# University of Delaware Disaster Research Center

# FINAL PROJECT REPORT #55

CHILE VS. HAITI: HOW DID THE MEDIA FRAME THE EARHTQUAKES IN HAITI AND CHILE?

Tyler Svitak

2010

# Chile vs. Haiti: How Did the Media Frame the Earthquakes in Haiti and Chile?

By: Tyler Svitak

# **Abstract:**

This research compares how the media framed the recent earthquakes Chile and Haiti. There has been extensive research on the topic of media framing in disaster literature, and much of the research has concluded that the media inaccurately frames disasters to focus more on human loss and destruction than actually occurs. Previous research has also concluded that the media shapes their audience's conclusions about an event based on their coverage. That is why this research conducted a content analysis of the New York Times articles following both events, and from that analysis came a better understanding of how the earthquakes were covered by the media. There was a significant contrast in the coverage of each earthquake—Haiti was framed as hell on earth through descriptions of unorganized chaos and death, whereas Chile was framed in a way that illustrated an inefficient, slow but organized response following the earthquake. Considering both events were so recent, little research has been done to analyze how the media framed them, and therefore this research will greatly contribute to our understanding of the viewpoints the media presented to its audience.

# **Introduction:**

The media acts as the key informant in disaster situations by relaying information from the scene of the disaster to those who are affected, the curious general public, and policy makers alike. In fact, the media plays such a large role in disseminating information about disasters that Dynes claimed that the media "defines" a disaster by what is reported and what is not (Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006). What does get reported forms a frame—a lens that shows the audience one part of the larger picture—that is then often interpreted as the truth behind what happened at the scene of the disaster. However, sometimes these frames, or

underlying themes, are exaggerated, misrepresented, or completely false, which results in a general misunderstanding of the disaster by the media's audience (Barsky; Dynes and Rodriguez, 2006; Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006). Research has shown that the media's framing of an event can control the agenda of emergency personnel and policy makers (Vasterman, 2005), so if the framing of a disaster is inaccurate then resources and policies may be set accordingly, which results in wasted resources, personnel, and policies that could be better used elsewhere.

Since the earthquakes in Haiti and Chile were so recent, it is important to study how the media framed the events because there has been little study done on the topic so far. Considering the importance of accurate media framing in disaster situations, this research analyzed how the *New York Times* framed the recent earthquakes in Haiti and Chile. To do this, the *New York Times* articles within a month of the disaster were identified, and a content analysis was conducted in order to identify the framing within them. After, the frames were compared and reflected upon to render significance in the differences of each event.

#### **Earthquakes in Haiti and Chile:**

On January 12, 2010 a 7.0 earthquake rattled the impoverished nation of Haiti. As a result of the quake, an estimated 100,000-200,000 people were found dead depending on the source, and around 300,000 people were injured. Most of the death and injury was a direct consequence of collapsed structures that trapped people in a mountain of rubble, which was itself a large obstacle in hastening the response process. Moreover, the lack of infrastructure and sanitary conditions that existed before the earthquake created an environment where goods and services could not be transported efficiently to those in need. This makes a horrible disaster even worse,

especially when those that aren't injured or dead—about one million people—have no home to grieve in. Instead, they are left waiting for help that, realistically, may not come.

On February 27, 2010, just six weeks after the disaster in Haiti, a more powerful earthquake registering a magnitude of 8.8 struck off the Chilean coast. The earthquake occurred along the same fault as the largest earthquake ever recorded—a 9.5 magnitude quake—which killed 2000 Chileans and hundreds more as a tsunami rolled through the Pacific Ocean. The quake that recently hit Chile caused a 400 mile rupture about 22 miles beneath the ocean's surface, which triggered a tsunami recorded at 7.7 feet that killed some and destroyed structures along the coastline. The earthquake in Chile was about 350-500 times stronger than the previous Haitian earthquake, but considering the better building codes and materials that were enforced in Chile the damage was much less significant. The quake left 795 people dead, whereas Haiti's death toll hovers in the hundreds of thousands. Regardless of the events in Haiti, the physical destruction of infrastructure and buildings was extensive in the Chilean earthquake—500,000 buildings were destroyed and hundreds of thousands more were affected in some way (Kurczy, 2010).

# **Conceptual Framework:**

The framework underlying this research comes from Goffman's idea of a frame: "definitions of a situation are built up in accordance with principles of organization which govern events—at least social ones—and our subjective involvement in them (Goffman, 1997)." More specifically, this research will be analyzing frames and will borrow from Goffman's use of frame analysis, "a slogan to refer to the examination in these terms of the organization of experience (Goffman, 1997)." To elaborate on these concepts, framing is the accumulation of

principles and experiences that define an event and our involvement in it, and to analyze what makes up the frame is to examine the elements that come together and organize our perceptions. The media uses frames to define disasters, and this research is aimed at identifying which frames are presented within the news articles by identifying terms and phrases that make up that frame.

