hell a few times. I remember 1 lesson in particular, I had had an exam and 3 papers or something that week and I had had rehearsal every night and I had a stigma and I just did not have that time to really focus on one of my etudes and I made the mistake of saying that I didn’t have time to do this one and he just got this look on his face like oh boy you just opened a can of worms. And he was like “what are you going to do when you’re teaching? Are you going to tell your principal that you don’t have time to do lesson plans?” That always stuck with me. Even though I am teaching now and I still have to tell the principal that I have no time to do lesson plans. Just a second...my computer is trying to die on me. There we go. Charger to the rescue...sorry I should have figured that out a few

minutes ago. I didn't realize it until it said you are running on reserve battery power. Okay, there we go.

13. K: Yeah I just asked: Did you like him?

14. S: It was a hit or miss kind of situation. I didn't always like him but I always respected him if that makes sense because there were some times where he was just legitimately a jerk and everybody in the School of Music acknowledged it. The other horn players in the other studio acknowledged it. Like in the symphony, if there was a 3<sup>rd</sup> horn solo, and he was the principal horn, he would take the 3<sup>rd</sup> horn solo. He would say okay you're going to play this part during that part and I'm going to play the solo and I'm just like that's not fine, I can't think of another situation where you would do that. Of course I haven't been around that much so I don't know. Just little things like that I didn't agree with but in general I will always have a lot of respect for him because he's a fantastic educator...he was...I'm still not used to the fact that he's gone you know? I mean it seemed like nothing could touch him. He's an ex-marine, he played in the President's Own. He was 6', just gigantic. He could hold him arm up and I could walk under it and still have clearance. We have this building in the way far off part of campus, its called Capstone, and it was a dorm and they had a couple of classes there too but he once told me, he said I made it from the Capstone to the School of Music in 13 minutes just to prove I could. I looked at his legs and I looked at him and I said Mr. Pepperfield I am not gigantic, it takes me 25 minutes. He kind of laughed at that. He had a sense of



humor. There was one year for...I think it was Halloween, it was on a Monday when we had masterclass and I was student teaching so I didn't get to part of the gig or no...it was April Fool's Day...I think it was April Fool's Day. Whatever it was, I was student teaching and the studio dressed up like him. They all wore ties with shirts and they all put fake beards on and dyed their hair gray. It was really funny. No, it was the Halloween after I graduate, that's what it was. So I was very jealous that I wasn't there to participate.

15. K: Did you get along with the other members of your studio?

16. S: Most of them, yes. There were 2 in particular that absolutely loathed me and I don't know why but I ended up loathing them right back. They were twin brothers...Shamus and Shawn. They were both horn players although Paul shouldn't have been although I shouldn't say that...that's mean. I don't know why they hated me so much but even the rest of the studio said that he doesn't treat anybody else like he treats you. I had to go to the hospital this one night because I thought I was having a heart attack, you can ask Julia about this actually, but I couldn't breathe and my chest was all tight and stuff and it ended up being costochondritis but I missed rehearsal on Monday and on Wednesday I was about to ask him to drive me back to the emergency room because I had to drive myself back but I couldn't take the pain pills and all he could say was "you missed this note!" and "what kind of transposition is this? What part are you supposed to be playing?" He didn't know that something was wrong until the next day when I came to school high on pain pills. I saw

him in the hallway and was like “Hey Shamus! How are you?” And that’s when he was like “Is she okay?” Yeah she’s just high. But we did not get along. We were not necessarily arch enemies but we kind of loathed each other and it was made pretty awkward because I’m pretty good friends with Shamus’ fiancé and Shawn’s wife. I was not invited to the weddings needless to say. But they were really the only ones I didn’t get along with. I got along with all of the SIA sisters just fine, I was the only TBS sister in the studio because I liked my jeans and t-shirts and they all wore pearls and cardigans. There’s really only one other guy I had issues with and that’s just because he had a lot of social anxiety issues and because of that he wouldn’t bathe because he was scared to go in the shower with other people. That wasn’t just a me problem, that was an everybody problem. Actually, one time with him was my absolute favorite memory of Pepperfield because Kerry Turner came and did a masterclass with his quintet for our horn studio and Justin, this guy, he was very monotone, very like withdrawn and he would never talk louder than a low rumble. I mean he was always talking in a monotone. He played his Mozart excerpt for Kerry Turner and he said, “You know that was really good, really good technically but it had no emotion in it, I mean when you speak you use inflection, you rise and fall with your voice.” And we were all sitting there trying not to laugh because Justin doesn’t use inflection, he plays like he talks. We actually ended up losing it, Pepperfield had to leave the masterclass because he was trying so hard not to laugh. And he asks what kind of horn do

you play? And Justin is sitting there holding his Conn and he just kind of goes...\*participant holds up imaginary horn\* so he could see the thing on the bell and I've never seen Pepperfield's face turn that red, it was hilarious. I guess you had to be there but it was one of my favorite memories of the horn studio in general.

17. K: Were most of the members male?

18. S: No it was a pretty even mix

19. K: Okay.

20. S: It was about 50/50 and I actually think that the girls outnumbered the guys by the time I graduated.

21. K: Alright, cool. Did you enjoy that after going through middle school and being 1 of 50 in your brass class?

22. S: Yes and no because I wasn't really used to dealing with girls. Girls are catty. Girls are mean. Even though there were times where we got along with each other, we just did not understand each other because I'm one of the boys and they are not. In general we got along really well so it didn't matter that much but I still feel more comfortable in a mixed crowd than I do with a bunch of girls. I guess that's kind of weird but too much estrogen in a room makes for unhappy people.

23. K: Which ensembles did you participate in while in your undergrad?

24. S: I was in the marching band, the concert band...well I was in a concert ensemble every semester, there was...I forget what they're called now...the

top band and the bottom band and the U band which was for non-majors. I was always in the bottom band, which was okay because we played better music. But finally, my last year, my 5<sup>th</sup> year, we got a new band director because Cooper retired and we figured out how much he had rigged the system to put certain people in certain spots because he would always manipulate the chair standings so he could get who he wanted in his band and the new guy did not do that and I was 3<sup>rd</sup> chair in the top band and it made me sit there and wonder what my standing would have been if Cooper had left earlier. I still have a lot of respect for Mr. Cooper but that is one thing I did not agree with. It was pretty sweet to be in the top band. I was also in the orchestra. I like orchestra, occasionally I like playing in an orchestra, I did not like SSU's orchestra. In my opinion, my youth orchestra was better. I mean my youth orchestra, we played Mahler, we played Barber, we played really cool stuff and the SSU orchestra played lots of Brahms, lots of Mozart, I think the funnest thing we played was Rossini *La Gazza Ladra* and we did *Symphonie Fantastique* once. I was just never really a fan of the orchestra and that's probably one of the reasons why Patrick didn't like me because he was principal horn in the orchestra. And the last year I was in it, I was his freaking assistant so not only did I have to be in the orchestra with him, I had to sit next to him and he had to tell me which parts to play. That was torture for both of us. We wonder to this day if Pepperfield did it to us on purpose. But to give you an idea of how things went sometimes in the orchestra, our director's name was Dr. Robert

Freeway, and the last year I was in it was my junior year, and we were playing some scenes from Carmen and we were going to do a one out concert with them and the woodwind players didn't have parts and we're playing this piece and he suddenly stops and he says, "Woodwinds, why aren't you playing?" I said, "We don't have parts sir!" "Yes but you know how it goes don't you?" "Yes sir." "Then why aren't you playing?" "We don't have parts." "But you know how it goes." "Yes." "Then why aren't you playing?" "We don't have music." This went on for 10 minutes! Finally the principal bassoonist said just pick a key and go and once it sounded terrible he stopped and said, "Woodwinds, do you not have music?" We said, "No!" and he said "Oh!" and he called over a grad student and said go get their music. It was just things like that all the time that make for really funny stories but make for really exasperating rehearsals.

25. K: Were the directors of the major ensembles...were they all male?

26. S: No. Well my first year you had Mr. Cooper was in charge of the top band and then Dr. Sawyer was in charge of the bottom band and I loved Doc to death. He was an amazing band director and he was hilarious. He was inappropriate in a lot of ways. Oh my gosh, no wonder this soup isn't freaking cooking, I didn't turn the burner on. It's been a long day. But Dr. Sawyer...we were playing Persercetti...I forget which piece and the tubas needed mutes, which is kind of a big expense, you can't expect a bunch of college kids to have tuba mutes so they went and asked him if they could get some through the

school and he said, “Well you can use a flute player but you’d have to put her in head first because she might like the vibrations.” Just stuff like that was highly inappropriate but at the same time hilarious. Even the flute players thought so but we never told any of them about that statement come to think of it. Just stuff like “Trumpets! I can play louder than that on my clarinet and I have asthma.” But Dr. Sawyer, big kind of guy, got kind of messed over because his tenure didn’t get renewed but it should have so he ended up having to leave and he ended up teaching at the local high school where he got paid a heck of lot more than he did at the University. His place was taken by Rachel Bishop, who was for a very long time, my hero. We called her Darth Bishop because she knew exactly what to say to cut you down but at the same time motivate you. She would just pause in rehearsal and just be like, “Trumpets, how long have you had this music? Yeah, you should be embarrassed.” All she had to say was that one comment and the next rehearsal they would come in and they would know their stuff. She was very, very effective on the podium, not so nice in person I found out. They say you should never meet your heroes and I think college professors sometimes that’s the case too. And the marching band director...the first 3 years I was in marching band the director was Mr. Greg Billups and then the last year it was Sergio McDonalds who I also did not get along with but that’s because he left all of my student teaching observations until after the semester had officially ended. That’ll ruin a relationship there. Then he had the gall to give me a B in student teaching. I

mean you didn't even see it. It was the day after Spring Break when you came to watch me speak. I mean, how is that going to work? I generally got along really well with my professors. I love Dr. Sawyer, Mr. Cooper still thinks the world of me apparently, Mr. Herr who took over after Mr. Cooper...very good professor, very, very nice. I didn't get to know him very well.

27. K: Did you pick up any secondary instruments while you were in college?

28. S: Not any good ones. I mean I could play a trumpet but that's because I knew how to play brass and it came very, very easily to me. I didn't actually take a class for trumpet or anything, I just did it and actually I did a lot of that after I came here as far as learning random fingerings and stuff. But I played flute, clarinet, baritone, oboe, and percussion, and trombone. Out of all of those I can successfully play baritone, I can play trombone as long as I practice it before I show my students what I'm supposed to be doing, and as far as clarinet and flute go, I'm a lot better at clarinet now but you still don't want to hear me play flute. I know enough to teach it. I can't demonstrate it and that's why I have  
\*participant says something that I cannot understand.\*

29. K: Did you learn those in your tech classes at school?

30. S: Yeah, we had...you had to take a single reed and a double reed, you had to take trombone, a piston valve instrument, horn if you weren't a horn player, and you had to take percussion. You could do that in a few ways. You had two winds classes that you had to do, winds 1 and winds 2, and you would learn 1 instrument in each of those classes, and the rest you would learn...percussion

you would learn in percussion tech, and the rest you would learn in individual classes that met...I think once a week at like 8:00am, which was torture when you've been to an orchestra rehearsal to 10:00pm the night before and still had to do homework.

31. K: Yup, I feel you.

32. S: I was late to clarinet class just about every time by a couple of minutes. I tried so hard to be on time but I never did manage it.

33. K: Did you have to take a strings class? Or a voice class?

34. S: Yeah, I did have to take strings. I forgot about that. I should think of that too, one of my good friends is a strings teacher. It was just a general strings methods class. I did violin, was not good at violin either. I brought it home over spring break to practice for the final and I thought this only happened in movies but I played so badly that I heard cats screaming outside. That's not something I'm proud of but it is funny. I had strings and then we had a voice class but it was...I thought...the way it used to be before I took it was that it was a class where you would learn how to teach singing. But the year I took it, it was well we're going to teach you how to sing. I already knew how to sing so that class was worse than useless. It was a 1 credit class that I could have done on my own and it just really annoyed me. The only thing I did learn was the parts of the like resonators in your head. That was it. I was really disappointed that we didn't learn more about how to check somebody's range,



or how to warm up a choir, stuff like that. Like that would be really useful now especially since I'm teaching elementary music.

35. K: Okay. Piggybacking off the tech classes, my next question is: Can you explain your teacher training in detail about the methods courses that you took, you talked about your tech classes but...yeah what kind of methods classes did you take?

36. S: Well the first thing you were supposed to do which I ended up not doing until my junior year was you took a practicum and that was sophomore year after you got all your gen ed's like music theory and stuff out of the way and you did that to actually get into a classroom with kids and work with kids so that you could see before you got too far into your degree program do I really want to teach? Because some people took that class and were like this is not for me. So the practicum...I don't remember what all we learned in there, I just remember going and helping teach at Foote Middle School every now and then. We did observations in it. It was basically just observing teachers and seeing how it was applied. And then you would and then you would take another practicum...I guess it wasn't really a practicum...yeah it was a practicum before you student taught, I think it was the semester before you student taught, you were supposed to take it. The way that worked was that you read stuff like Habits of a Successful Band Director and you learned the basics of how to do a budget and the basics of this is how you should plan a band field trip. Honestly we should have spent a lot more time on that instead

of doing Dr. Seaford's research projects because what we did for the practicum was you had to follow his research methods to see like...you'd video yourself teaching a band for 5 minutes of people on secondary instruments which is always fun. Like you had to count how many times you blinked or like how much time you spent on the music versus how much time you talked, which was instructive the first time and after that it just got old. So that class, I feel like it could have been more geared toward practical stuff like how to fill out paperwork or how to incorporate standards from other disciplines into a music class, stuff that they don't teach you and that you find out you're supposed to know once you get into the field. Those were kind of the 2 practical classes. You took music history, which was interesting. Medieval history was my favorite. The teacher for that, her specialties were medieval history and punk rock. I'm trying to think now, I wrote all this down earlier.

37. K: Did you take conducting?

38. S: Yes. Thank you. I took 2 semesters of conducting and conducting 1 we had with Dr. Bishop and that was really good. I learned a lot in her class. Then conducting 2 we had with Dr. Groth who has the stiffest wrists ever. He told us if you're doing it like me, you're doing it right and we were like according to Dr. Bishop...

39. K: Was Dr. Bishop the band director?

40. S: Yeah, she's the lady. She taught the lower concert band, she teaches a lot more now, and she did conducting, and she taught some grad classes but I'm not sure what they were.

41. K: Okay.

42. S: We took Band Methods and Materials which...ow! Burned myself! Sorry about that.

43. K: No problem.

44. S: What it was supposed to do was you made a notebook of different band pieces like band pieces you would want to teach and the different resources that are out there like the different band books like the Tim Walter-Heifer books and Habits of a Successful Band Director and Blueprint for Band and all these different methods books and band director books and conducting books, things like that. But the semester I took it was the one right before Cooper retired so...I mean we still did the work but we didn't have to hand in a notebook and I still regret that because I still have all the information but it's incredibly disorganized and I can't find it. In Winds we did notebooks that I still use frequently. In Winds was the class where you learned secondary instruments and we would have like Brass Day and Woodwind Day, just days where you would learn just individual days like the intonation tendencies of an instrument or how humidity effects a reed or stuff that I didn't actually know, the absolute basics of trouble shooting what's actually wrong with your players, if that makes sense. So we had that, we had conducting...

45. K: Did you have instrument repair?
46. S: No. I went on my own and did an instrument repair course because the University of North Texas has a big instrument repair program there and they came out and did a workshop for band directors here and I asked to be able to...no it was on a Saturday, I didn't have to miss that. I went out there to learn as much as I could and it was very informative and if I ever get the chance I'm going to go back to UNT and take the actual summer long course because it was very good and I learned a lot.
47. K: So did you have like an elementary band class and then a secondary band class and did you get into general music at all?
48. S: My student teaching was very strange because most people will do half a semester at a middle school and half a semester at a high school. My middle and high school were next to each other and they had block scheduling at the high school so you only had two band classes, then you had a planning period and you had a piano class and that's it. So it would have been absolutely useless for me to have stayed at that school all day long when I would only have two band classes. So I started the day at Foote Middle School with the 7<sup>th</sup> grade band...or no I would start at Railway with the high school band and then walk across the parking lot to Foote and do the 7<sup>th</sup> grade band and then walk back over to Railway for the concert band and then walk back over for...I think it was 6<sup>th</sup> grade, 6<sup>th</sup> grade band. I learned a lot that way, it kind of prepared me for the job I have now where I'm constantly moving somewhere.

It did make for some interesting days where I forgot...my schedule depended on the day of the week so there were sometimes, especially at the beginning of the semester where I got very confused. My middle school teacher, mentor, instructor person, he was fantastic. He had been teaching for 20 years. He knew all sorts of tricks, he knew how to get the class to pay attention to you. I'm still learning because I would remember back at how he did this when this and this happened. The other teacher is not in band anymore. He is doing something else in the music field but I have no idea what happened to him after I graduated. From Mr. Roberts I learned everything to do and from Kurt I learned everything not to do. It was very constructive.

49. K: That was the high school teacher?

50. S: Yes. Part of the problem was that they shouldn't have put me at that school because Kevin was only 3 years older than me. I was student teaching in my 5<sup>th</sup> year and in my freshman year he had been the mascot but we didn't know each other but we knew of each other so he's barely older than me.

51. K: Can you describe their personalities a bit and their teaching styles and how well or not well they worked with you?

52. S: Well Kurt...I cannot call him Mr. Healsen, not when I went to school with him. He was kind of neurotic I guess and he had a really hard situation because none of the kids liked him and in a school of over 700 people he only had maybe...I don't know... I think the entire band was 27 people. It was 9<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> grade. So that really wore him down. He looked a lot older than I

remembered and that just kind of came out in the way he behaved because he obviously cared about the kids but he couldn't get them motivated, he could not get them to try and that's not a problem anymore because whoever took the job after him, they won state. I'm still not sure what winning state means in Southern State because I did band in Maryland but apparently it's a big deal. I guess neurotic was a good word for him and also...not quite disciplined like he was making the program for the spring concert an hour before the concert. He was late just about every morning. I mean I'm usually 2 or 3 minutes late but I don't have a class first thing in the morning. Just little things like that. Now Mr. Roberts on the other hand, very calm, I mean he was kind of stern but he also knew...I mean he knew what exactly to get out of a student and my favorite expression from him was that motivation was all about knowing when you need a pat on the back and when you need a kick in the butt and he knew exactly when you needed a kick in the butt or you needed a pat on the back. That went for his students, that went for me. I mean he just had it down to an art form. It amazed me what he could get out of those kids. He also had a difficult situation because instrumental wise he had the band split up into 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade which is what I'm having now...yay. If they wanted to have any rehearsals with everybody they had to have them after school and they had to compete with athletics. Thankfully the athletic people were a lot more understanding than they are in some schools so they would let them do like half of cross country practice and then go to band. He was just very, very calm

and he wouldn't take any nonsense. If somebody started misbehaving in class you got like 3 strikes and you're out and they had a really good discipline system for their enrichment people so like band, art, and P.E, and stuff where they had this point system so if you got 3 points that day you got a note home or if you got 70 points a week you got a note home, I forgot the exact scale but he used that to great effect and it worked really well to keep kids in line. I try to use it at my school but if I'm the only one using it, it's not very effective and I was not very good at enforcing it. Just a big guy...I think one of the things that...I mean this is a personal preference I guess but Mr. Roberts was very obviously Christian in every way that he lived his life like in the way he treated his students and the way he treated his co-workers and the way he treated me. Kurt was very obviously not and I think that was reflected in both of their teaching styles if that makes any sense.

53. K: Can you describe your working relationship with them?

54. S: Great relationship with Mr. Roberts, decent relationship with Kurt. It started off really well and then as I went along I realized how little he knew what he was doing and it got a little bit worse. I mean I graduated on good terms with him and I have no idea what he's doing now. I tried to get in touch with him but he never responded. But Mr. Roberts...I actually haven't talked to him in a while but I'm going to be back in Southern State this summer and I really want to catch up with him. I haven't seen him since I graduated. He was just such a big influence on how I teach.