#### **Literature Review:**

#### Significance of Media Research in Disasters

Considering the extensive loss of life, property, and livelihoods experienced in both of the recent earthquakes, it was vitally important for the media to relay accurate information to the world so that the events could be understood, dealt with, and learned from. Analyzing how the media portrayed an event is incredibly significant because, according to Lippman, the media "constructs the pictures in our heads," and if the picture is inaccurate, underdeveloped, or framed in the wrong way then reality is misconstrued—which is often the case (Balm, 1993).

This distortion of reality is created by several factors that the media is influenced by.

First, media is a business that operates through attention and funding from their audience, so if their audience isn't interested in the stories that are published then the media source is forced to adapt (Balm, 1993). This puts considerable pressure on media agencies to find the most "dramatic" news at the fastest rate possible to get the initial story and coverage. If the real news isn't dramatic enough to be popular, then the media ends up skipping fact checks and basing their report on unreliable or imaginative information. This is often manifested in reports of myths, or misconceptions, about a disaster perpetuated by inaccurate evidence (Letukas, 2009; Fischer III, 1989; Dynes and Rodriguez, 2006; Barsky). Therefore, the media coverage ends up

being reminiscent of the source that provided the information and can no longer be considered reliable (Wenger and Quarantelli, 1989).

Second, the media has an enormous amount of newsworthy stories to choose from in a disaster situation. They are then forced to sift through these stories and filter which ones they believe will catch the attention of their audience—this is known as gate keeping (Wenger and Quarantelli, 1989). Since media stories only take a snapshot of a larger picture, many stories that should be reported in order to reflect the entire picture of reality are often left out in the sake of time and efficiency.

The need for timely, constant news coverage as well as gatekeeping contribute to the lack of accurate reporting that is sometimes present in the media coverage of disasters. Research on this topic is important because the media coverage often determines how the public, emergency managers, and policy makers respond to the disaster. In fact, studies have shown that every *New York Times* article on a foreign disaster is correlated to \$1.2 million in U.S. donations (Letukas, 2009). Moreover, unrealistic media coverage has tangible results, and research like this is essential to understanding what the media portrayed so that it can be compared with what actually happened in order to assess the accuracy of disaster coverage.

#### Role of the Media

There has been much study on the media's role in society. Their position is appointed through the Constitution and is designed to, "serve five functions: report the news; monitor power; uncover justice; tell stories that interest the public; and sustain communities by working as the nervous system of the community" (Littlefield and Quenette, 2007). All of these functions apply to disaster situations as well as everyday occurrences.

Furthermore, the public "seeks information to determine whether the crisis will affect them, how they should think, and what they should do" (Littlefield and Quenette, 2007). Without information about a disaster, people begin to draw their own conclusions based on what they believe to be true, which can result in underlying tensions within the community to overflow and produce disorder (Yamamoto, 1996). To prevent this, the media now acts as one of the main communicators of information in a disaster situation (Balm, 1993; Dynes and Rodriguez, 2006; Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006)—a significant role undoubtedly.

# **Media Framing**

As noted earlier, the media covers very large issues with a rather small lens, and what is reported through that lens forms a frame of the event. This is often referred to as a "window" that frames a view of the world (Balm, 1993), but leaves out much of the world surrounding the frame. One of the specific definitions of a frame is: selecting "aspects of a perceived reality to make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way to propagate a specific problem definition, casual interpretation, moral evaluation, and problem-solving recommendations for the item described (Ruigrok and Atteveldt, 2007)." The media fulfills its role by framing events because it helps in deciding what the agenda should be, and where attention should be focused.

One example that examines media framing is the work of Russel Dynes and Havidan Rodriguez in *Finding and Framing Katrina: The Social Construction of Disaster*. This article was written following the hurricane in 2005 that rocked Louisiana and surrounding states, and marked itself as one of the worst natural disasters in U.S. history. In the article several frames of the hurricane were identified in the media: finding damage, finding death, finding help, finding authority, and finding the bad guys. In other words, the media focused on reporting stories that focused specifically on damage, death, help, authority, and criminal activity; all things very

dramatic in content (ibid). The culmination of these frames presents a very chaotic picture where everything is going wrong, and people lacked basic humanity. In short, "New Orleans was presented as a disorganized city on the brink of collapse, less from the storm than from its residents (ibid)." Whether this was actually the case or not, the general public came to know Katrina as it was portrayed by the media. Media framing can be quite powerful and effective, and for the most part it works well for normal media coverage. However, inaccurate framing defines a disaster differently from the way it unfolded, and this is a widely studied area in disaster research known as "media myths".