55. K: Cool so you had a good relationship with him at least and he was a good mentor?
56. S: Very good. He has been the single most important...I keep noticing myself picking up mannerisms from him that I never realized that were from him until I think back on it and go oh Mr. Roberts did that. I do that with Pepperfield too and Dr. Bishop.
57. K: That was your horn teacher?
58. S: The first one was my horn professor.
59. K: Okay cool.
60. S: But yeah he said...what did he say? I think he said you're cruising for a bruising.
61. K: Did you have like a supervising professor who oversaw your student teaching?
62. S: Yes...I think you can tell how well we got along. Things went kind of downhill before he was even assigned as my advisor because of some things...well lots of reasons...I had tried to go conditional in TBS and had not actually been told that I had been placed as inactive until August so the decision had been made in May so Mr. McDonalds was the new sponsor. He was supposed to help me figure that out. I mean I sent him the parts of the constitution...never heard a word about it. He came to a chapter meeting where I came and I wrote another letter asking for you know, for somebody to help me out so that I could at least become an alumni member and this is after I had sent him University



emails and stuff like that...as I was leaving the room he was asking people what is she talking about? We just did not communicate well at all. I mean he wouldn't communicate with me and I made the grave mistake of making him the advisor for my senior thesis and if I do a thesis again, if I go for my masters, I'm going to pick much more carefully because I couldn't trust him...I mean he never asked for updates or stuff like that. I couldn't trust him to read updates if I sent them because at the time he said my emails disappeared so it got to the point where I would send relays through facebook to try to get in touch with him because he wouldn't answer his phone, I left messages at the office, we just did not get along and then I found out one of the reasons things ended badly with Dr. Bishop, she was my second reader, and he never got my final draft back to me and she said you know what I think my agreement to be your secondary reader has expired because you haven't given me your final copy and I said I don't have it. I don't have his comments. I found out that he had gone to Atlanta that week and he had just left it on his desk. It had been ready for over a week and I never got it. It was just things like that constantly and like when I was applying for jobs, all the jobs now want you to send electronic references. They won't let you mail in a reference letter. You have to send it electronically and I could not get him to realize that because he would say give me an address and I'll send the letter and I said well you can't and he said I don't want you to read the letter, well unfortunately I'm going to have to. I mean I can't really send an anonymous thing and you can't

send the thing or I mean you can't send an envelope, they're not going to read it so he never wrote a recommendation letter for me to get a job. I got that from Mr. Roberts and Dr. Seaford who had done the practicum stuff and he wrote a recommendation letter for me. Just insane stuff. He and I...well then he didn't schedule my...he scheduled one observation mid way through and I thought okay, he's actually doing what he's supposed to but no. The other two, he schedule one after the other and one was on the last day of my semester and one was the day after so it was the Monday and Tuesday after those kids got back from spring break. What a great day to have an observation. Just thinking about him makes my blood boil a little bit. I don't think he's at USC anymore and I don't think there is anybody that would miss him. Just the way he did things, he wouldn't communicate.

63. K: So frustrating supervising professor, one good cooperating teacher and one average.

64. S: Yeah, even though I had a bad cooperating teacher in Kurt, being at the other school with Mr. Roberts was totally worth it. It was completely worse that whole semester of frustration. Just the fact that I really enjoyed learning from him.

65. K: Cool. So I guess were you overall satisfied with your student teaching experience?

66. S: Overall, I think there were some things to be desired. I mean I wish I could have gone to a high school where somebody knew what he was doing. But

overall I think it was pretty good. I mean like I said, being able to teach with Mr. Roberts was worth it. But I found out how much I don't know and I found how much SSU should teach but it doesn't. Like until after I graduated, they didn't require you to take an elementary general music class. Well, my first job I didn't know I was teaching elementary music until I got there. Just things like that about the overall program that needed to change and I think they are in the process of changing...just the way they teach theory and sight singing...because I didn't understand any of it until after I graduated and I took a summer workshop about Music Learning Theory so you can thank Julia for that one, she talked me into that.

67. K: So they didn't have elementary music methods?

68. S: No, they did. You just weren't required to take it.

69. K: So it was I only want to teach secondary band so I'll take those classes. Is that how it worked?

70. K: Yeah, like I took marching band techniques...that's another one I forgot...probably because McDonalds taught it and I blocked it out. That was another useless class because I mean I kind of sort of learned how to use pyware and I learned the basics of copyright law and I didn't learn anything else. Whereas I don't know a thing about marching percussion or color guard and the people who had taken it with the previous band director had learned all of that. Like you would see them in the quad doing color guard drills. I forgot where I was going with that train of thought. As far as all that, the person who

was in charge of elementary music was Dr. Valley, you've probably heard her name...no? She covered a bunch of books with Gordon. Apparently she's pretty big in Music Learning Theory circles. Her big thing is early childhood education like 2 and 3 year olds, which was amazing to watch. Then she...then you would also take elementary classes from her and Julia took them and I did not and I had really wished I had taken them with her instead of marching band techniques because that's what I ended up teaching, not marching band.

71. K: Okay could you go a bit more into what you wish your school taught? Like you said you wished you had taken an elementary music class. Do you feel like you got enough time on your secondary instruments and that you learned all the styles?

72. S: Good grief no. I never learned anything of jazz. My knowledge of jazz is about this much and I feel like that's a huge gap in my education. Definitely did not have enough time on secondary instruments. Of course part of that was I didn't practice enough but one semester is not enough to learn the nuances of clarinet when you're going to teach at the high school level and you want them to play grade 5 music. It's just not enough. That's why I'm sticking to middle school for a good long while yet that way I can learn the instruments and I can start broadening my knowledge base. I wish we learned Music Learning Theory from the get-go because I had no problem with sight singing but I could not translate sight singing to theory. Like I could see a bunch of stuff on a page, I could not tell you what it meant. I couldn't tell you what it sounded

like and now I can do that because I've learned enough about Music Learning Theory to get the hang of it. That's another big gap I've got so I'm having to learn that on my own. So elementary music, huge gap there...I think we should be required to take at least one preschool class and I think the degree should be 5 years long because most people take 5 years anyway at SSU because there's just so much...so much. So if you're going to make it, you might as well make it a 5 year program so you don't kill yourself trying to graduate. As far as curriculum mapping...like planning out what your band should play...never learned any of that. I think that's what I was supposed to learn in the methods like the band methods and techniques...the class where we looked at all the method books and stuff...but I never did. Just little things like that that don't seem too big until you're actually teaching and like oh man they did not prepare me for this, I didn't realize I need to know this. So there's a lot of things...we kind of took an exit survey and we all pulled resources, we all discussed it amongst ourselves before we graduated like what SSU should be doing differently and then after we graduated we sent notes to the people who were mapping the curriculum, Dr. Seaford and Dr. Valley that said these are some things we have noticed, can you fix them so the future people don't have to do this? The biggest one is really curriculum mapping because I don't have the faintest idea of how to really do that and I haven't gotten the chance to learn because I'm not just a band director, I'm a history teacher. I'm more like a full time history teacher, part time band director to be honest.

73. K: So you said you got very little jazz experience and because you play horn, you were never in a jazz band right? So did you go over jazz at all in any of your methods courses.
74. S: Nope. Not a bit.
75. K: Any improv?
76. S: None. Any improv I learned after I graduated from Music Learning Theory workshop. That's just a huge, huge gap that they really need to do.
77. K: Okay so my last question is what did you do career wise immediately after you graduated?
78. S: Well I started sending out applications everywhere and beyond. I was aiming for Texas and missed by a mile. Basically I worked at Books A Million and I moved back into my parents house and I prayed for 3 months until I finally got an interview in July and I got the job offer about 3 days later and then I moved out here, sight unseen a week before school started. Never doing that again. That was rough. That was very, very rough. We picked a very bad time to graduate because they had cut a lot of teacher retirement and teacher benefits and stuff like that so none of the old directors were retiring. Since they weren't retiring, there were no jobs for us so of the class of 14 of us, I think only 4 had a full time job by August and the 4 that did, only 1 got an in-state job. All the rest of us had to go out of state, Julia went to Georgia, I went to Texas. It was a hard situation to graduate into so it was hard to get a career started really.

79. K: Okay so you jumped right into the teaching...you never thought about getting a masters after graduating?
80. S: I couldn't afford to get a masters degree right away and I wanted teaching experience before I did it because from what I hear from the grad students, it means a lot more when you get the experience first. So I listened to them.
81. K: Cool. I want to know a little bit more about your major ensemble directors. I was interested in the female one and then the one that did marching band. I guess what I'm looking for are their personalities and how they were respected on the podium.
82. S: The marching band director...the first 3 years was not very respected. He pitched temper tantrums on the podium. He was kind of a drama queen. One of the moments I will never forget is the jazz band had a concert and their report time was 15 minutes into band rehearsal and he made them come to rehearsal anyway and then when they all left 15 minutes in Mr. Cooper happened to be there that day. He just..."This is baloney Mr. Cooper!" And there were several people who came as baloney for Halloween that year because of that statement. He pitched fits a lot and I mean you're conducting on a field, you gotta conduct big and he would conduct like this \*participant demonstrates small conducting gestures\* and he would say, "Why aren't you giving me any dynamics?" Because we can't see them. To me he seemed a little bi-polar. He had really, really good days and he had really, really grouchy days so it was hard for me to get along with him. I think I could have liked him as a person

but I didn't respect him as a director and that was the general sentiment. It also didn't help that he got involved with a student. That kind of messes up your reputation right there.

83. K: Right. Was the female band director really respected?

84. S: Yes and not everybody liked her but you respected her because she was very, very good at what she does. She could take the worse sounding group and turn it into something spectacular. McDonalds was not invited back to be the marching band director after my last year. She took over the athletic bands and the sound difference was incredible. I heard them on TV and said wow we never sounded like that. She was very, very driven and she knew exactly what she wanted and she knew exactly how to get it and she would make sure that you would follow that plan whether you wanted to or not because there were other people counting on you and you had to hold up your end of the bargain. I mean driven is a really good word to describe her.

85. K: How old was she?

86. S: I actually don't know. It was kind of hard to tell.

87. K: Like middle aged?

88. S: Like mid 30's maybe? Mid to late 30's, maybe early 40's. Really, really not sure with her.

89. K: Okay.

90. S: Billups was the marching band director my first 3 years. He was young. I mean he had two kids that were like 10 and 6...lived with his ex-wife. I don't



know. Dr. Billups he could be very, very nice. He could be the nicest person ever and then I'd do or say one thing wrong that I didn't even know I was doing wrong and he would just blow up like I heard old SSU marching band recordings from before I got there and there was an arrangement they did from the Bridge of Cazadoom from the Lord of the Rings that was really cool and everybody said we really liked it and the audience liked it and we wonder why we never play it anymore. So I had a list of suggestions for marching band for next year and I wrote down I know that Dr. Sawyer did this arrangement of Lord of the Rings. Could we do that again? And he looked at that and all he saw was Dr. Sawyer and he said, "Look at that! How do you think that makes me feel?" And I'm like what are you talking about? And then I figured it out that he thinks I prefer Dr. Sawyer to him and I'm like I'm a freshman. I've never had Dr. Sawyer as a marching band director. So it was just stuff like that where whenever I would get some respect for him he would have an instance like that undermined it completely. I also learned a lot of what not to do from Dr. Billups.

91. K: Okay well that's the end of my questions. Is there anything more that you wanted to elaborate on?

92. S: Not that I can think of. After I read the transcript I'll see if there's anything big that I missed for this one and let you know but I could go on all day about college stuff but a lot of it is the kind of stuff you wouldn't be interested in. You know, just stories and TBS, it doesn't really involve the professors.

93. K: Yeah if you can think of anything about student teaching or about your teachers.

94. S: Well one of the high lights was, well I said we called her Darth Bishop sometimes, there was a reason we called her Darth Bishop, there was this idiot named Andrew VonCamp who played sousaphone and he was a very lovable idiot. Everybody loved him even though we all knew he was an idiot and he had played up that reputation. He knew exactly what he was doing. So maybe he wasn't that much of an idiot but he came for Halloween...we always had a big Halloween cookout, and he came dressed up in a darth vader costume, the only thing different about it was that he found a wig that looked exactly like Dr. Bishop's hair so it was Darth Bishop. And she got a kick out of that. Let me know if there if there is anything else you want to know. I'll try to get that back to you. If I don't get to it tonight, it's because I'm doing laundry and I'll get it to you tomorrow while I'm on planning period.

95. K: Okay, that's awesome.

**End Interview**

## **Appendix D**

### **THIRD INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS**

#### **Clara Interview 3**

1. I: Okay! How long have you been a high school band director?
2. P: I'm currently in my 11<sup>th</sup> year of full time teaching all of which has been as a high school band director.
3. I: Alright. Can you please describe your past and current teaching duties?
4. P: Sure I guess I'll start with current. During the school day I teach two class periods of concert band. They combine for the concerts and I have about 90 kids total and its split pretty evenly among the class periods. This year I'm also teaching fundamentals of music theory, which is also a full year class. That has about 21 students in it and that's designed to be a prerequisite for the AP theory class, which I will be teaching next year. In addition to that I have two periods of lessons and then the rest of my day is either prep periods, lunch, or what we call department duties is which where you can meet with other people in your department to discuss ordering or lesson plans or something like that. Do you need to know things outside of the school day as well?
5. I: Yeah. Do you do marching band or anything like that?

6. P: Yeah. So this year, which was different for me, I was co-director of marching band. I split the stipend with a former student of mine because I'm working on a masters program at Rowan University and I thought I couldn't dedicate all the time I needed to so I actually did marching band half time but it's a non-competitive marching band that only rehearses once a week so it wasn't that bad. When marching band ends, which is usually right around the end of November, I start jazz band, which rehearses 1 night a week for 2 hours and I also conduct the pit orchestra for the musical, which will be starting as soon as we go back to school. In my previous job I did pretty much the same thing except sometimes I taught an intro to piano class, which I also teach sometimes as my current job, I'm just not doing it this year, and I also taught kind of like a world music class, which I tried to introduce to my current job but there just weren't enough periods in the day for me to do it.
7. I: Okay so you teach concert band, marching band in the fall season, and then jazz band. You do the orchestra for the musicals and in the past you've taught piano and kind of like music appreciation/world music/history?
8. P: Yeah you could call it that and I guess how many kids I have that are eligible, I do take kids to audition for local and state and regional honors bands when I have kids who are ready for that.

9. I: Okay, awesome. You never did any choral or general music or anything like that?
10. S: No. Totally not. I never did any. Every teaching job I've ever had has had a fulltime choir teacher and we don't really have any general music kind of stuff at the high school level plus the district that I'm in now is a two high school district. There is no K-8 in my district so there's no chance I will have to do any general music classes as long as I stay here.
11. I: Okay can you tell me about the other instrumental teachers in your district or I guess in your school to start and then expanding out in your district?
12. P: Sure and you said just the instrumental teachers correct?
13. I: Correct.
14. P: Okay. I'm the only band director in my high school and there's also a woman who's the strings teacher. She teaches some piano classes and she has two classes of orchestra and then her schedule is pretty much the same as mine so two periods of orchestra, two periods of lessons, a department duty...In our sister high school there's also 1 full time band director who's duties are pretty much the same as mine and there's also 1 full time strings teacher and that's our whole school district, just the 2 high schools.
15. I: At the other school are the directors male?
16. P: The string teacher is a female and the band teacher is a male.
17. I: Okay so 2 female orchestra teachers, you, and 1 male band director?

18. P: That's correct.
19. I: Okay and you said the middle school band director is also female?
20. P: That is correct. There's 1 middle school that feeds my program. She actually does band and choir and she's female. My sister high school, just because of the layout of the towns, is actually fed by 3 middle schools all of which have male band directors.
21. I: Alright. Please describe your relationship with your supervisor and/or principal.
22. P: They are actually 2 different people. The supervisor who we directly report to as a music department, her name is Amy. It is her second year being an assistant principal and I feel as if I have a very good relationship with her. I can talk to her whenever I need to about issues with students or classes. I feel as if she's attentive to my needs if I have a problem even to the point where I'm friends with her on facebook so she's a nice person that I feel like I have a good relationship with her. My principal's name is Steve. He's only been in this school for 2 years. This is his first job as a principal and he came from a district where the arts were really highly regarded so he's actually the first administrator I've ever had that's come to every concert.
23. I: Wow.
24. P: Yeah I know which I think is pretty unheard of anywhere so I feel as if he's supportive and I also feel as if he's someone I can talk to if I needed

something although I feel like I have a closer relationship with my immediate supervisor Amy.

25. I: Okay so you feel like they support you financially and in other aspects with all the cutting of the arts and everything...you feel like they're behind you?

26. P: I'm going to say yes with a "but" because I understand that they have budgets to meet as well within the school and within the school district but I do feel like when I desperately need something they're behind me. For example, the marching band uniforms that the kids had been using were the same ones that I had like 20 years ago and through some budget finagling, and taking some money from Peter to pay Paul, my principal Steve was able to get me some extra money to purchase new uniforms about 2 years ago so I feel like if I need something financially, they are both definitely there for me financially and there have been instances where I've had a very small surplus and they've asked me to help contribute to someone else's needs when they're in need of something so I feel like because I treat it as a 2-way street, they respect me.

27. I: Alright so next question: Do you feel like you are treated fairly by colleagues and students in comparison to male band directors?

28. P: I think with my students, I definitely am but I'll also say that all the kids I have now have never had a male band director. I don't think they treat me any differently at all. I actually wonder if they would treat a male band

director differently because the woman that starts them is obviously female and they see female band directors for the first couple of years that they're playing so I almost wonder how they would react to a guy in my position.

29. I: Interesting. Do you ever get any comments or any feelings like "oh female band director" from parents?

30. P: The parents think it's a bit more unusual than the students do just because, like I said, it's the only thing the students know. I think some of the parents are a little surprised sometimes especially the football parents...well actually I'll amend that...especially the marching band parents because they see that most of the other band directors at the football games are guys and the impression I get is that it is generally assumed that women only do high school band when they don't have a family because it's such a huge time commitment that they can't possibly balance children of their own with children at the school.

31. I: Interesting you said that. My other participant said something pretty similar. I'll have to look into literature on that because that didn't even cross my mind. I guess cause I don't have a family either.

32. P: Yeah and I mean I'm perfectly happy not having my own kids because I feel as if I get my fill of them in school and I don't really need anymore at home so that's fine with me but I've known other band directors who when they want to start a family...actually I'll back up...there was another woman who was a high school band director at a neighboring high school



to mine and she worked there for 7 or 8 years and when she decided she wanted to have a family, she took a job in a middle school so that she'd have more time.

33. I: Very cool. Well you know what I mean. Cool that it's new information.

34. P: It's interesting, yeah.

35. I: Do you conduct or participate in any bands or groups outside your normal teaching duties?

36. P: Right now I teach some private lessons. I have 2 private students now which I actually just recently started again. Recently as in the last 6 months. I do not play anywhere but I do occasionally manage honors bands like area band and region band. I also...actually I was just selected this year to conduct the region saxophone ensemble so I won't be playing but I'll be conducting that in February and I used to play in a little jazz quartet but I was finding that I just didn't have the time to do it. When I took my current job I was a little more busy than I was at my previous one so I stopped playing because I just didn't have the time.

37. I: Okay and you don't have any jam bands or a bunch of people that get together every once and a while and just jam?

38. P: No I really don't. I guess I feel like I get my playing outlet through conducting actually because I pick all the music I like obviously to conduct like why would I pick something I didn't like plus I do play a lot in the jazz band rehearsals because I think it helps the kids to who someone who's

style is a little bit more appropriate than theirs so I play a lot there but I don't really play anywhere outside of school except in my private lessons.

39. I: So you teach privately and you used to play in a jazz band but no longer?

Do you play in any other school's pit orchestras anymore?

40. P: I have on occasion but I don't any longer. I find I'm just too busy doing mine and I find that I just don't have the time to do anything outside of that. It just gets way to busy but I have done some in the past.

41. I: Okay. Have you ever felt intimidated by male band directors at festivals, conferences, or professional development sessions?

42. P: I don't know if I would use the word "intimidated" but I've definitely felt like an outsider and the place that I feel it the most is when I go to jazz events because I get the impression that jazz is still a boy's club and when I'm taking kids to try out for region jazz or junior region jazz sometimes I'm the only women there of all the band directors and I wouldn't say that I'm not welcomed but that it's strange that I'm there to them so that's the place where I feel it. I don't really feel it any longer. I think I felt it all the time when I first started teaching and I think that's because perhaps people didn't know me and I wasn't as comfortable in my position yet but that doesn't phase me at all any longer so it's just at a jazz setting that I notice it.