#### Media Myths

Frames are often amplified, manipulated, or minimized depending on the discretion of the media outlet, which leads to what is known as media "myths" in disaster research. The media is designed to report routine occurrences quite well, but when a disaster strikes they are forced to relay massive amounts of information from a confusing environment at a rapid pace, which sets up an unstable foundation on which to report the news (Letukas, 2009).

As a result of the high demand and little time, the media often focuses on the most sensational stories that will catch the eyes of their readers. The stories that sell most often are ones of death, loss, and destruction even though that might not be the only thing happening during a disaster. These false perpetuations are known as myths, and numerous studies have been done to confirm the presence of myths in disaster scenarios (Dynes and Rodriguez, 2006; Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006; Letukas, 2009; Fischer III, 1989; Balm, 1993). More specifically, the media conveys, "inaccurate, biased, and exaggerated information, focusing on human loss and physical destruction" (Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006), because it sells to their audience.

Some of the most common myths portrayed by the media are looting, loss of life, price gouging, lack of authority, and general chaos. Hurricane Katrina is the perfect example of this, where papers and TV coverage were littered with reports of rampant looting, violence, and crime in the streets. The reality was that many of these reports were either highly exaggerated, or false all together (Dynes and Rodriguez, 2006; Rodriguez, Diaz, Santos, and Aguirre, 2006; Barsky, 2007).

It isn't just the perceptions of a disaster that media myths distort, but there are tangible results as well. Many people may now refuse to evacuate before a hurricane or storm warning because they're afraid their house will be looted, and end up dying or suffering from injuries because of that decision (Barsky, 2007). Myths interfere with how people react to disasters, and that is a significant reason behind the importance of this research. The framing of an event must first be identified to understand how the media, and therefore the people, understood what happened in a disaster. Next, when enough time has elapsed to accumulate the necessary reports from emergency agencies, the frames can be analyzed for accuracy and the presence of disaster myths.

## **Research Question:**

How did the New York Times frame the recent earthquakes in Chile and Haiti?

## **Methodology:**

The method used to conduct this research was inductive content analysis. Content analysis is, "a research technique for the objective, systematic, and quantitative description of the manifest content of communication" (Krippendorf, 1980). Content analysis focuses on identifying certain symbols and language techniques that communicate a specific meaning to an

audience. Grounded Theory was used to analyze the articles in search for codes, or symbolic content, that framed the issue in a certain manner. Grounded Theory is a qualitative research method that uses a question to guide the analysis of certain themes, and from there the researcher generates core theoretical concepts that are linked with the data (Qualitative). Moreover, this research simply looked for which codes and frames were presented instead of assuming certain codes or frames already existed and searching for those.

The *New York Times* was picked as the source of this research because it, "is a major national newspaper, it has higher exposure to the public than might a television broadcast at any given time. This newspaper is, moreover, considered the newspaper of record for the nation and a leader in journalism (Littlefield and Quenette, 2007)." Also, of all types of media, the print media seems to be the most reliable and accurate in its reporting (Fischer III, 1988).

Content analysis was performed on 62 *New York Times* articles, of which 37 were reporting the effects of the Haitian Earthquake, and 25 were focused on Chile. The articles on Haiti were taken from a pre-collected data set where electronic sources were searched daily for articles relevant to the Haitian Earthquake from the date of the event until coverage ceased to mention the earthquake for three consecutive days. Of all the articles from all media agencies identified in the data set, this research only used articles published in the *New York Times* between the date of the event, January 12, 2010, and one month following the disaster, February 12, 2010. The articles for Chile were gathered by searching "Chile" and "earthquake" using the Lexis Nexus search for *New York Times* articles between the date of the event, February 27, 2010 and March 27, 2010. The searches actually gathered 64 articles, but two of those articles had little to nothing to do with the earthquake and were therefore irrelevant to the research and were thrown out. With the exception of those two irrelevant stories, one month of coverage after both

disasters provided 62 articles to help understand how the *New York Times* framed both disasters, but not too many articles to analyze within the time constraint—two weeks—that was provided to conduct the research and report findings.

In order to identify all of the frames presented in the disaster coverage, the articles were analyzed in search of emergent themes that were important and central to the article's coverage. The articles that covered Haiti were coded for first, and then the frames that emerged in Haiti were used to code the Chilean articles in order to maximize the comparison between the two sets of coverage. Ten frames emerged from the analysis of the Haiti articles, and those ten frames were then coded for in the Chilean articles in addition to any new emergent themes not seen in Haiti. It was vital not to predetermine a set of frames to code for based upon prior earthquake research, because these events were independent of previous earthquakes. Conducting the research this way avoided any preconceived frames from influencing the emergent themes, and it allowed for an original analysis of how Haiti was framed in comparison to Chile. Moreover, themes such as looting, death, and tsunami damage were marked as such. For example, a statement like, "Benjamin Leal, 38, a psychology professor, survived the tsunami that barreled through the port city of Talcahuano, leaving close to half of its 250,000 residents homeless" was labeled tsunami damage. Furthermore, a statement like, "[Two days after the earthquake] 7,000 people had already been buried in a mass grave. Hundreds of corpses piled up outside the city's morgue... people pulled their shirts up over their faces to filter out the thickening smell of the dead" was labeled as mass death, because it focused on extensive death. This was the process for the initial read-through of the articles, and many different themes emerged from that process.