43. I: So this is when you bring your kids to the jazz auditions and stuff?

44. P: Exactly so if I bring kids to a jazz audition and every once in a while I have a kid that wants to try out, maybe every 3 or 4 years so I'll bring the kid and as part of the adjudication process I'll have to go to the director's meeting prior to the start of auditions and sometimes there's another woman there but usually not and it seems as if they all know each other very, very well and even though I know some of them, I just don't feel like I'm really part of that group.
45. I: Do they like not talk to you or like shoot you looks?
46. P: I don't talk to many of them but I'm not sure if that's related to gender or to my lack of Amyual participation. So there's a couple of them that I know but I don't really talk to many there because I don't know them very well. I mean it would kind of like being a situation like going to a party where everyone knows each other and you only know 1 person. You might feel awkward anyway because you don't know as many people but I do notice that I'm usually the only woman in the room.
47. I: Okay. Are there ever any opportunities to play? Like do the teachers ever get together and play?
48. P: Yeah there have been a couple of those. Someone a few years ago organized a concert band made up of band directors. I played in that. I was assigned to the second alto part, which was okay with. I didn't really know the guy who was playing first but he was a good player so it didn't bother me. I used to teach at a summer program that ran through the month of July

and I actually taught there for 6 years and they would have a faculty and alumni jazz band and I would frequently play in that and sometimes I played tenor, sometimes I played alto and they just kind of put me on the instrument that they needed me on the most.

49. I: Okay. Do you ever feel the need to enhance your femininity?

50. P: I don't think so at work. I sort of get the impression that people see like a music teacher as a job where you're always doing the kind of down and dirty things. You're always moving chairs and stands and you're always moving big equipment. I think people expect you to not be as feminine but I don't feel like I have to enhance it.

51. I: Okay. What is your mindset when you choose your clothing for when you perform in concerts?

52. P: If I'm conducting?

53. I: Yes.

54. P: I don't feel comfortable conducting in anything that has much of a heel as far as heels are concerned because I feel kind of off balance and I also don't like to conduct in a dress because I feel like it moves people's attention towards me and away from the performing group so I try to stay as neutrally black as I can. I know there's some conductors who will conduct in like some sequined-y kind of dress or like something that's black with patterns on it but I feel like the performance is about the kids and not about me so I usually just wear black slacks and a plain black top

and I try to just wear comfortable black shoes so that I feel that I'm grounded on the podium. If I'm performing...actually I'll back up...I performed at a teacher talent show last year and I played an arrangement of Harlem Nocturne, which is pretty slinky and pretty sexy and I did wear a very seductive black dress and heels for that but that was a situation where I was the one doing a solo and actually my jazz band at school played the background part. So that was a situation where I felt it was appropriate to dress in a very feminine fashion but when I'm conducting I don't feel like I need to.

55. I: Okay. So that's cool even just removing the gender I feel like conductors have a hard time realizing that it's not about them so it sounds like when you pick your outfit you pick something conservative not only for your benefit but also so that people are looking at your students and not you.

56. P: Absolutely, absolutely and I really encourage the kids to dress like that too because I don't want anyone's attention focused on the one flute player who wore a really short skirt. I want them to look at the group as a whole and to listen more than watch if possible.

57. I: Okay. How much of an impact did your primary instrument have on obtaining your current position if any?

58. P: On my current position I think my instrument had nothing to do with it. There was a position for which I interviewed before I got either of the two jobs I have now which I was specifically not chosen for because I was a

woodwind player and they were looking to hire a brass player so that did happen to me a while ago. I will say though that I feel like I was definitely hired *because* I'm a woman. The gentleman who had been at my position before me at my current job was only there for 1 year and without going into excoriating detail, he was accused of having a relationship with a student and he ended up ending the year being escorted out by the police so I definitely think they were looking to hire a woman. Definitely.

59. I: Interesting.

60. P: Yeah and I was actually friends with someone else who was in that same exact situation and actually the female band director that I mentioned previously, the one who left her job and taught middle school so she could have a family, she was also a person who took over a high school position after a very long time band director was actually accused of dating a student and actually served sometime in jail and she was the one who took over the position and she also said that she felt that she was hired because she was female. She felt that the administrators felt more comfortable not having a guy in that position after that had happened.

61. I: Okay well piggybacking off of that...do you ever feel any animosity from \*recorder malfunction but the interview finished question asking if the participant ever feels any animosity from other teachers not in her department such as football coaches, athletic directors, or the cheerleading coach.\*

62. P: I have a good relationship with both the football coach and the athletic director so they enjoy that I like playing the fight song and I try to keep all the traditions that were happening there when I was a student so I feel like my relationship with them is very good. If I need the football field during band camp, the football coach will often move to a practice field. If he needs the field he'll come and find me ahead of time so I can find a practice field so I feel like it's a nice relationship.
63. I: Okay and you don't have to deal with the cheerleading coach?
64. P: You know the cheerleading coaches, they don't seem to be able to keep a coach for very long so just in the 7 years I've been at this school, there's been like 3 cheerleading coaches. I don't really have a lot of contact with them. Some of them...well they've all been women...some of them have been really supportive and helpful, some of them have been a little standoffish, so I don't work with them too much but really the one thing they always want from me is at the beginning of the season, they like to get a CD of the music we play in the stands so that the captains can choreograph some moves to some of the songs we play but other than that I don't really have too much contact with them. We don't really ever have to fight for field time during band camp because they stay on the track and we go on the field. They seem nice. I just don't have a lot of contact with them.

65. I: Okay. That makes sense. So I accidentally turned my recorder off when you were talking about your instrument and how you don't think it impacted you getting a job but you think your gender did. Can you...I'm sorry...can you just repeat what you had said.
66. P: Yeah not problem. I think that a big part of the reason why I got my job is actually because I'm female because the band director who had been there for only 1 year prior to me had been accused of dating a student and he finished out the school year being led out by the police so I think my administrators were very interested in not having another man in the position so I don't think that instrument had anything to do with it. There was a time when I interviewed for a middle school job many years ago and I think I was not chosen because I was a woodwind player because they were looking for a brass player to fill the position.
67. I: Alright, thank you,
68. P: No problem.
69. I: Okay so I just have 1 more question; it's pretty broad. What are your overall thoughts, impressions, and feelings about being a female high school band director?
70. P: I would say that in general I really like high school kids so I really enjoy working with teenagers. I think they're challenging and I think they're interesting. I love helping them kind of mastering adolescence and start out to be adults and I love the fact that I can do musical things with high school



kids that you might not be able to do with younger children like you can really talk about the meaning of the piece and I think you can go into a lot more detail. I sort of like that not many people do it because everyone knows who I am and I think that that's sort of neat. I definitely think that I work with a great part of the school population because kids only take my class when they want to be there so I'll say that in general I really enjoy teaching high school. I don't really think I would enjoy music as much if I taught a different age. It is an awful lot of time and I think that I might enjoy music more outside of school if I didn't have so many extracurricular commitments. So I think that I would be more likely to play in a jazz band or play in a community band or have more private students if I wasn't there this night for jazz band and this weekend for area band and this weekend for regions and these 3 nights for pit rehearsal so it's definitely a very time-consuming job but I find that whatever I put in I get back tenfold from the kids so that makes it worth it.

71. I: Nice. Do you have block scheduling at your school?

72. P: Yeah we have what they call a modified block. We have a total of 8 classes. 3 of them meet every morning and then we all have lunch together and then 3 of them meet every afternoon and then that rotates through a 4 day cycle so the class periods are just under an hour long, they're like 58 minutes.

73. I: I'm sorry I didn't catch what you just said.

74. P: Just that depending on the schedule, I will see each of my classes 3 or 4 times in a 5-day work week because at least one or two of those times the class will fall out of the rotation and I won't see them
75. I: Okay and do you feel that you have to do a lot of the heavy advocating for your program and recruiting and do you feel that you have to constantly be doing that?
76. P: Yes. Without hesitation, yes. I think there are a lot of people and I don't even think I would just lump them into administrators or just people in general that enjoy music and want kids to have the opportunity to take music but don't necessarily understand that the only way band is good is when kids stay in it for 4 years and I can really help the kids get better year after year and then when the freshman come in, they're in a band with sophomores, juniors, and seniors and they hear these better players and they see the kids who have been there for 4 years. I know that we as a music department are always talking to guidance about the importance of kids trying to keep our ensemble for all 4 years of their high school career so that we have the opportunity to help them get better for a long period of time so that's a struggle. I'm lucky right now that I have a very supportive Music Parents Organization and they do a lot for me as far as helping to organize a night where the 8<sup>th</sup> graders can come visit a marching band game, they organize a pizza party and they do all the flyers for that and they're just very, very supportive so I'm super lucky right now because I

know some colleagues who's Music Parents are not as helpful or try to do too much and sort of take over things and don't really send the right message so I think I'm very fortunate that way but yeah I feel like we always have to advocate.

77. I: Okay has there ever been an instance where you feel sexually harassed in the workplace?

78. P: I can't think of one. I guess there were times when I was younger teacher where I just didn't feel confident in what I was doing. I'm not sure that was really gender related but I think that disappears as I got more comfortable with the job, I definitely felt more comfortable with myself but I can't think of an instance where anything like that happened.

79. I: Okay. That's good. I'm glad that you haven't had any instances where something like that has happened.

80. P: Yeah although I have a colleague that teaches music at SUNY Stonybrook and she just had to bring sexual harassment charges against a colleague and I don't know the whole gist of the story but she was pretty upset about it so it happens.

81. I: Yeah but it seems like times are changing. It seems that, from what I read, that things in the 80's and 90's were not so favorable.

82. P: I sometimes wonder if anyone has done any research about female band directors and male band directors and instances or accusations of relationships with students because it seems to me that most of the time

when that happens it's a male band director. I don't know if anybody has researched that at all.

83. I: Right, yeah I agree. I also don't know if anyone's done any research on that.

84. P: Yeah I guess it would be difficult because so many of them are accusations that don't go to trial or you would have a hard time finding information about that.

85. I: Yeah and if it's like with a minor you probably wouldn't have access to it.

86. P: Yeah that's what I'm thinking.

87. I: Alright well I have no more questions. Do you want to elaborate on anything or go back and clarify on something that you said at all? Did you hear what I asked?

88. P: No after you said that you had no more questions, the screen went blank and it said "reconnecting" for like 8 seconds.

89. I: Okay. Do you want to clarify or elaborate on anything that we talked about?

90. P: Not that I can think of right now, no.

91. I: Alright, I will stop my recorder.

92. **End Interview**

### **Libbey Interview 3**

1. K: Okay so is there anything from the last interview that you wanted to elaborate on, or strike, or add to, or correct based on the transcript?
2. S: Nothing I can think of, nothing I can see, nothing I can think of. It looks fine to me and I plan on looking at all 3 again over Christmas break since it's on Saturday and making sure I didn't miss anything. I don't think I did.
3. K: Okay, cool. Alright, so we'll start with the third interview questions. How long have you been a high school band director?
4. S: This makes two and a half years. This is my third year teaching. I'm mid-way through the third year.
5. K: Alright so can you describe your past and current teaching duties? So what was your first job and any jobs you had between and all the jobs that you currently do now?
6. S: The only job I've had has been at Our Lady Christian School and I got here a week before school started in 2011 and I knew I was going to be teaching two band classes: beginning band and then a band with 7<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> grade. I don't ever recommend taking a job with 7<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> grade band. It's a handful. But I have two bands. I knew I would be teaching two classes of history. What I didn't find out until I actually got there was oh you're teaching elementary music too! What? So I taught Kindergarten through 4<sup>th</sup> grade music as well and I saw each class once a week for 30 minutes as far as elementary went. So beginning band everyday; they're the reason I didn't quit that year.

They were lovely. I almost quit because of the history classes. I wasn't trained to teach history. It is a complete fluke that I ended up being good at it because I have gotten good at it and then my concert band was a nightmare because so many of the kids had quit because the previous band director was not the band director anymore and she was also still at the school. She's still at the school and she had never wanted to be the band director, she was just the only one there who was qualified after the first guy left. This is only the 8<sup>th</sup> year that this band program has existed.

7. K: Okay so you teach 7<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> grade band, beginning band, general music grades K through 4...
8. S: That was the first year. The first year I taught general music K through 4, 6<sup>th</sup> grade beginning band, 7<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> concert band and then 8<sup>th</sup> grade and 11<sup>th</sup> grade American History. I have one class of each. But yeah, it was a nightmare. The second year I have 5<sup>th</sup> grade...we couldn't work out general music schedule but I had 5<sup>th</sup> grade...they are my angels, they are my absolute favorite class. I had 6<sup>th</sup> grade beginning band and they were the class from hell. And then I had 7<sup>th</sup> grade intermediate band with 8<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup>. So I had three band classes and then it turned into four because in January I started the 5<sup>th</sup> graders on instruments and I still have 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grade American History. This year I teach Kindergarten through 5<sup>th</sup> grade general music and I see some classes three days a week for 25 minutes and some classes two days a week for 35 minutes. Then I teach beginning band in 6<sup>th</sup> grade again and I have a class

that's kind of weird...it's 7<sup>th</sup> through 9<sup>th</sup> grade band but there's only one 9<sup>th</sup> grader in it because the rest of the 9<sup>th</sup> graders changed their schedule to the upper band class so that class I technically teach the 8<sup>th</sup> grade and Debbie took the 7<sup>th</sup> graders and taught them and then I have the 10<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> band class. This year has been insane just because of the schedule. They re-did the athletic schedule and it messed up the band schedule completely. It was supposed to be 8<sup>th</sup> through 12<sup>th</sup> grade concert band because at least that way you got advanced enough musicians that could keep up but it didn't work out that way.

9. K: Is this a small school?

10. S: Very small school.

11. K: Okay.

12. S: There's 300ish students total in the whole school and I don't know if that counts preschool or not.

13. K: So its PreK through 12?

14. S: Yes. I don't see the preschoolers though. I don't know how I would. There's no room left in my schedule. Do you need me to clarify this at all?

15. K: No I think I got it. So you teach K through 5 general music, you have a beginning band, then you have a 7<sup>th</sup> through 9 concert band and then an 8<sup>th</sup> through 12 concert band?

16. S: Yup except the two concert band classes have kind of had to be combined because I have all my trumpets in one class and all my tubas in one class and I've got seven flutes in one class and one flute in the other. It's a mess. But I

told them at the beginning of the year that you are all one band and you are expected to act like it.

17. K: Are you the only band director at the school?

18. S: I'm the only one well...Darla, she was a band director. She taught in public school for four years and then she took time off to home school her boys and then after Mr. Markel, the first director left, she took his job for three years so she is still technically my mentor teacher because she's taught band for slightly longer than I have and she took the 7<sup>th</sup> grade because they were so far behind but she doesn't really see herself as a band director, just as an extra music teacher. I'm definitely the only person on the faculty who can do elementary music so that's interesting.

19. K: Are there any other instrumental teachers in your district?

20. S: Yeah. I am in Texas Region 2 and I don't know how many band directors there are off the top of my head...there's at least 15...maybe more than that and in this district you have a lot of rural schools where you have one band director in charge of the whole program the way I am and it's an interesting mix. I'm by far the youngest by many years in most cases. I think there's one other band director that's in my age bracket and in their 20's. I'm not the only female so that's nice.

21. K: How do you feel about them? Can you just tell me a little about them?

22. S: It's been weird because when I got here I never exactly felt unwelcomed but I didn't really feel welcomed either like nobody went out of their way to help



me out. I was the only new director in the region and everyone just kind of forgot about me. They thought I already knew the ropes when I didn't know the ropes at all. The exception has been our area chair, Karl Dallas. He has been amazing. I worship the ground that man walks on. He saved my life the first year just helping me learn how the paperwork worked...simple stuff like that but it was a big help to me. The local band directors here...on the Arkansas side of Texas there are Northern High and North Texas High School, they're both women. It's Kristen Sheffield and Kelly...I can't remember Kelly's last name right now...but they are phenomenal. They helped me a lot. I've been to judging competitions for them and they're going to come listen to my band later to see how they can help and they're wonderful. But them and Kevin are the only ones who made me feel welcome. A lot of it down here is kind of the "good ol boys" system. It's not what you know, it's who you know. Since I didn't know anybody I got left out of the loop on everything.

23. K: Did you have any negative experiences with any of them?

24. S: Yeah but they were all my fault if I'm completely honest. The guy who runs the auditions at Brick-Harrisburg high school, I got an email from his secretary saying region audition forms are due today...last year...and I sent an email because I panicked and I said, "You know I would have liked more advanced notice on this." And he called me and he said, "I want you to apologize to our bookkeeper because she does this on her free time and I checked and you actually did receive an email." And I hadn't because we actually had a server

switch and a lot of stuff had gotten lost but I felt really bad about being rude and he's never let me forget it. So I mean that's not his fault, that's mine.

25. K: Okay. How would you describe your relationship with your supervisor and your principal? Or if they're the same person...

26. S: Well I guess my supervisor would technically be Darla and she's nice enough but our personalities just don't mesh. She's very, very reserved. I openly wear my heart on my sleeve. I'm very, very passionate and she's passionate in other ways but she keeps in under a lid I guess so its been hard for us to find common ground but she has helped me in a lot of ways and at the same time I feel like I've done a lot of work without her. That's not discounting her at all. She was a lifesaver my first year. I mean I like her but I just don't know since she didn't actually teach band for that long, I don't know how much of a help she is. She's been more of a help in things like classroom management. She said her teaching style has completely changed since she had children. Stuff like that. The principal is her husband so if you get one, you get them both. In general it's a positive and it's kind of strange, this year has been shook up a little bit because he's the dean of students and then we have a new boss who's the dean of faculty and so far she seems to like me, she seems to like what I do. I never really see the time to communicate unless I take the time to sit down and write a private email and it's been...I don't know...it's been strange this year but Dr. Bridgeton seems to like me, Mr. Matthews I can never

really tell but I haven't been fired so I assume I'm doing pretty good. He's just one of those people who are hard to read.

27. K: Do they support your program?

28. S: Yes. Well since Mr. Matthews is married to the former band director, she tells him exactly what the band needs and he does his best to work at it like our concert was originally scheduled for December 3<sup>rd</sup>, the Tuesday after we came back from Thanksgiving break. I told them at the beginning of their year that that's not going to work. We cannot do that day. They didn't bother to change it and they didn't bother to change it until we had a rehearsal in early October and I went into his office and got down on my knees and begged...well I didn't literally get down on my knees but you know what I mean. I said is there any other day we can move it to? This is not going to work. So the impression I got was that he moved mountains so that he could insure that our concert could get pushed back but we would be ready. In that way he supports it a lot. Dr. Bridgeton is still figuring out how to support us. She likes what we're doing but she's not a music person. She doesn't get it.

29. K: Okay well at least its not like she's a music person and doesn't get it so she dismisses it so that's good. So there are no other male directors at your school? It's just you?

30. S: Just me. I run the entire music program which is kind of cool in a way because I get to do the whole curriculum from kindergarten through 12<sup>th</sup> grade. It would be cool if I had the time to plan a whole curriculum for all 12 years.

Right now it's kind of like we're going to study this type of song this year and this type of song this year and this type of song another year. I don't know which kinds of songs we'll do individually but I'll make it up as I go.

31. K: Okay so my next question is do you feel fairly treated by colleagues and students compared to male band directors but I guess that doesn't apply since you're the only one.

32. S: I guess the only downside is that since I'm shorter than most of my students even some of the 4<sup>th</sup> graders...if there was a really tall man on the podium he might be able to whip some of those 8<sup>th</sup> grade boys into shape but I do the best I can.

33. K: Okay so I guess do you feel you are fairly treated by your colleagues and your students period?

34. S: Yeah in general. My colleagues...it took them a while to kind of warm up because I think the general impression was well let's see if she lasts a year but there have been a few who have just been wonderful and kind and really supportive. There is one woman who is just dying for them to give history to someone else so that I can teach choir too. She said that you would be just wonderful at choir! So as far as music goes, they're very, very supportive. The students...of course my first year I was not treated fairly and since I was the new band director I did not expect to be treated fairly but I'm treated fairly now.

35. K: Yeah that's a thing. It's very popular for the new band director...for the kids to push the new band director out but then be totally chill with the next person that comes in. So the second person after their original band director so...way to be.
36. S: Yeah, I think that in some ways the situation was made better and in some ways the situation was made way worse by the fact that Darla was still there. She didn't want to teach band anymore. She told the kids she didn't want to teach band but she was still there and so the first year I had no clue what I was doing! None! I tried to make them write a Christmas carol for a project. They have no music theory experience. I was dumb and they would go crying to Darla and she would talk to me about it afterwards but she would during class be like, "that's sounds like such a fun project! I wish I had thought of that!" And then she'd ask me afterwards what are you doing? She kind of kept me in check and kind of kept them in check too so in some ways it was good that she was there.
37. K: Do you conduct or participate in any groups outside of your teaching duties?
38. S: Occasionally. In the fall I usually way too busy but in the spring...last spring I was in the Second Time Around band which is kind of like a local community band. They're pretty good. This year I wasn't able to practice with them because I was doing so much extra as far as class work goes but I'm hoping to start with them again in January because it meets only once a week

and it meets kind of late at night but it was so good to play my horn again. Every now and again I play with the church choir and the church orchestra. They have an open invitation for me to play whenever I'd like but they're Baptist and I'm Church of Christ, which is kind of funny because Church of Christ doesn't have instrumental music. I taught my students the definition of irony with that story. So I get to play reasonably often and not just horn. I get to play...last Christmas I got to play a whole trumpet swing show. It was the first show I ever did on trumpet and it was all swing music that was incredibly hard and incredibly high so that was a musical stretch for me that was really good. I like to sing, well I sing every Sunday with church anyway but there's a female barbershop quartet here that desperately wanted me...well barbershop choir I guess but it costs a lot of money that I don't have and they were all amateurs and I couldn't stand the way they rehearsed so I went to three rehearsals and I said okay this isn't for me. I heard about another group that also wants me to come and sing with them but they're more like former music majors and stuff. It's like community choir instead of community band. As soon as I get the chance I'm going to give them a try because I really like singing with groups too and when I sing it actually keeps my ear a bit sharper.