The second analysis was to sort through the themes and search for broader frames within the multitude of smaller themes the articles presented. One example of this was the frame of *crime* within the Chile articles where reports of looting, arson, fights, vandalism, and mobs were combined into a larger category that represented the issue in its entirety. For the Haiti articles, ten of these larger frames were identified: Death and injury, American response, aid issues, crime, physical destruction, rescue efforts, history of vulnerability, absence of the Haitian Government, recovery, and disorganization.

For the Chile articles the large frames were: response, crime, destruction/preparedness, tsunami, death, military, comparisons to other events, Chilean politics, economy, and aftershocks. Why do some frames include more than one category like destruction/preparedness and comparison/reference? Well, it has to do with their relationship to each other within the articles. Destruction and preparedness are linked together in the same frame because the level of preparedness was directly linked to the level of destruction in the articles. Included within those larger frames is a list of what specific issues make-up the larger category. For a better understanding of this, see *Appendix A*. Also, to see textual examples of what was identified under each frame, please see *Appendix B*.

Once all of the frames had been identified and recorded, the number of articles the frames appeared in was normalized in order to compare the frequency of specific frames between the two events. For example, the "death and injury" category in Haiti was identified in 20 different articles, which means that 54% of the 37 articles on Haiti contained some mention of death and/or injury. Many articles included not just one, but numerous frames, so the percentage is indicative of how often a frame was presented. For a complete list of these percentages and list of frames, please see *Appendix A*.

#### **Results:**

#### Haiti

After the analysis was completed, ten core frames were identified in the coverage of Haiti that are showed here in order from the most to least frequently occurring: death and injury, the American response, aid issues, crime, physical destruction, rescue efforts, a history of vulnerability, an absence of the Haitian Government, recovery, and disorganization. For a complete breakdown of how often each frame appeared throughout the articles see *Appendix A*. The picture that was painted through the use of these frames was filled with descriptions of mass death, despair, and hopelessness. As if the effects of the earthquake weren't enough, the extreme poverty that existed there before the event exacerbated the response and recovery efforts. The infrastructure before the earthquake wasn't capable of transporting the amount of aid that was pouring in from the United States and abroad, and the earthquake further limited the means of transport into and around the country. One of the main infrastructural issues was that the airport wasn't a sufficient size to support the influx of traffic, which included the American military, humanitarian groups, and aid from around the world.

These infrastructural issues combined with a notoriously inefficient government—now crippled by the earthquake—to create an organizational chaos. As death tolls continued to rise throughout the following month, the aid began to pile up as well from around the world; however, there was no organizational structure in place to distribute the aid. There were no trucks, no roads, no communications, and little information on the conditions throughout the country that were necessary to distributing aid. The articles captured this issue through pleas of

anger and helplessness from the Haitians, but the articles also portrayed America as the main responder to their calls for help.

#### Chile

There were not as many articles written about Chile as there were about Haiti in the month following each event, which is probably correlated with the differing severity of issues in each event. Nevertheless, the results showed that the *New York Times* portrayed the Chilean earthquake with these ten frames in order of most to least occurring throughout the following month of coverage: response, crime, destruction/preparedness, tsunami, death, military presence, comparisons to other events, Chilean politics, affects on their economy, and aftershocks. Again, a complete breakdown of the frequency and composition of each frame is shown in *Appendix A*.

The issues that Chile dealt with the most as covered by the *New York Times* were influenced by the Chileans' demand for a different response from the government. After reporting the extent of the damage and estimating the number of dead and injured, the articles began to focus on the response and recovery effort as led by the Chilean President, Ms. Bachelet. The calamity of the high-magnitude earthquake cut communications, destroyed bridges and roads, collapsed many buildings and kills hundreds of people. In addition, the earthquake spawned a tsunami that tore through the coastal cities and towns killing many and forcing the others to run for the hills. After the aftershocks postponed, looters and organized bands of people took advantage of the dire circumstances by stealing, vandalizing, and intimidating; the situation got so bad that many people feared for their lives in the aftermath of the earthquake. The President and Chilean government were heavily criticized for not responding fast enough by postponing the deployment of the Chilean military to control the situation. In addition, there was

considerable mention of how Chile's economy and government structure would look in the days to come.

#### **Comparison of Haiti and Chile**

Haiti and Chile were vastly different countries before the earthquakes, and as a result the problems and issues the countries faced after a similar situation differed greatly as well. For many decades, Haiti was notorious for its extreme poverty, government corruption, and vulnerability to disaster. The building codes were non-existent, and the building materials were elementary at best, which resulted in the collapse of around 50% of the civilian buildings and 30% of the government buildings when the earthquake struck. When the buildings collapsed, many of the people inside were trapped and died. Due to the high percentage of structural failure, this was the leading cause of around two hundred thousand casualties. On the other hand, Chile is arguably the economic stronghold of South America and has a history riddled with intense earthquakes. These two factors influenced and allowed Chile to adopt stringent building codes to minimize damages in the case of a severe earthquake. These building codes were the main reason why people didn't die in Chile like in Haiti, but there were also other reasons for that as well.

Another reason why the death tolls differed so greatly between the two countries had to do with the earthquakes themselves. The Haitian quake was a 7.0 magnitude that produced violent lateral shaking which is very difficult for a building to stand up against, and the shaking was also highly concentrated in and around the most populated area of the country. In Chile, the circumstances were much different—the earthquake was a more severe magnitude of 8.8, but the shaking was more of an up and down motion as opposed to side to side. Also, the tremors weren't as concentrated as in Haiti; the effects were felt more evenly throughout the Chilean

coastline. The natural characteristics of the quake in Haiti were more harmful than the conditions in Chile, so even though the Chilean quake was a much greater magnitude, there were other factors that prevented the death toll from rising near Haiti's.

Another significant difference between the two earthquakes was the presence of crime and looting. In Chile there were many articles framed to illustrate the massive amount of criminal activity following the earthquake. This is expected considering the media often amplifies the reports of crime following disasters, but what was odd is that there were so many reports in comparison to Haiti. The circumstances in Haiti were so much worse following the disaster it would be expected that every store on the island be raided for what little was there, but the articles mentioned on several occasions that the Haitians, although angry and hopeless, remained somewhat civil. This might have something to do with the conditions that existed before the earthquakes in these countries. Chile is incredibly developed in comparison to Haiti, and so the standard of living was much higher before the disaster, whereas Haitians were used to having little to nothing regardless of the earthquake. Furthermore, the Chileans' more developed sense of consumerism could have influenced them to take material goods from the opportunity, and the Haitians remained calmer because they have adapted to the idea of having next to nothing.

Even more noticeable than the difference in reported crime was the variation in response from the countries' respective governments. In Haiti about 30% of the government buildings in Port au Prince collapsed, and as a result many politicians and bureaucrats passed away, bringing the already crippled government to its knees. As a result, the government couldn't respond in any way to the needs of its people and had to rely on the assistance of non-governmental organizations, foreign aid, and foreign military. The President of Haiti didn't make an

appearance in front of his people for weeks after the earthquake—partly because he was dealing with personal losses, and partly because he was so consumed by meetings with his government and foreign officials. Considering there was no central authority to organize the response and recovery, there was significant confusion over who was in charge. The American Military took control of the Haitian airport that was vital to the response, but their priorities were securing the country before feeding the people. Because the airport was so small, planes full of aid and equipment were forced to fly around in circles or land at another airport before they were allowed to land in Haiti. If there had been Haitian Government to help organize the response efforts, things would have gone much smoother.

The government in Chile was much more helpful and organized after the earthquake. The President gave an address to her people the following day, and although people were upset that she took a couple days to deploy the military to maintain peace and order, the response was quick and thorough. America offered help to Chile and they respectfully declined, because the government was fully capable of handling things on their own. This increased the amount of organization in the response, and the people were happier to see Chileans helping them than foreign aid workers.

Finally, there were many more articles written about Haiti than Chile. This suggests that the earthquake in Chile wasn't as intriguing as the one in Haiti—rightfully so I would argue—but this fact probably had a large influence upon how each earthquake was framed. In order to keep people buying and reading the newspaper it is important to keep things dramatic, and since the Chilean earthquake didn't effect such a vulnerable place and kill as many people the *New York Times* was pressured to overdramatize certain aspects. This could be the underlying reason behind some of the previously mentioned differences in coverage. Moreover, crime and looting

could have been framed more prominently in Chile because it is more interesting to read about than civility—especially when coverage on Haiti was still significant and in competition for attention.

Another difference in coverage that could have been influenced by the pressure to attract readers was the focus on the upcoming Chilean Presidential Election. Many of the articles focused on how people felt the current President was doing in response to the disaster, and often times the mood coming from the people was reported as disgruntled, frustrated, and upset. Was this really how the people perceived their President, or was this an effort by the newspaper to overdramatize the people's reaction? It would require an intense amount of research to determine whether or not what was reported was actually the case, but there is a significant body of literature that would support the idea that the coverage was not completely unbiased.