39. K: Do you take your bands to festivals?

40. S: Yes. We have concert assessment and we don't have a marching band so we don't do any kind of marching band festivals or anything like that but it's mainly concert assessment.

41. K: So at these festivals have you even felt intimidated by any of the male directors?
42. S: The concert assessments themselves, I never see the male directors. It's just I'm there with my band, we got in front of the judges that I never see that I can hear their tapes later, we go in front of another judge, and then we leave. It's not...like in Maryland everybody would hang out and watch all the other bands and it would be an all-day affair but here it's not like that. You just go, you play, and you leave. Now at stuff like region auditions and region clinics, then I felt a little intimidated...less so now that I kind of know how things go but it's less the fact that I'm a woman and a lot more the fact that these guys have been teaching 20-30 years. They really know what they're doing and then you've got me where I'm still trying to figure out how to tread the waters and figure out how to teach band and how to write a band curriculum and these guys seem to have it all figured out. It hasn't been too bad. You can tell which band directors look down on you for being a woman and which ones don't. There's just a little group of them...like last year at one of the clinics, the junior high clinic, there was a female director there and there were a few of the "good ole boys" and they were all old, white men and they were standing in the back kind of talking, making fun of the woman on the podium and me and the other female band directors were just kind of standing there glaring at them because we know exactly what they're doing and we resent it. But that's really the only time I've run into any kind of you know...well you're a woman so

you can't do a good job. Just from those particular people and they're on their way out to retire.

43. K: What were some of the things that they were saying? Or what were some of the characteristics that they were making fun of?

44. S: Just her control over the ensemble. They seemed to think that because she would...just have better classroom control for want of a better word is she was a man. But the other thing was I felt kind of vindicated because she was leading the band in the exact kind of warm-ups that I do where you use solfege syllables and you make your band sing and you make them actually listen and tune that way instead of just pulling out a tuner and doing it individually and they were making fun of all that. Like they thought that was not a good way to warm up a band and I'm like are you kidding? That's a great way to warm up a band. It's working with mine. Our intonation is improving dramatically. I mean we have problems now we have 7<sup>th</sup> graders who can't control their tone but that'll come.

45. K: Alright. What about any professional development sessions or conferences?

46. S: There are not many. I got really lucky a couple of summers ago. They had the Dawson Co-op, which is like an adult learning center in Texadelphia which is about an hour and fifteen minutes away from here. They offered an elementary music workshop and they offered a band workshop where you could go and I learned a couple of things and they had some more workshops that I wasn't able to go to. But most of the band directors, we do most of our



professional development in August or in late July at the TSBOA convention. Texas State Band and Orchestra....well it's the band and orchestra association whatever those letters actually stand for. There are lots of workshops there about like tongue control and marching band and how to protect yourself from litigation and making sure your kids stay safe in the heat in marching band because that's a problem in Texas. Just all sorts of things you can go to and get professional development credit. Not that any of it counts for me because I am a private school. I go because I want the clinics but it's not actually like I get credit for it.

47. K: Okay and you never feel intimidated at those conferences?

48. S: Occasionally but it's more because I don't know anybody and it's getting less every year because I'm meeting new people now and if I choose to stay in Texas then I'm sure it will get less intimidating as I actually get to know people. Because the last one was actually fun because I met up with one of the directors who had been in my region. He was one of the ones that's actually close in my age bracket. He moved up north but we're both big science fiction fans so we hung out at the convention and talked Dr. Who in-between clinics. Just stuff like that it. It gets easier.

49. K: Nice. Alright so do you ever feel the need to enhance your femininity especially during concerts or festivals or anything like that?

50. S: If I'm going to get up there then I'm going to look good and its not really enhancing my femininity so much as that when I'm going to get up in front of

loads of people I want to actually look professional and the best way I can do that is by wearing a nice dress. I refuse to go the pants-suit route though. I am not Hilary Clinton.

51. K: I'm so excited I get to put that in a transcript.

52. S: Yeah. \*Participant chuckles\* Well it caused me trouble at my last concert because I have my concert dress, it's very nice, it has like lace at the top and stuff and a nice, neat looking jacket. It looks very professional but for our concert on Thursday, I had to get up on a drum major podium so we brought in one from one of the high schools because we had the choir in the choir loft, the TBC orchestra up on the other half of the choir loft, we had my band on stage and then we had the entire elementary school, K through 5<sup>th</sup> grade on the steps in front of the band. The only way they could all see me to direct was for me to get way back there, on a drum major podium on a slanted floor. That was terrifying. But I realized...wait...I'm on a drum major podium, I can't wear my concert dress. That's when I actually considered well do I have time to get a pant-suit? But I really don't want a pant-suit but I need to do something professional so I just ended up wearing nice slacks and a black cardigan and a red shirt to look Christmas-y and I put on a sling of pearls and it was fine. The crowd applauded when I actually stood up on the podium. I think they were terrified that I would fall.

53. K: So you go for the more professional look instead of trying to sexy or hot?

54. S: No. I'm not going to do that. Well I mean, I teach at a Christian school. But it's also just not me. I'd rather look professional and modest than the type-A bombshell because in some ways I think if you do that you might lose respect from parents. The kids might love it. Some of the dads might love it but you have to have the respect of the moms too. And especially since I am really young at this school and because I am by far the youngest faculty member there's some ways I have to look professional to look older. I used to go without make-up but I look 16 so I had to start wearing make-up, I had to start wearing jewelry and it's not that I particularly enjoy putting it on everyday, it's just I have to look older than my kids because I still get mistaken for an 18 year old and I'm almost 26 which will be great when I'm 40 but until then...The parents, oh especially the first year, they looked at me and were like you're teaching my kid? So yeah, I look really young.

55. K: I guess before we get into my last few questions, I'm just going to throw one at you. How would you describe your teaching style? Or just your everyday classroom management, how you go about teaching.

56. S: It depends on the class. My beginners, we started out, we had a list of rules and introduced a new rule everyday and the consequence for breaking any of them was detention and I enforced it very heavily because I wanted my beginners to start out right. After 5 or 6 people served detention and realized how horrible it was, the class calmed down so now I've relaxed the rules a little bit. They're allowed to speak up a little bit in class but it stays in hand

easily. Middle school...it's a class of mostly boys, there's only 3 girls in there so I've got 3 girls and 20 boys in 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade. That's always fun. So fun, especially like today when one of them decided to bite another one. I thought we outgrew that at 4 but apparently not. That class I put on a firm hand. I'm not as fun and happy-go-lucky as I am with the younger class, I'm constantly just trying to keep order so we can get stuff done. And then with the concert band its kind of in-between the two. Because they're older they know how I teach now, they know I will let them speak up but it has to stay within certain bounds and if you're having off topic conversations they better stop or I will kick you out. That's completely different too from the way I do history because that...it just depends on the class too. It just depends on the group I've got. I'm consistent within a class but I can't be consistent across all those grade levels. It's just not going to happen.

57. K: Right. That makes sense. Do you raise your voice or yell a lot? Or not really?

58. S: Only with the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> graders. I try not to yell. I don't like yelling. It's not fun and it makes you look like a meany in the words of one of the 4<sup>th</sup> graders. I have yelled before to a 3<sup>rd</sup> grade class because sometimes they can be awful and I've yelled at the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> graders because it's the only way I can get my voice to project oh and I yell a lot at the 5<sup>th</sup> graders. They're awful. That's a class of 18; 2 of them are girls and the rest are boys and all of them are on ADHD medication. It's going to be fun with them in beginning band

next year. That class I'm working on different strategies because at this point I wouldn't trust them with instruments so I don't know how we're going to do beginning band next year. I'm trying lots of things but I'm trying not to yell because.

59. K: Are there any teaching style traits or tips that you think you got directly from any of your teachers from SSU?

60. S: I realize that the way I lead an ensemble as far as just kind of a combination of fighting sarcasm mixed up with okay you messed up, do it again but do it better. I do a lot of that like Dr. Bishop which I didn't really realize until recently because one of the things we are supposed to be getting rid of in our classroom is sarcasm and I am so bad at that. I love sarcasm. Sarcasm is a great way to get to the point so that's been a struggle and a half and she would just make comments like trumpets...you should be embarrassed. Stuff like that, I find myself saying those expressions. If the flutes...if I've asked them for the past 3 weeks that you must learn this line from measure so and so and so and so and if you still don't know it, I just look at them..."Flutes. You should be embarrassed." And then I see all the rest of the brass nod uh-huh because they're getting sick of rehearsing the same sections over and over again. I have a lot of humor but I don't really know if that's from my teachers at SSU and just the way that I act with the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade some of the times, I find myself thinking of Mr. Roberts who was the middle school teacher I taught under during my student teaching. The one

teacher I try to emulate is Dr. Billups. I have used the word “baloney” but it was more in a funny context then “This is baloney Mr. Cooper!” Did I tell you about that before? I think I did.

61. K: Yes. Okay so how much of an impact did your primary instrument have on obtaining your current position if any?

62. S: None whatsoever. I think it will if I apply in a public school but at this point when I got hired here it was the end of July and they still didn’t have a band director. They were looking for anybody so I fit the bill apparently. They picked me because they believed I would have rapport with the students. It took a while but eventually I got there

63. K: Did you have to audition?

64. S: Nope. I did an interview over...well not skype...some other program they set up and it was great because I didn’t actually have to dress up or anything. I just wore a nice cardigan and I nice top and I got to sit there just like this and do an interview. It was Darla, it was Killian, and it was the headmaster of the school and one other person and it was kind of a mix of band questions, classroom management questions and biblical questions since it is a Christian school. I guess I did good because they offered me the job.