#### **Conclusions**

Much can be learned from these disasters in terms of enhancing disaster mitigation, response, and recovery. In order to increase the resilience of a nation after a disaster, it is vital to have a healthy infrastructure that can support an influx of materials and people. A quality infrastructure helps mitigate the damage that occurs from a disaster increases the pace of the response efforts allowing more people to be rescued, and it lowers the cost of the recovery process because the infrastructure is in place.

Second, there needs to be some central authority in the organization of response and recovery efforts. In the case of Haiti, there were too many organizations with too little authority to prioritize what was most important and how to get things done. In more developed countries like the United States this is less of a problem, but the developing countries need to have an

emergency management plan of sorts that declares who is in charge and what to do if leadership is affected in the disaster.

Last but probably most important, the vulnerability of an area needs to be considered in the construction of buildings even in developing countries. If a nation lies directly on a fault line like Haiti and Chile, then the building codes need to be more stringent than countries that don't fall on a fault line. If is the main contributor to the higher death toll in Haiti than in Chile, and the rubble created by collapsed buildings hinders the response process heavily.

# **Considerations for Further Research:**

One idea for further research would be to extend the time period so that there were more articles to analyze, and then see if and how the frames change over time. This research was originally supposed to explore how the frames changed as time elapsed, but due to time constraints this couldn't be accomplished. In addition, expanding the number of articles in the data set would allow for more accuracy and a longer time frame in which to allow for the frames to change. Another possible research idea would be to analyze more than one different media outlet focused on the same event and see how two different sources frame the same event over time.

#### **Limitations:**

Content analysis is always subject to limitations, because one phrase can be interpreted several different ways depending on the interpreter. A newspaper article presents massive amounts of information at one time, so it is also possible that certain frames were missed or

overlooked. Also, as many articles were analyzed as possible within the time frame available, but in order to draw solid conclusions about how the media portrayed an event there needs to be a much larger data set to draw conclusions from, so more research needs to be done in this area. If this research were to be conducted again, then all of these limitations would be taken into consideration to improve the accuracy and reliability of the results.

#### References

- Balm, Roger. *Harm's Narrative: Media Framing of Contemporary Risk*. Rep. New Brunswick, 1993. Print.
- Barsky, Lauren E. Disaster Realities Following Katrina: Revisiting the Looting Myth. Rep. 2007.

  Print.
- Basu, Moni. "Four Months after 'the Catastrophe,' Haitians Still in Emergency Mode CNN.com." *CNN.com Breaking News, U.S., World, Weather, Entertainment & Video News*. Web. 01 July 2010. <a href="http://www.cnn.com/2010/WORLD/americas/05/11/haiti.then.now/index.html">http://www.cnn.com/2010/WORLD/americas/05/11/haiti.then.now/index.html</a>.
- Fischer III, Henry W. Behavioral and Organizational Response to Disaster. Rep. Alliance, 1988.

  Print.
- Fischer III, Henry W. Hurricane Gilbert: The Media's Creation of the Storm of the Century

  During September 1988. Rep. Boulder, 1989. Print.
- Galvan, Jose L. Writing Literature Reviews: a Guide for Students of the Social and Behavioral Sciences. Fourth ed. Glendale, CA: Pyrczak, 2009. Print.
- Goffman, Erving. "Frame Analysis." *The Goffman Reader*. Ed. Charles C. Lemert and Ann Branaman. Oxford, Angleterre: Blackwell, 1997. 147-67. Print.
- Krippendorff, Klaus. *Content Analysis: An Introd. to Its Methodology*. London: SAGE Publ., 1980. Print.
- Kurczy, Stephen, Leigh Montgomery, and Elizabeth Ryan. "Chile Earthquake Facts: Chile vs.
   Haiti, in Numbers CSMonitor.com." *The Christian Science Monitor CSMonitor.com*.
   Web. 01 July 2010. <a href="http://www.csmonitor.com/World/Global-News/2010/0302/Chile-earthquake-facts-Chile-vs.-Haiti-in-numbers">http://www.csmonitor.com/World/Global-News/2010/0302/Chile-earthquake-facts-Chile-vs.-Haiti-in-numbers</a>.

- Letukas, Lynn Ann. Is Aid a Social Problem? Cross-national Media Constructions of Relief

  Efforts following the Indian Ocean Tsunami. Diss. University of Delaware, 2009. Print.
- Littlefield, Robert S., and Andrea M. Quenette. "Crisis Leadership and Hurricane Katrina: The Portrayal of Authority by the Media in Natural Disasters." *Journal of Applied Communication Research* 35 (2007): 26-47. Routledge. Web. 14 June 2010.
- Oda, Sadao. "The Role of Broadcasting Media in Providing Disaster-related News Information." *The Great Hanshin Earthquake and Broadcasting*. Tokyo: Center, 1996. 33-59. Print.
- "Qualitative Approaches." *Social Research Methods*. Web. 05 July 2010. <a href="http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/qualapp.php">http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/qualapp.php</a>.
- Rodriguez, Havidan, and Russel Dynes. "Finding and Framing Katrina: The Social Construction of Disaster." Print. Rpt. in *Understanding Katrina: Perspectives from the Social Sciences*. 2006. Print.
- Rodriguez, Havidan, Walter Diaz, Jenniffer M. Santos, and Benigno E. Aguirre.

  "Communicating Risk and Uncertainty: Science, Technology, and Disasters at the

  Crossroads." *Handbook of Disaster Research*. New York: Springer, 2006. 476-88. Print.
- Ruigrok, Nel, and Wouter Van Atteveldt. "Global Angling with a Local Angle: How U.S.,

  British, and Dutch NEwspapers Frame Global and Local Terrorist Attacks." *The Harvard International Journal of Press/Politics* 68th ser. 12.1 (2007): 68-88. Sage. Web. 14 June 2010. <a href="https://www.sagepublications.com">www.sagepublications.com</a>.
- Vasterman, Peter, Joris C. Yzermans, and Anja J.E. Dirkzwager. *The Role of the Media and Media Hypes in the Aftermath of Disasters*. Publication. Vol. 27. 2005. *The Role of the Media and Media Hypes in the Aftermath of Disasters*. Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, 2005. Web. 14 June 2010. <a href="http://epirev.oxfordjournals.org">http://epirev.oxfordjournals.org</a>.

- Wenger, Dennis, and Enrico L. Quarantelli. *Mass Media Systems and Community Hazards and Disasters*. Rep. no. 36. Print.
- Yamamoto, Yasumasa. "News Gathering and Broadcasting in Disaster Emergencies." *The Great Hanshin Earthquake and Broadcasting*. Tokyo: Center, 1996. 59-77. Print.

# Appendix A

#### **HAITI**

## **Death and Injury—54%**

- -Dead in the streets left in piles, stench
- -Mass graves
  - -Improper burial
- -Amputations
- -Injuries turn into death and disease because of no treatment
- -Scare of disease spreading

# American Response—46%

- -Haitian-American aid
- -American military
- -Political statements
  - -Obama
  - -Hillary
  - -Temporary Protected Status
- -American donations

#### Aid Problems—43%

- -Shortage or absence of supplies and workers
- -No gas
- -United Nations, US aid
- -Bottlenecks
  - -Plenty of aid and donations, but no vehicles, roads, distribution, organization
- -Housing
  - -Tents or structures?
- -Ration cards

# **Crime—27%**

- -Looting
- -Gangs
- -Tension and unrest from slow response
- -UN troops
- -Calm considering devastation

# Physical Destruction—24%

- -Poor, faulty, or absence of building codes
- -Centered in Port-au-Prince
- -Aftershocks

## Rescue Efforts—24%

- -Search and Rescue teams
  - -Listening for calls from the rubble
  - -Rescuing survivors
- -International rescue effort
- -132 rescued

# History of Vulnerability—22%

-Poverty, violence, unrest, political instability, natural disasters

# No Haitian Government—19%

- -Nobody to respond or organize
- -No government buildings left to operate from
- -No Presidential action
- -Haitians began organizing themselves

# Recovery—19%

- -Taxies, hotels, sidewalk markets
- -Make it more sustainable this time
- -Religion
- -Banks
- -Cell phone Service

# Disorganization—11%

- -Airport
  - -Controlled by US airforce
    - -Priorities: "1. Search and rescue 2. Military 3. Humanitarian aid
- -Haitian Government, US military, UN, NGO's

## **CHILE**

# Response—40%

- -Ms. Bachelet (President) statements
- -Displacement
- -Slow to deploy troops
- -Aid only going to big cities
- -Americans offer aid
- -Government criticism
- -Received aid

#### **Crime—40%**

- -Looting
- -Arson
- -Fights
- -Vandalism
- -Mobs

## **Destruction/Preparedness—40%**

- -Quality building codes
- -Buckled highways
- -Collapsed buildings
- -Infrastructure (food, water, roads, communication)
- -Water damage
- -Concepcion main city hit

## Tsunami—32%

- -Flooded some cities
  - -Boats on streets
- -False warning
- -Good preparedness/warning system
- -Constitucion hit hard

## **Death—32%**

- -Around 800 dead
- -Estimates varied greatly throughout
- -Search and Rescue for dead and injured

# Military—32%

- -Maintain order
- -Curfew
- -Reference to past dictatorship

# Comparison to Other Events—24%

- -1960 Quake, largest ever recorded and same fault line
- -2004 Tsunami
- -Haiti
- -Better building codes = better results

# **Chilean Politics—20%**

- -Presidential transition
- -Reference to recent dictatorship
- -Political tension and history

# Economy—16%

-Wine, copper, fishing, paper

# Aftershocks—16%

- -Around 300
- -6.3, and 6.9 magnitudes

#### Appendix B

#### Haiti

# **Death and Injury**

"[Two days after the earthquake] 7,000 people had already been buried in a mass grave. Hundreds of corpses piled up outside the city's morgue... people pulled their shirts up over their faces to filter out the thickening smell of the dead."