65. K: Are you happy with your current teaching position?

66. S: I love it. If I didn’t have to teach history and if the pay was better I don’t know if I would ever be able to leave because I have the best kids. I thank God everyday for this job because they are amazing and I get to do so much with

them. I don't know if I were to move anywhere else if I would get this type of job again where I get to see all the kids and all the age levels because I love that. There's not many people who do so there's not many jobs like that. But I decided that if I had to pick grade levels, I would pick 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grade. I love them. They're the best. It's before they start getting snarky attitudes but enough where they're still very intelligent unlike kindergarten where it's "Miss. Teacher! Can you tie my shoe?" Like I heard 15 times today. I'm still Miss. Teacher. It's December and I'm still Miss. Teacher to some of them. You think Smith would be easy to learn but no.

67. K: Do you have any aspirations to go to a public school?

68. S: At this point I really don't know because...it's funny. Before I got this job I really thought poorly of private schools. I was like you know I went to public school and I turned out great but now I see the stuff that going on inside the public schools from the teacher end and how they are so overloaded and so overworked and with the testing and how you can't even get rehearsal time with your kids because they're in math remediation or reading remediation or they're being forced to take 20 tests a year and I don't have to deal with any of that at private school and so...I don't know. If I found a job at a private school like this one but paid more and actually had retirement, I would probably stick with private school because I really like the environment and that is a nice thing about my school too because you'd think it would be a lot of rich kids but it's really not. I've got a lot of families who have really sacrificed. I've got

aunts and uncles and grandparents all sacrificing just to put one kid through the school because the public schools at Texas are rough schools. I have mad respect for Kristen and Kelly for being band directors at North Texas High and North Texas Junior High because those kids are tough and they are mean and they like to walk all over you. So I look at them, they're both just a teeny bit taller than me, they're both very petite, and I look at them and I look at what they get out of their band and I'm like how do I get that kind of respect out of my kids? Teach me your ways oh master. I would like to go to public school someday I guess just because I would really like to pay off my student loans and it's difficult doing that with this job but at this point I'm really conflicted because I love my job. I love it even with all the hassle and with the teaching history and the crazy schedule, I go home everyday with grace and there's not many people who can say that.

69. K: Alright, so last broad question. What are your overall thoughts, impressions, and feelings about being a female high school band director?
70. S: I feel like it's becoming much more accepted than it used to be. When I was in middle school I didn't see any female high school band directors and now I see them everywhere and I wonder if that is just particular to my region or if that's just a nationwide trend where you're starting to have more female directors and it's been good because in general I haven't experience a lot of the persecution for my gender that I expected. That tells me we've come a long way in terms of workplace equality. Repeat the question again?



71. K: Your overall thoughts and impressions.

72. S: That's the big thoughts. The other thing is if somebody wants to stop me from being a band director because I'm female, well then they've got another thing coming because I'm going to take off my modest-me hat for a moment. I'm good. I sing. I can do band at all levels. This job has trained me to teach at all levels. I challenge you find more people with 3 years of teaching experience who have done as much as I have because it is not easy and the fact that I have been able to do it while I'm here by myself, 1,000 miles away from family, its given me a lot confidence that I've been able to pull that off because I never expected to be able to. I thought I would be quitting by October of my first year. So you want to take me down for being female than bring it on!

73. K: Alright well that is the end of my questions but do you have any stories...like this may not have happened to you but have you ever heard of anything like any type of sexual harassment or mistreatment of female band directors in or around your region?

74. S: Not band directors in particular. I know when I was student teaching...I think it was the choir director...she was having a conference with a parent and he said, "well how about you come sit on my lap over here." That was just wildly inappropriate. She told us all that during lunch and we were just like he did not! Honestly I haven't really heard anything about sexual harassment but part of that might be because I'm in the South. Gentlemen down here know

that if you try to do that to a lady, she may have a gun. If I had a concealed carry permit, I would be packing it some places.

75. K: Okay...

76. S: I'm a good shot too, just so you know. My dad was a championship shooter in the state of Arkansas when he was in college and I think the highest praise I've gotten from him as far as accomplishment was "Kiddo I would be afraid to meet you in a back alley."

77. K: Do you have any plans to start a jazz band at your school?

78. S: Not any time soon because I need to learn about jazz. We have a jazz method book but the other part of it is that I don't have strong enough musicians. I've got two saxophones in my top band but one of them can barely read and the other one just struggles by and I struggle to get to get even close to her saxophone case when she leaves and she wonders why her saxophone gets broken. That's the kind of saxophones I have. Trumpets I have some that would be very good if we could get the backup stuff to go with them.

79. K: Can you think of anything else you want to mention? Any stories or anything like that?

80. S: I was just think that in college and stop me if I already told you about this but I work as an usher for the Cover Center for the Arts and the Southern State Symphony was looking for a new conductor and so they had a series of guest conductors come in who would audition for the part and that was the first time

I got a taste of how band sexism could get because one of the conductors who auditioned was Sarah Hicks and she was my youth orchestra conductor.

81. K: She conducts at Philadelphia right?

82. S: I don't know. She might now. I haven't kept track of her.

83. K: Yeah I think she does like the summer concerts and the pops concerts at Philadelphia.

84. S: She's very good but I wouldn't have wanted her to come to Southern State because she would have used it as a resume builder and moved on and she had done that it would have bankrupted the symphony but the thing that really bothered me was they had patrons fill out this survey about what did you like about the conductor and what didn't you like about the conductor and would you want this person back? There were a shocking number of surveys that were like did you like her? No. Why? Because she's a woman. That was the first time that I really realized wow there is sexism in this industry because I've never really felt it before and that was very eye-opening for me because I played under her, she's a brilliant conductor. She's better than most of the conductors I've had.

85. \*Recorder Malfunction\*

86. S: I got so much more out of getting up in front of middle-schoolers which I guess that says something about my sanity but there's not many who would voluntarily get up in front of and put themselves in a position to be mocked by 7<sup>th</sup> graders or 11<sup>th</sup> graders who are never going to let me live down the time I

accidently said that George Washington was pregnant instead of president. I have lots of slips of the tongue, that was the worst one. That will follow me well beyond Trinity. George Washington was pregnant. So now in history...did this happen before or after George Washington had his baby?

87. K: Good. Well that wraps up our third interview. I'm actually going to turn the recorder off.

88. **End Interview**

## Appendix E

### COURSE IN THE PROTECTION HUMAN SUBJECTS CURRICULUM COMPLETION REPORT

Printed on 04/10/2014

<b>LEARNER</b>	Kelly Gathen (ID: 3222463)
<b>PHONE</b>	975801286
<b>EMAIL</b>	gathenke@udel.edu
<b>INSTITUTION</b>	University of Delaware
<b>EXPIRATION DATE</b>	06/11/2016

#### HUMAN SUBJECTS PROTECTIONS FOR GRADUATE STUDENTS

<b>COURSE/STAGE:</b>	Basic Course/1
<b>PASSED ON:</b>	06/11/2013

<b>REFERENCE ID:</b>	9241960
----------------------	---------

REQUIRED MODULES	DATE COMPLETED	SCORE
Belmont Report and CITI Course Introduction	06/11/13	3/3 (100%)
Students in Research	06/11/13	10/10 (100%)
History and Ethical Principles - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
Defining Research with Human Subjects - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
The Regulations - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
Assessing Risk - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
Informed Consent - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
Privacy and Confidentiality - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
Internet Research - SBE	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
University of Delaware	06/11/13	5/5 (100%)
ELECTIVE MODULES	DATE COMPLETED	SCORE
Vulnerable Subjects - Research Involving Workers/Employees	06/11/13	4/4 (100%)

For this Completion Report to be valid, the learner listed above must be affiliated with a CITI Program participating institution or be a paid Independent Learner. Falsified information and unauthorized use of the CITI Program course site is unethical, and may be considered research misconduct by your institution  
Paul Braunschweiger Ph.D. Professor, University of Miami Director Office of Research Education CITI Program Course Coordinator



RESEARCH OFFICE

210 Halliwell Hall  
University of Delaware  
Newark, Delaware 19716-1551  
Ph: 302/831-2136  
Fax: 302/831-2828

DATE: October 4, 2013

TO: Kelly Gathen  
FROM: University of Delaware IRB

STUDY TITLE: [507181-2] Gender Bias and Musical Instrument Selection in Music Education

SUBMISSION TYPE: New Project

ACTION: APPROVED  
APPROVAL DATE: October 4, 2013  
EXPIRATION DATE: October 3, 2014  
REVIEW TYPE: Expedited Review

REVIEW CATEGORY: Expedited review category # 6,7

Thank you for your submission of New Project materials for this research study. The University of Delaware IRB has APPROVED your submission. This approval is based on an appropriate risk/benefit ratio and a study design wherein the risks have been minimized. All research must be conducted in accordance with this approved submission.

This submission has received Expedited Review based on the applicable federal regulation.

Please remember that informed consent is a process beginning with a description of the study and insurance of participant understanding followed by a signed consent form. Informed consent must continue throughout the study via a dialogue between the researcher and research participant. Federal regulations require each participant receive a copy of the signed consent document.

Please note that any revision to previously approved materials must be approved by this office prior to initiation. Please use the appropriate revision forms for this procedure.

All SERIOUS and UNEXPECTED adverse events must be reported to this office. Please use the appropriate adverse event forms for this procedure. All sponsor reporting requirements should also be followed.

Please report all NON-COMPLIANCE issues or COMPLAINTS regarding this study to this office.

Please note that all research records must be retained for a minimum of three years.

Based on the risks, this project requires Continuing Review by this office on an annual basis. Please use the appropriate renewal forms for this procedure.

## Appendix F

### CODING TABLE

<b>Instrument Selection</b>	<b>Director Memories</b>	<b>Memorable Experiences</b>	<b>Ensemble Participation</b>	<b>Teacher Training</b>	<b>Feminism</b>
Choice	Elementary school	Elementary school	Elementary school	Secondary instrument	Gender gap
Timbre preferences	Middle school	Middle school	Middle school	Methods Courses	Equality
Prior experiences	High school	High school	High school	Practicum experience	Harassment
Reasons for choice	College	College	College	Student Teaching	Sexuality
		Student teaching	Inclusion		
			Exclusion		