## **American Response**

"The United States had moved \$48 million in food supplies from Texas since the quake and distributed 600,000 packaged meals."

"Former Presidents George W. Bush and Bill Clinton began a new venture on Saturday to raise money for the Haitian relief effort from corporations, foundations and ordinary Americans, as President Obama pledged to ramp up the American response to the devastating earthquake."

#### **Aid Issues**

"If aid doesn't start pouring in at a significant level, there will be serious consequences on the streets... People are in the shocked and frightened phase. But the next phase will be survival."

"While countries and relief agencies showered aid on Haiti, only a small part of it was reaching increasingly desperate Haitians without food, water, or shelter. "We see all the commotion, but we still have nothing to drink... the trucks are going by."

#### Crime

"But there were reports of more looting and shootings, including four men who witnesses said were shot by the police on suspicion of looting."

## **Physical Destruction**

"substandard design, inadequate materials and shoddy construction practices likely contributed to the collapse of many buildings"

#### **Rescue Teams**

"Overnight, rescuers pulled eight survivors from the rubble"

#### **Historical Vulnerability**

"bringing even more suffering to a nation that was already the hemisphere's poorest and disaster prone."

#### No Haitian Government

"it would be some time before Haiti had a functioning central government; some government buildings are gone, and some officials are dead."

#### Recovery

"Sidewalk markets popped up, offering food to the hungry, while hotels that survived the earthquake were still booking rooms and taxi drivers were threading through the debris-covered streets."

## Unorganized

"But with Haitian officials relying so heavily on the United States, the United Nations, and many different aid groups, coordination was posing a critical challenge."

#### Chile

## Response

"The poll, by the daily newspaper El Mercurio, found that 72% of residents of the greater Santiago area believe the government's efforts to restore order came too late and were inefficient, and 48% said they thought Ms. Bachelet had delayed taking action because she did not want to end her term by sending the military into the streets."

#### Crime

"On Monday night, as a mob made its way through downtown Concepcion, setting fire to supermarkets and robbing homes, Mr. Ramirez was at home with his two sons when the mob passed through their neighborhood... "If I would have had to kill somebody, I would have."

"If crushed bodies were the enduring images of Haiti's earthquake, the most memorable ones of Chile's have been of looting."

"Early reports of people raiding markets for food and diapers were quickly followed by pictures of people carrying TV's and dishwashers off into a city with no electricity. Intact stores were broken into. A department store in Concepcion was set ablaze. In a few places, roving bands robbed anyone they could. Residents who formed self-defense posses were quoted saying that the "human earthquake" was worse than the geological one."

## **Destruction/Preparedness**

"Residents of a collapsed 15-story apartment building in Concepcion, opened just months ago, were outraged that it had been so badly damaged and were convinced that contractors had not complied with building codes that require buildings to be able to withstand temblors."

"At the United Nations, Catherine Bragg, the deputy head of humanitarian relief, said that Chile was probably the best-prepared country in Latin America for such a disaster and as such required relatively little aid from the world body. Still, she said, "No matter how prepared you are, there are going to be repercussions from something as big as this."

#### **Tsunami**

"The threat of lethal tsunami waves from the earthquake in Chile forced more than 1.5 million people to higher ground in countries on the other side of the Pacific Ocean on Sunday, but in the end small waves left only minor damage."

"Benjamin Leal, 38, a psychology professor, survived the tsunami that barreled through the port city of Talcahuano, leaving close to half of its 250,000 residents homeless."

#### Death

"Chilean emergency management officials announced Thursday that they had significantly overestimated the death toll from last weekend's earthquake, lowering the figure from about 805 people to about 279."

# Military

"the presence of some 6,000 troops here on the streets of Chile's second largest city was a godsend... "If they had not come, there could have been a civil war here."

# Comparison

"The magnitude 8.8 earthquake that struck off the coast of Chile early Saturday morning occurred along the same fault responsible for the biggest quake ever measured, a 1960 tremor that killed nearly 2,000 people in Chile and hundreds more across the Pacific."

#### **Chilean Politics**

"In the 20 years since this country made the transition from dictatorship to democracy, politics here have largely played out along the center rather than the extremes."

#### **Economy**

"A fisherman and father of two, Hector Jose Rivera, sobbed in the president's arms, "All I ask is for help so that I can return to work... I am nothing if I cannot go back to the sea."

#### Aftershocks

"The strong aftershocks, up to a magnitude of 6.9, almost overshadowed the inauguration of Chile's first right-wing leader in 20 years."